

CITY OF CALISTOGA

STAFF REPORT

TO: CHAIRMAN MANFREDI AND PLANNING COMMISSIONERS

FROM: ERIK V. LUNDQUIST, SENIOR PLANNER

MEETING DATE: AUGUST 28, 2013

SUBJECT: PIONEER PARK DESIGN REVIEW DR 2013-8
1308 CEDAR STREET APN 011-223-003

1 ITEM

2 Consideration of a design review request to allow renovations to Pioneer Park, including
3 replacement of the existing gazebo, located at 1308 Cedar Street.

4 PROJECT SETTING AND BACKGROUND

5 Pioneer Park is 1.86± acres and is located just off of Lincoln Avenue, Calistoga's
6 downtown commercial district. Pioneer Park has frontage on Cedar Street and Spring
7 Street. The Napa River borders the park to the north and residential uses surround the
8 park to the east, south and west. Pioneer Park is currently established with a
9 playground/family picnic area, restrooms, a gazebo, BBQ area, lawn, lighting and
10 landscaping. Many significant trees exist throughout the park including Eastern Pin
11 Oak, Coastal Redwood Sequoia, Incense Cedar and London Plane Sycamore.

12 The playground, gazebo and lawn area experience heavy use. The Chamber of
13 Commerce offers concerts during the summer months and the park is frequently rented
14 to private parties for special events such as weddings and graduations. Popularity of
15 the park continues to grow within the community.

16
17 The Friends of Pioneer Park, a California non-profit corporation, has initiated a project
18 to renovate Pioneer Park, including the replacement of the existing gazebo. On March
19 19, 2013, Friends of Pioneer Park representative Bob Fiddaman made a presentation to
20 the City Council on the status of the park renovations. At a June 21, 2013, meeting of
21 the Friends of Pioneer Park, the schematic design for the gazebo and the associated
22 improvements to Pioneer Park were approved. The Friends of Pioneer Park
23 recommended that the plans be presented to the City Council for their consideration
24 and conceptual approval. On August 6, 2013 the City Council adopted Resolution No.
25 2013-069 approving the location and conceptual design of the gazebo and Pioneer Park
26 improvements and directing staff to undertake the design review, environmental review,
27 permitting and inspection process for the Gazebo replacement and associated
28 improvements at Pioneer Park. As such, the Friends of Pioneer Park submitted this

29 design review request as directed by the City Council and as required per CMC
30 17.23.050. Once the Planning Commission has approved the design review
31 application, the City Council will consider approving a variance to allow construction of
32 the replacement gazebo within the floodway.
33

34 **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

35 **A. Gazebo Design**

36
37 The impetus for park improvements has been the aging gazebo, which is the focal point
38 of the park. The existing gazebo is 14 feet in height and 150 square feet. The Friends
39 of Pioneer Park with Architect Thomas Stimper's assistance assessed local needs and
40 reviewed other gazebos to create the new gazebo design. The design objective was to
41 create a somewhat larger gazebo with an open design and flat ceiling. There was also
42 agreement that the design should be traditional and bear similarity to the existing
43 gazebo.
44



45 **PAINTING OF PROPOSED NEW GAZEBO BY ROBERT G. STEELE**

46
47
48
49

The following are the primary design elements of the proposed gazebo:

- The gazebo will be generally sited in the same location as the existing gazebo.

- 50 • The gazebo will be built on a concrete foundation that will raise the construction
51 elements off the ground approximately 18 inches, which would increase long
52 term durability. The foundation will have a pad extending beyond the gazebo
53 itself approximately 4 feet which will provide more room for all uses, including
54 musical performances.
55
- 56 • The gazebo will be increased in size to 300 square feet and 20 feet in height,
57 which will also benefit its use for performances, graduations, art shows,
58 weddings, etc. With the surrounding pad, the gazebo will offer over 400 square
59 feet for functional use.
60
- 61 • The gazebo will be open on all sides, with no railings. This is also intended to
62 provide more flexibility in use. Two benches will be provided on opposite sides
63 and ADA access will be available from the river side.
64
- 65 • Construction materials will be superior to the existing gazebo. A steel frame will
66 provide rigidity, and pre-fabricated fiberglass posts will provide superior weather
67 resistance. The roof will be Grade A cedar shingles treated for fire resistance
68 and stained to resist mold.
69
- 70 • The existing finial atop the current gazebo will be re-used or replicated.
71
- 72 • The color scheme will be the same as the existing gazebo (white).

