



City of Calistoga
Planning Commission
Agenda Item Summary

DATE	November 9, 2016
ITEM	Duplexes at 1320 Fair Way
STAFF CONTACT	Erik V. Lundquist, Senior Planner
POTENTIAL CONFLICTS	None
RECOMMENDATIONS	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Approve design review application DR 2016-212. Approve a density bonus and affordable housing concessions/incentives for the project
SUGGESTED MOTIONS	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. "I move that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution approving design review application DR 2016-21"2. "I move that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution approving a density bonus and affordable housing concessions/incentives for the apartment project at 1320 Fair Way"

CALISTOGA PLANNING COMMISSION

STAFF REPORT

TO: CALISTOGA PLANNING COMMISSION
FROM: ERIK V. LUNDQUIST
MEETING DATE: NOVEMBER 9, 2016
SUBJECT: DUPLEXES AT 1320 FAIR WAY (DR 2016-21)

ITEM

1 Consideration of 1) a design review application for two two-story duplexes and site
2 improvements at 1320 Fair Way, and 2) a request for a density bonus and affordable
3 housing concession/incentive.

BACKGROUND

4
5 The project site includes the property at 1320 Fair Way and the property at 1516 Park
6 Street. As a result of the project, the two properties would be merged creating a parcel
7 approximately 0.608 acres in size. Uses in the vicinity include a mobile home park to
8 the east, single-family residential to the north, a professional office to the west, and a
9 bed and breakfast and storage building across Fair Way to the south.

10 There are 12 existing dwelling units on the property at 1320 Fair Way and the property
11 at 1516 Park Street is currently vacant. The 12 units were recently rehabilitated and
12 reoccupied in October 2015 and are comprised of a two-bedroom unit, four one-
13 bedroom units and seven studio units. Informal parking for the units is currently
14 conducted in a dirt area behind the units, which is accessed via Park Street.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

15
16 The project proposes the construction of two two-story duplexes and the conversion of
17 two small existing units into one unit for a total of 15 units. To obtain a density bonus,
18 two of the existing units would be affordable to, and restricted to occupancy by low-
19 income households.

20 Each duplex unit consists of two bedrooms, two bathrooms and a covered outdoor living
21 space. The lower floor units are 912 square feet each; the upper floor units are 976
22 square feet each. The exterior of the duplexes are styled to integrate with the
23 surrounding units on-site and in the general vicinity. A combination of board and batten
24 siding and smooth 4" lap siding bring the farmhouse style to life. Decorative outriggers,
25 shed roofs, porch bracing, corrugated metal roofing and composition roofing complete
26 the elevation style. Materials and paint colors are designed to blend with the existing
27 development on this site.

28 The project would also construct a 14-space parking area on the northern portion of the
29 site. The site would be accessed via a single two-way driveway from Park Street.
30 Drainage would be collected in detention basins and a bio-swale for filtration prior to

31 conveyance off-site. Trees located within the proposed parking area will be removed.
32 The loss of these trees would be mitigated through the planting of new trees.

33 As allowed by state law, the applicant requests the approval of two incentives in order to
34 maintain project rents at levels that are affordable to lower-income households. Two of
35 the existing units or 13% of the units would be restricted to occupancy by households
36 with a maximum of 80% of area median income (AMI)¹ for a period of 30 years.

37 **CONSISTENCY ANALYSIS**

38 The project's consistency with the City's plans, policies and codes is evaluated below.

39 Calistoga General Plan

- 40 • Land use designation

41 The General Plan's Land Use Map designates the project site as High Density
42 Residential/Office, which allows the development of multi-family housing at densities of
43 10-20 dwelling units per acre. The property owners request the approval of a 25 percent
44 density bonus to allow a project density of 25 units per acre. The California Government
45 Code² and Calistoga Municipal Code³ stipulate that the City may grant a density bonus
46 of least 35 percent for the project, and in some cases more than 35 percent. The
47 proposed density bonus of 25 percent, with the inclusion of two restricted units, would
48 be permissible.

