

**CITY OF CALISTOGA
PLANNING COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES**

**Wednesday, October 24, 2012
5:30 PM
Calistoga Community Center
1307 Washington St., Calistoga, CA**

**Chairman Jeff Manfredi
Vice Chairman Paul Coates
Commissioner Carol Bush
Commissioner Nicholas Kite
Commissioner Walter Kusener**

“California Courts have consistently upheld that development is a privilege, not a right.”

Among the most cited cases for this proposition are Associated Home Builders, Inc. v. City of Walnut Creek, 4 Cal.3d633 (1971) (no right to subdivide), and Trent Meredith, Inc. v. City of Oxnard, 114 Cal. App. 3d 317 (1981) (development is a privilege).

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER AT 5:30 p.m.

A. ROLL CALL

Present: Chairman Jeff Manfredi, Vice Chairman Paul Coates, Commissioners Carol Bush and Nick Kite. **Absent:** Walter Kusener (late). **Staff Present:** Ken MacNab, Planning and Building Manager, and Erik Lundquist, Senior Planner.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS

1. **Clarence Luvisi, 285 Rosedale Road.** Mr. Luvisi stated he was told that the City has an affordable housing trust fund and a parking trust fund. Mr. Luvisi asked where these funds are budgeted in the City's budget document and where a citizen can review the dollar amount in each respective fund. Mr. Luvisi asked if these funds were going to be used for the affordable housing project that is being discussed later on the agenda.

D. ADOPTION OF MEETING AGENDA

MOVED by Commissioner Bush, seconded by Commissioner Kite, to approve the meeting agenda of October 24, 2012.

The motion carried with the following vote:

- AYES: (4) Manfredi, Coates, Bush, Kite
- NOES: (0)
- ABSTENTIONS: (0)
- ABSENT: (1) Kusener

E. COMMUNICATIONS/CORRESPONDENCE

Chairman Manfredi noted one late communication submitted by Larry Kromann of Calistoga Affordable Housing, Inc.

F. CONSENT CALENDAR

MOVED by Vice Chair Coates, seconded by Chairman Manfredi, to approve the regular meeting minutes of October 10, 2012 as provided.

The motion carried with the following vote:

- AYES: (4) Manfredi, Coates, Bush, Kite
- NOES: (0)
- ABSTENTIONS: (0)
- ABSENT: (1) Kusener

G. TOUR OF INSPECTION

None.

H. PUBLIC HEARINGS

None.

I. NEW BUSINESS

1. **CALISTOGA AFFORDABLE HOUSING – THE OAKS (CDR 2012-02):**
Review of revised conceptual development plans to construct an 18-unit affordable housing project located at 611 Washington Street (APN 011-260-027) within the "R-3", Residential/Professional Office Zoning District. The applicant is Calistoga Affordable Housing on behalf of the property owner, Charles Gonzales. This project was first presented to the Planning Commission on July 25, 2012.

Vice Chairman Coates recused himself because his business office is located within 500 feet of the project site.

[Commissioner Kusener arrives at the meeting]

Planning Manager MacNab gave the staff report.

Larry Kromann, President, Calistoga Affordable Housing, Inc. (Applicant). Mr. Kromann summarized statements and information contained in the correspondence that he submitted to the Commission.

Chairman Manfredi asked for clarification on the reference to "discussion with Commissioners" made under the heading of "density" in the letter attached to the staff report (Attachment 7). Mr. Manfredi wanted to know the specific Commissioners that Mr. Kromann spoke with. **Mr. Kromann** stated he had spoken to Commissioners Bush and Coates.

Eric Haesloop, 1660 Bush Street, San Francisco (Project Architect). Mr. Haesloop gave a presentation reviewing the changes that have been made to project in response to the Commission's comments at the July 25, 2012 meeting.

Commissioner Kite asked if the proposed accessible units would require provision of additional disabled parking spaces. Mr. Kite noted that if additional disabled parking spaces are required they would require more space.

Commissioner Kusener stated that he thought the project has been greatly improved since the last presentation. Mr. Kusener asked for clarification on whether the setback distance from the river had changed. **Mr. Haesloop** responded that the setback from the river has not changed, but that there have been changes to the front setback (buildings are now closer to the street).

Commissioner Kusener asked staff if it was still the City's interest to provide a pathway along the river. **Planning Manager MacNab** responded that is and that the applicant has indicated that they are agreeable to dedicating an easement along the river for future construction of a bike path.

Commissioner Kusener asked if there were any restrictions on the public parking spaces in the street. **Planning Manager MacNab** responded that although on-street parking conditions are impacted in this area of the City there are no restrictions on the use of these spaces. Mr. Kusener expressed concern about this issue.

Commissioner Kusener expressed concern that the tandem parking spaces would be used by residents for storage, consequently creating additional demand for on-street parking spaces. Mr. Kusener asked if there would be any opportunity to provide on-site storage space for the units. **Mr. Haesloop** responded that it may be possible to provide on-site storage space. **Mr. Kromann** noted that use of the tandem parking spaces for their intended purpose can be controlled with good management.

Commissioner Kite asked if there would be a parking management plan that designates spaces. **Mr. Kromann** responded that there would be a parking management plan that is monitored.

Commissioner Bush asked if it was possible for on-site management to effectively enforce parking. **Mr. Kromann** stated that he thought it would be.

