

# Friends of the Napa River

68 -B Coombs Street, Napa, CA 94559  
Phone 707-254-8520  
www.friendsofthenapariver.org  
info@friendsofthenapariver.org

CITY OF CALISTOGA  
City Clerk

August 22, 2011

AUG 23 2011

RECEIVED

**Board of  
Directors**

Bernhard Krevet  
(President)  
Francie Winnen  
(Vice-President)  
Tim Yarish  
(Vice-President)  
Myrna Abramowicz  
(Secretary)  
Chuck Shinnamon  
(Treasurer)

Karen Bower Turjanis  
Barry Christian  
Shari Gardner  
David Graves  
Jim Hench  
Tony Norris  
Arvis Northrop  
Laurie Puzo  
Kent Ruppert

**Honorary  
Advisory Board:**

Leslie Barnes  
Maira Johnston Block  
Suzanne Easton  
Mel Engle  
David Garden  
Roger Hartwell  
Ralph Ingols  
Harold Kelly  
Rudolf Ohlemutz  
Mike Rippey  
Judith Sears  
Ginny Simms  
Barbara Stafford

City Council, City of Calistoga  
% Susan Sneddon, City Clerk  
1232 Washington Street  
Calistoga, CA 94515 (SSneddon@ci.calistoga.ca.us)

**RE: Kimball Reservoir Bypass Plan**

Dear City Council:

Friends of the Napa River welcome the opportunity to comment on the **Kimball Reservoir Bypass Plan**. Our comments are based on the Draft of May 27, 2011, as we did not have a chance to review the Final version of August 19, 2011. Our board member Roger Hartwell, a Fisheries and Wildlife Biologist, provided the analysis.

We understand that in response to California Fish & Game (CDFG), the city of Calistoga is developing a Kimball Dam Bypass Plan to provide flow below the dam during periods it normally occurs and thereby mimic the natural hydrograph. This is in keeping with DFG code 5937 that requires enough water to be passed by a dam to maintain the normal fishery that would exist downstream were the dam not there. The City of Calistoga must balance this bypassed water with the city's need for a public water supply. The bypass schedule is based on inflow, water year, and date. According to a fishery assessment done in 1997 by Rob Leidy at three sites around Kimball Reservoir, it appears Calistoga will be passing enough flow to sustain several species of fish below the dam at critical periods of the year.

To determine more quantitatively if water bypassed at Kimball Dam is sufficient to sustain the fishery, an IFIM (Instream Flow Incremental Methodology) will be performed. This study will develop recommendations for flows ranging from optimum to sustaining conditions for various species of fish in different life stages, but will probably concentrate on spawning and rearing steelhead (*oncorhynchus mykiss*).

The City of Calistoga states "The Bypass Schedule is a voluntary decision by the City and not intended to create a "starting point" for further modification." However, should the IFIM show there would be significant benefit from increased flow (higher than have been suggested by Calistoga), CDFG may have legal grounds to press the issue. Finally, Calistoga reserves the right to suspend flows in dry years, which would mimic the natural hydrograph. Such a suspension may find agreement from CDFG.

We feel that the instream flow study is important. It should be tied to adaptive management strategies that will adjust the Schedule of Bypass Flows listed to best manage the fisheries below the dam. If depths, velocities, and substrate below the dam would sustain steelhead based on species connectivity in the Napa River and parameter preference values as found from the many studies done on nearby streams (such as for PG&E's work at the Geysers), absent water quality issues it can be assumed a SH fishery would develop.

By recognizing those issues we would like to encourage Calistoga to complete an IFIM in due course.

Sincerely,

Bernhard Krevet,  
President, Friends of the Napa River