- 49 • Housing Element

50 The Housing Element of the General Plan provides a long-term, comprehensive plan to
51 address existing and projected housing needs for all economic segments of the
52 community. It includes strategies for meeting the City's share of region-wide housing
53 need for the planning period between 2015 and 2023, as required by state law.

54 As discussed in the Housing Element, low-income families have difficulty finding
55 affording housing, especially in a market with high housing costs, as in Calistoga. Due
56 to the extremely low vacancy rate and limited housing stock, there is a known shortage
57 of appropriately-sized apartments. Because there are almost no opportunities for those
58 that work in Calistoga, they have to look outside the city for housing.

59 Although the new duplexes would not be income-restricted, the two existing units that
60 would be restricted would pay a maximum monthly rent between \$1,224 and \$1,399,
61 depending on the number of persons in the household.

62 The Housing Element contains a number of goals policies intended to address the
63 housing needs. For instance, Goal H-2 states, "*promote housing that meets the needs*
64 *of extremely low-, low-, and moderate-income households, particularly those who work*
65 *in Calistoga.*" Moreover, Policy P2.1-1 states that the City shall "*provide incentives for*
66 *the development of affordable housing.*"

¹ The 2016 AMI for Napa County is \$86,100 for a 4-person household

² Sections 65915-65918

³ CMC 17.08.030

67 The City's housing policy preferences will insure that local residents are given priority in
 68 occupying the project's units, to the extent allowed by law. Therefore, the approval of
 69 the requested density bonus and incentives (discussed below) would allow the
 70 development of housing that meets the critical needs of community members.

71 Zoning Code

72 The project site is located within the Multi-Family Residential/Office (R-3) Zoning
 73 District. The intent of this district, in part, is to increase the diversity and affordability of
 74 housing stock in Calistoga by providing housing close to downtown services. Uses
 75 allowed in the R-3 District without a use permit include multifamily dwellings. The project
 76 is consistent with this intent by providing affordable apartments in close proximity to the
 77 downtown.

78 The R-3 District is further intended to ensure that care is taken to preserve the character
 79 of existing neighborhoods. The area in the vicinity of the project site is comprised of a
 80 wide variety of land uses, including commercial services, a mobile home park, a
 81 professional office, single- and multi-family residences and warehousing. Buildings in
 82 the vicinity are one- and two-story, primarily clad in wood or stucco.

83 The structures are clad in board and batten siding and smooth 4" lap siding. Decorative
 84 outriggers, shed roofs, porch bracing, corrugated metal roofing and composition roofing
 85 complete the elevation style. One of the duplexes fronts Fair Way and the second
 86 duplex is located toward the center of the property.

87 The following table compares the project's design with the development standards of
 88 the R-3 District.

Development Standard per Zoning Code (R-3 District)		Project	Compliant
Minimum front yard	15 feet	7.5 feet	No
Minimum interior side yard, no building	5 feet	> 5 feet	Yes
Minimum interior side yard adjacent to building	One-half the building height, up to 15 feet	13 feet	Yes
Minimum rear yard adjacent to two-story building	15 feet	> 15 feet	Yes
Maximum lot coverage	40%	40%	Yes
Maximum building height	25 feet	< 25 feet	Yes
Minimum usable open space	1,200 sq. ft. per unit	>1,200 sq. ft. ⁴	Yes
Minimum setback for parking	5 feet – side yard 10 feet – rear yard	5 feet 5 feet	Yes No

⁴ 1 sq. ft. of private space = 2 sq. ft. of group space

89 The applicant has requested the above deviations from the Zoning Code's standards as
90 the incentives/concessions allowed by state law for qualifying affordable housing
91 projects. Staff does not believe that either of the requested deviations would result in
92 negative impacts to surrounding properties and the general neighborhood. Although the
93 front setback for the building fronting Fair Way and the rear setback for parking would
94 be reduced below the minimum otherwise required, potential visual impacts would be
95 mitigated by substantial landscaping. Furthermore, the front setback would be similar to
96 those of nearby buildings along Fair Way and the only encroachment is a covered
97 entry/balcony.