Commissioner Kusener asked the applicant if it would be possible to provide or assist residents with securing storage space. **Mr. Kromann** responded that there may be an opportunity to work with the storage space company across the street.

Commissioner Kite asked if there were ways other than selecting tenants with low parking needs to reduce parking demands. **Mr. Haesloop** responded that the project's close proximity to services and amenities in and of itself would help to reduce the need for an automobile.

Chairman Manfredi stated that providing recreational space for kids to keep them from playing in parking area is a critical issue. Mr. Manfredi asked if the State Dept. of Fish and Game was agreeable to allowing use of the river setback area for passive recreational uses. Mr. Manfredi stated that for him this project hinges on the ability to provide this recreational space and strongly encouraged the applicant to explore this issue with Fish and Game.

Commissioner Kusener stated he concurred with Chairman Manfredi's position on this issue.

Mr. Kromann acknowledged the issue and said they would work with Fish and Game to create an attractive play area – whether it's a 35-foot wide area or something else. Mr. Kromann also pointed out that there may be some opportunities to use the ball field down the street from the project site.

Commissioner Bush asked for clarification on the distances between the two-story structures and the parking area.

Chairman Manfredi asked for an explanation on the relocation of the trash enclosure.

Commissioner Kusener asked the applicant for information on the average amount of square footage that would be provided per occupant.

Commissioner Kusener asked what features would be included in the units – specifically asking about dual-pane windows, sound-proofing measures and washers and dryers.

Chairman Manfredi invited public comment on the project.

Bob Fiddaman, 1300 Cedar Street. Mr. Fiddaman made the following comments regarding the conceptual project plans:

- This is a site that CAH has been looking at for years. He believes it is a good site for an affordable housing project.
- Reminded the Commission that during review of the project CAH presented to the Commission several years ago it was specifically suggested that a site in this area be considered as an alternative location for that project. The Commission now has the opportunity to give a thumbs-up for a project that is well designed and in a good location.
- Noted that many of the issues discussed by the Commission at the meeting in July have been addressed.
- Believes that as designed this project would be the nicest on Washington Street.
- Noted that the proposed density is below what's allowed by the City and is appropriate for an affordable housing project.
- Supports the use of pre-constructed modular units.
- Noted that the Squire project just up the street does not appear to have any off-street parking and the units are half of the size of the units being proposed for this project.
- Encouraged the Commission to support this project.

Clarence Luvisi, 285 Rosedale Road. Mr. Luvisi commended the applicant on their presentation. Mr. Luvisi made the following comments regarding the conceptual project plans:

- The idea of multi-use development on lower Washington Street was discussed and supported 30 years ago.
- Mixed use, mixed generational development has demonstrated benefits.

- Supports use of modular construction if allowable under code.
- Believes project is well balanced and can serve as a model for future projects.
- Concurs with the Commission's concern about working with the Department of Fish and Game.
- Thinks the provision of on-site storage is important, but likes suggestion of working with the storage company across the street.

Chairman Manfredi brought the discussion back to the Commission for final comments.

Commissioner Kite stated he thought the applicant has done great job responding to the Commission's comments.

Commissioner Kite stated that his primary concern is the practicality of making the project work – particularly with respect to parking. Mr. Kite stated that he would like to see a detailed parking management and tenant occupancy plan that demonstrates how the parking will work.

Commissioner Kite stated that the provision of play space at the back of the site is an important issue.

Commissioner Bush encouraged the applicant to provide as much storage space on site as possible.

Commissioner Bush stated that she thought there was enough site area to provide one more parking space on site.

Commissioner Bush stated that she was comfortable with assuming there would be a lowered parking demand for senior occupied units.

Commissioner Bush stated she thought the applicant has done a great job with the project and loves the idea of multi-generational use.

Chairman Manfredi concurred with Commissioner Kite about providing a parking management and tenant occupancy plan.

Chairman Manfredi supported Commissioner Bush's comment of providing one additional on-site parking space if possible. Mr. Manfredi suggested an alternative approach to addressing the parking issue would be to further reduce the number of residential units and add another commercial space.

Chairman Manfredi stated that he was skeptical about the addition of garage doors to the tandem parking stalls. Mr. Manfredi expressed concern that the addition of garage doors would make it easier to use the tandem parking areas for storage.

Mr. Kromann responded that he thought the garage doors would improve the aesthetics of the project area. Mr. Kromann added that he thought Mr. Manfredi's concern about use of the parking areas for storage could be addressed as part of the parking management plan the Commission has requested be submitted with the formal entitlement application.

Chairman Manfredi supported the applicant's commitment to having an on-site manager.

J. MATTERS INITIATED BY COMMISSIONERS

Chairman Manfredi welcomed Commissioner Kusener back from his absence.

K. COMMENTS/PROJECT STATUS

Planning Manager MacNab informed the Commission that the Indian Springs resort expansion proposal would be presented at the November 14, 2012 meeting.

Senior Planner Lundquist reported that the Giants were winning 5-0 in Game 1 of the World Series.

L. ADJOURNMENT

MOVED by Chairman Manfredi, seconded by Commissioner Kusener, to adjourn to the next regular meeting of the Planning Commission on November 14, 2012.

The motion carried with the following vote:

- AYES: (4) Manfredi, Bush, Kite, Kusener
- NOES: (0)
- ABSTENTIONS: (0)
- ABSENT: (1) Coates

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:48 p.m.



Ken MacNab,
Planning Commission Secretary