73

74 **B. Master Landscape Plan**

75

76 The Master Landscape Plan was developed by GSM Landscape Architects, Inc. with
77 oversight from Friends of Pioneer Park. The Master Plan calls for a modest renovation
78 of the park, while essentially maintaining the current layout and design.

79

- 80 • Open space will be relatively unchanged, but additional landscaping will be
81 added in some areas.
82
- 83 • Path surfacing will remain asphalt.
84
- 85 • The family picnic area and BBQ area will remain decomposed granite.
86
- 87 • A new planting area will better screen the restrooms from the rest of the park.
88
- 89 • A minor change in topography will ramp the path adjacent to the gazebo
90 approximately 18" to provide ADA access.

- 91 • Some of the existing paths will be relocated to accommodate the new
92 gazebo, provide a better audience area for performances, and provide for the
93 river bank repairs proposed by the Napa County Flood Control District¹.
94
- 95 • Benches will be relocated to conform to the new paths.
96
- 97 • Replacement lighting will be provided based upon a needs study. The
98 existing 3-ball light near the park entrance will be relocated near the drinking
99 fountain by the river bank.
100
- 101 • New fencing will be provided on the western park perimeter, along the river
102 bank, and around the play area.
103
- 104 • New plantings and small-scale trees will be added to accent existing
105 landscaping.
106

107 **PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF REVIEW**

108
109 Design review is required for any new construction, remodel or renovations on publicly-
110 zoned lands (CMC Section 17.23.050) unless no substantial design issues are raised.
111 Given the direction from City Council and the predominant location of the property near
112 the downtown, Staff has scheduled this design review request for Planning Commission
113 consideration.
114

115 The purpose of design review is to secure the general purposes of the Zoning
116 Ordinance and General Plan; to promote good design and a harmonious relationship of
117 buildings; to preserve the unique character and ambiance of Calistoga; to promote
118 efficient use of landscape resources; to ensure high quality of design and materials; to
119 ensure compatibility of new development with existing development and to promote the
120 preservation of historic structures of Calistoga. Furthermore, the Planning Commission
121 must determine whether the proposed development is in compliance with the City's
122 Design Review Guidelines (CMC Section 17.06.040).
123

124 **DISCUSSION**

125 **A. Site Layout**

126
127 The overall context of the park will remain the same. The proposed modifications to the
128 park layout are intended to increase functionality and usability of the existing space(s).
129
130

¹ The Napa County Flood Control District is undertaking repairs to the riverbank. The riverbank repair project is in its initial planning stages but is anticipated not to have any impact on the proposed site improvements.

131 The proposed modifications to the site layout provide the following benefits:
132

- 133 • The siting and placement of the gazebo help define the lawn area and
134 functionality for various users and audiences.
135
- 136 • The reconfigured pathways provide better circulation within the park.
137
- 138 • The new site improvements comply with current ADA, health, and safety codes.
139
- 140 • Landscaping will screen less-desirable areas such as the existing restrooms.
141

142 The proposed site improvements are suitable and will achieve the overall objective of
143 creating continuity within the park and sense of space. The overall layout accomplishes
144 the needs and attains the findings for design review, as discussed in the attached draft
145 resolution.
146

147 **B. Architectural Design and Landscape Compatibility** 148

149 The proposed site improvements generally consist of replacing the existing gazebo,
150 landscaping, and renovating lighting and landscaping. The proposed improvements
151 would beautify the park with simple, elegant and understated landscaping features and
152 amenities. As mentioned above, the design of the site improvements is governed by the
153 City's Design Guidelines. Staff has reviewed the Design Guidelines and finds that the
154 design is generally consistent with them. Although, to further articulate the design,
155 Planning Commission may review and comment on the following issues:
156

157 Gazebo

158 The architectural design of the gazebo is commensurate with the existing design and
159 correlates to the historical interest of the park. Staff suggests no change to the
160 proposed design but suggests another flag pole instead of a trash can to the left of the
161 gazebo to create symmetry. The American Flag could be flown on the left and the
162 California Flag flown on the right. The Planning Commission should consider adding a
163 condition of approval requiring the additional flag pole.
164

165 Additionally, the small concrete retaining wall at the gazebo would be concrete,
166 consistent with its foundation. The Friends of Pioneer Park have suggested the
167 possibility of capping the wall with bricks. The Planning Commission should discuss
168 and consider whether the concrete treatment and brick cap is desirable. If not, the
169 Planning Commission should consider adding a condition requiring a specific treatment
170 and materials.
171
172

173 Landscaping

174 The planting palette (i.e., shrubs and ground cover) is appropriate for the park setting.
175 The use of evergreen and flowering shrubs is appreciated and will provide the
176 necessary border along edges of the park.