98 State law limits the amount of parking that the City may require for affordable housing
99 projects to two spaces per two-bedroom unit⁵. The 14 proposed on-site parking spaces
100 meet this requirement and the City's Zoning Code requirements, plus alleviate some of
101 the impact from the lack of parking for the existing units⁶.

102 The City may deny a requested incentive or concession only if it makes one of the
103 following findings⁷. Staff does not believe that the basis exists for making any of them,
104 as noted.

- 105 • The concession or incentive is not required in order to provide for affordable
106 rents for the targeted units.

107 *The requested deviations from the Code's development standards are necessary*
108 *in order to construct four additional units on the project site and provide*
109 *affordable rents to the targeted units.*

- 110 • The concession or incentive would have a specific adverse impact upon public
111 health and safety or the physical environment or on any real property that is
112 listed in the California Register of Historical Resources and for which there is no
113 feasible method to satisfactorily mitigate or avoid the specific adverse impact
114 without rendering the development unaffordable to low- and moderate-income
115 households.

116 *Environmental impacts associated with the project are not anticipated. This in-fill*
117 *project is not a historically significant property and the deviations from the Zoning*
118 *Code would not result in adverse impacts to the property or properties in the*
119 *vicinity.*

- 120 • The concession or incentive would be contrary to state or federal law.
121 *None of the deviations from the Code's development standards would be*
122 *contrary to state or federal law.*

⁵ Cal. Govt. Code §65915(p)(1)

⁶ No additional parking is required for the existing legal non-conforming units. However, a condition of approval requires that the no parking designation on the east side of Park Street be demarked with a red curb plus the existing no parking signage.

⁷ Cal. Govt. Code §65915(d)(1)

123 Residential Design Guidelines

124 Staff believes that the project is consistent with the City's Multi-Family Residential
125 Design Guidelines because of the following project design features:

- 126 • Views of the hillsides will be preserved.
- 127 • Parking and vehicular circulation will be separated from pedestrian circulation.
- 128 • The perceived height and bulk of the building will be reduced by architectural
129 projections including awnings and rafter tails.
- 130 • Varied textures, openings, recesses and design accents will provide visual
131 interest.
- 132 • Roof overhangs will be appropriately-sized to the mass and design of the
133 building.
- 134 • Window types, materials, shapes and proportions will complement the
135 architectural style of the building, and windows will be articulated with moldings
136 and awnings.
- 137 • Materials, finishes and colors will be consistent with the desired architectural
138 style and sensitive to the neighborhood. Compatible accent colors will enhance
139 important architectural elements and details.
- 140 • The parking area will be located within the project's interior and not along its
141 street frontage.
- 142 • Plantings will be used to soften building lines.
- 143 • Attractive open-work fencing will allow public views into the site while providing
144 security.

145 **GROWTH MANAGEMENT**

146 The project would connect to public water and sewer. Based on the Standardized Use
147 Table for the Resource Management System, the total estimated annual demand for
148 this project is 1.53 acre feet of water and 0.852 acre feet of wastewater. A Growth
149 Management Allocation must be awarded for the project, and the developer will be
150 required to pay water and wastewater service connection fees.

151 **FINDINGS**

152 To reduce repetition, the bases for making the required findings to approve the project's
153 design review application, and recommend approval of the project's affordable housing
154 incentives to the City Council are contained in the attached draft resolutions.

155 **RECOMMENDATIONS**

156 Based on the information and analysis contained in this report, staff recommends that
157 the Planning Commission:

- 158 1. Adopt a resolution approving design review application DR 2016-21
- 159 2. Adopt a resolution approving a density bonus and affordable housing
160 concessions/incentives

ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity map
2. Draft resolution approving design review application DR 2016-21
3. Draft resolution approving density bonus and affordable housing concessions
4. Project description and request for density bonus and concessions received September 13, 2016
5. Site photographs
6. Project plans