

# MINUTES

## CALISTOGA PLANNING COMMISSION

August 28, 2013

The meeting was called to order at 5:30 pm.

### A. ROLL CALL

Commissioners present: Chairman Jeff Manfredi, Vice Chairman Paul Coates, Commissioners Carol Bush, Scott Cooper and Walter Kusener. Staff present: Planning & Building Director Lynn Goldberg, Senior Planner Erik Lundquist.

### B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

### C. PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were no public comments.

### D. ADOPTION OF MEETING AGENDA

The meeting agenda of August 28, 2013 was accepted as presented.

### E. COMMUNICATIONS/CORRESPONDENCE

None

### F. CONSENT CALENDAR

#### 1. Minutes for the August 14, 2013 Planning Commission meeting

The August 14, 2013 Minutes were accepted as presented.

### G. PUBLIC HEARINGS

#### 1. Pioneer Park (DR 2013-8): Consideration of a Design Review request to allow renovations to Pioneer Park, including replacement of the existing gazebo located at 1308 Cedar Street

**Senior Planner Lundquist** presented the staff report and described several design revisions that the Commission may wish to comment on. He noted that once the Planning Commission has approved the design review application, the City Council will consider approving a variance to allow construction of the replacement gazebo within the floodway.

In response to a question from **Vice Chair Coates** about whether the City's 3:1 tree replacement policy is being followed by the project, **Mr. Lundquist** explained that a single tree had been deemed by Public Works to be adequate due to the extensive number of trees on the property and additional trees would create an overcrowded situation.

**Chairman Manfredi** opened the public hearing.

**Bob Fiddaman**, representing Friends of Pioneer Park, a non-profit group formed to improve Pioneer Park, noted that flexibility in design will be needed as the project is implemented.

**Gretchen Stranzl McCann**, project landscape architect, provided an overview of the planned improvements to the park. There is currently not a lot of contiguous turf area to accommodate concert crowds, so the walkways will be relocated to provide a large grass area. A more-suitable turf that can withstand shade will be used. Several trees will be added near the restroom. The existing three-ball light will be moved to the northwest corner of the site to provide additional lighting. Only one tree needs to be removed because it is in poor condition. ADA access would be provided to the new gazebo. New fencing would be installed along the river, possibly a black vinyl-clad chainlink fencing to allow views of the river. The new cedar tree would be in keeping with the name of the street on which the park is located and the fact that a lot of cedars have been planted in the area. It would complement the extensive riparian species already growing along the bank. They're trying to add enough lighting in a careful and artful way, probably using LED fixtures so that they are energy efficient. She feels the addition of another flagpole, as suggested by staff, would interrupt the organic feel of the park and harden the area. A brick parkway instead of grass would be appropriate because the strip is shaded by a lot of trees and the area is highly trafficked.

**Tom Stimpert**, project architect, explained that the goals of the gazebo replacement are to provide a larger space and a structure that will last 100 years, with a design that is similar to the existing, but improved. The existing gazebo is narrow, has a low head height and a wraparound railing, which is confining and blocks views. The slope of the existing roof and the finials will be kept for the new gazebo. The radiating steps and apron will encourage interaction between performers and the audience, and expand the usable area of the gazebo. The concrete will have a custom finish to soften its appearance. The steel posts will be covered with fiberglass that will never rot. Everyone likes the existing cedar shingles, so they will be using them. The top third, however, will be scalloped to provide some detailing. Everything would be white. The ceiling will be bead board, with a coffered center. LED perimeter uplighting will softly illuminate the entire gazebo. There will be recessed downlighting to provide adequate illumination for performances. There will also be lighting from the exterior to light performers. They plan to hire a lighting specialist. The lighting will not be offensive or overpowering. Because the river is behind the gazebo, no neighbors would be affected.

**Mr. Fiddaman** would prefer to have only one flagpole, with two flags. The current pole has been there for 75 years, but it will need to be moved. The retaining wall is very small and will match the gazebo podium itself, which will probably be concrete. It will have an attractive custom finish with scoring. He supports keeping the replacement tree as a cedar. Having brick along the street instead of grass is much more practical and will continue the treatment used at his house next door.

**Dana Hemberger**, Cedar Street, asked whether the proportions on the proposed gazebo roof are the same as what were used on the gazebo 100 years ago. Handrails are needed to navigate the curved steps. He hopes that the bushes will be cut back and trimmed up to improve visibility into the park for security. He thinks the proposal is a great idea.

**Chairman Manfredi** closed the public hearing.

**Commissioner Bush** thinks the plan is magnificent. It is well-done and designed.

**Vice-Chairman Coates** concurred. He appreciates the efforts of the Friends

**Commissioner Cooper** thinks it's great that the community is working together on this project, which is greatly needed. He would normally prefer grass along the parkway, but the brick strip next door looks great. He likes the lighting proposal.

**Commissioner Kusener** concurs with the other commissioners that it's a great project. He would like to see a green strip along the street because it has a more appealing appearance, perhaps with some brick access points. He is concerned that the steps are not wide enough to accommodate performers. He would like to see at least a wider second step. He asked if there are plans to change the park's signage. He suggested that the ramp be designed to discourage use by skateboarders and that the benches inside the gazebo be removable for special events. He is concerned about adequate lighting near the restroom.