177
178 The landscape strip along Cedar Street is currently grass. The City's Public Works
179 Department has indicated that the heavy use in this area has made it difficult to
180 maintain. The Friends of the Pioneer Park would like to replace the grass with bricks, if
181 funding is available. The Planning Commission should discuss the appropriateness of
182 bricks or other surface treatment.

183
184 Trees

185 Jake Schneider with Pacific Tree Care has prepared a letter stating several initial
186 observations regarding the project's impacts on the mature trees within the park. As
187 suggested by Mr. Schneider, Staff has incorporated conditions of approval to avoid
188 impacts to trees, such as conditioning the western most pathway to be appropriately
189 placed between the existing Oak and Redwood trees and requiring the gazebo to be
190 constructed of a pier and grade beam foundation system to avoid root damage.

191
192 One Sycamore tree is proposed to be removed and would be replaced with a Cedar
193 tree. The removal of the Sycamore tree is appropriate since it is currently leaning and
194 crowded by neighboring trees. The Cedar tree would be located behind the gazebo
195 between the pathway and the Napa River near another existing Cedar tree. The
196 Planning Commission should discuss the appropriateness of the location and the
197 proposed species, which is not generally planted in riparian areas. The Planning
198 Commission may wish to condition a different species and/or location of the
199 replacement tree. Perhaps a riparian species is more appropriate.

200
201 Lighting and Fencing

202 The existing 3-ball light will be relocated near the drinking fountain and the Friends of
203 Pioneer Park propose replacing the other existing lighting with new contemporary LED
204 light standards. The siting and placement of the lighting are unknown at this time. The
205 lighting placement will depend on funding availability and a lighting needs assessment.
206 The Planning Commission should discuss and come to consensus on the lighting style.
207 In the event the Planning Commission does not find the proposed style suitable, then a
208 condition of approval should be incorporated requiring a specific lighting style.

209
210 Fencing surrounding the property to the west would be constructed of 6-foot solid wood
211 board similar in style to the 8-foot solid wood board fencing on the east side of the park.
212 Fencing along the Napa River would be black cyclone or wrought iron, depending upon
213 funding. Cyclone fencing is not allowed (CMC Section 17.52.055) unless formally
214 authorized. The Planning Commission should discuss and come to consensus on the
215 fencing styles. In the event the Planning Commission does not find the proposed styles

216 suitable, then a condition of approval should be incorporated requiring a specific fencing
217 style.

218

219 **GENERAL PLAN CONSISTENCY**

220

221 The proposed design and improvements are consistent with General Plan Policy P.1 on
222 Page OSC-49 of the Open Space Element, which directs the City to maintain and
223 enhance existing parks.

224 **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

225 No public comments have been received on the project.

226 **FINDINGS**

227 To reduce repetition, all of the necessary design review findings are contained in the
228 attached draft resolution (Attachment No. 2).

229 **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

230 The proposed project is Categorically Exempt from the requirements of the California
231 Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Sections 15302 (Replacement or
232 Reconstruction) and 15304 (Minor Alterations to Land) of the CEQA Guidelines.

233 **RECOMMENDATION**

- 234 1. Consider an additional flag pole and retaining wall treatments
235 2. Consider landscape strip treatment
236 3. Consider tree replacement suitability
237 4. Consider lighting design
238 5. Consider fencing design
239 6. Adopt a resolution approving Design Review DR 2013-8 with conditions.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Vicinity Map
2. Draft Resolution
3. City Council Resolution No. 2013-069
4. Project Description dated July 24, 2013
5. Pacific Tree Care Initial Observations received August 15, 2013
6. Planting Palette received August 14, 2013
7. Lighting Specification Sheets received August 14, 2013
8. Site Plan and Gazebo Details received July 16, 2013
9. Pioneer Park Map of Topography received July 16, 2013

NOTE: Calistoga Municipal Code provides for a ten (10) calendar day appeal period. If there is a disagreement with the Planning Commission, an appeal to the City Council may be filed. The appropriate forms and applicable fee must be submitted prior to 5:00 p.m. on or before the tenth calendar day following the Commission's final determination.