**Vice-Chairman Coates** believes that it is difficult and costly to maintain grass within the landscape strip. Perhaps turf block could be used. It was the consensus of the Commission to use brick along the park frontage with some greenery to break it up, if feasible.

**Mr. Stimpert** opined that two feet should be wide enough for the steps.

**Mr. Fiddaman** explained that there are currently no plans to change the signage, although they would like to improve it. The City has some plans to upgrade it along with signage at all the City facilities. The improvements will have to be completed in phases as funding allows. They will be working with a lighting expert to provide adequate illumination and probably double the number of light fixtures. He wants to explore a more traditional fixture design than the currently-proposed design. They will definitely be lighting the restrooms. Electrical outlets will be added. He hopes that funding will allow the river fencing to be ornamental.

The Commission reached consensus on the following items: no additional flagpole is needed, the ramp should be finished in the same manner as the gazebo, the fencing along the river should be open and ornamental, and the proposed cedar tree is an acceptable species. The Commission

encouraged the Friends group to work with the Public Works and Planning Departments to select a suitable lighting fixture design.

**Ms. McCann** clarified that the feature is actually a retaining curb, not wall, which will rise from 0 to 18 inches. It will be colored concrete that is all tied together with the gazebo. They will include skate clips that prevent skateboard use.

**Mr. Lundquist** suggested allowing flexibility in the foundation design by amending Condition No. 7 to add, "...or another foundation design that is acceptable to the City."

A motion by **Commissioner Bush** and seconded by **Commissioner Kusener** to adopt a resolution approving Design Review application DR 2013-8 for renovations to Pioneer Park with the above amendment carried unanimously.

2. **Dexter Landscapes (CUP 2013-8):** Consideration of a Conditional Use Permit to allow the conversion of a single-family residence located at 509B Washington Street to an office.

**Vice-Chairman Coates** recused himself from this item because he is the property owner and is presenting the application.

**Mr. Lundquist** presented the staff report on the proposed permit and recommended its approval, citing conformance with the General Plan and Zoning Code.

In response to a question from **Commissioner Cooper**, Mr. Lundquist confirmed that the permit runs with the property and any future occupants of the property would be subject to the same conditions of approval.

**Chairman Manfredi** opened the public hearing.

**Paul Coates**, representing the applicants, explained that it is difficult to rent the property as a residence because of its surroundings and believes an office use is more suitable. He has no objections to the proposed conditions of approval, except that he would like Condition No.14 to be expanded to allow activities normally associated with residential zoning. A similar condition was placed on his office project on the adjoining property.

**Chairman Manfredi** closed the public hearing.

In response to a question from **Chairman Manfredi**, Mr. Lundquist clarified that Condition No. 14 already allows for normal activities associated with residential and office uses.

In response to questions from **Commissioner Kusener**, Mr. Lundquist clarified that the Commission may allow improvements within the river setback if certain findings are made. In this case, the parking area's

pervious surface will reduce runoff. Mr. Coates stated that the property is not considered to be affordable housing.

A motion by **Commissioner Cooper** and seconded by **Commissioner Bush** to adopt a resolution approving a conditional use permit to allow the conversion of a single-family residence located at 509B Washington Street to an office carried unanimously.

3. **Bank of America ATM (ZO 2013-7 & CUP 2013-10)**: Consideration of a recommendation to the City Council regarding an amendment to the Downtown Commercial Zoning District to allow off-site free-standing automated teller machines (ATMs), and a conditional use permit to allow an off-site ATM located at 1450 Lincoln Avenue.

**Vice-Chairman Coates** returned to the dais. **Commissioners Bush and Cooper** recused themselves from this item because of their businesses' proximity to the property in question and left the meeting.

**Mr. Lundquist** presented the staff report on the applications, noting the staff recommended denial of both for the reasons detailed in the written report.

**Chairman Manfredi** opened the public hearing.

**Charmi Deepak**, representing Bank of America, observed that an ATM is a modern-day bank. It's unmanned, but allows financial transactions. Banks are allowed in the Downtown Commercial Zoning District, so they applied for a Zoning Ordinance amendment to allow stand-alone ATMs. A walk-up ATM would provide another option for those who don't wish to interface with a teller or stand in line. It would actually improve the downtown rather than hurt it. She is not aware of any plans to close the bank if the ATM is approved. In some cities, there are multiple stand-alone ATMs along with a branch office. There isn't room to add another ATM at the existing bank branch. The proposed location would provide adequate area for an ADA landing as well as providing shade, neither of which are provided by the existing ATM. Regarding staff's concern about the modern design of the ATM, the design submitted with the conditional use permit application is an off-the-shelf design. They can design an ATM that complements Calistoga. They are sensitive to lighting pollution, so all lighting will be cut-off and not spillover. Security cameras will be installed, which have been helpful for security in general in other communities. The use will help the community overall. They can work with the City to meet its signage requirements. Regarding trash concerns, the ATM will have an option to not print a receipt and a trash can would be placed close by. The proposed location does not interfere with the historic character of any adjacent building. There is an existing telephone booth near the proposed location of the ATM that would be removed; the proposed ATM would simply be updating technology. The proposed ATM is consistent with the

walkability of the downtown because it doesn't require driving, so it's consistent with the General Plan.

**Chairman Manfredi** closed the public hearing.

**Vice-Chair Coates** is surprised that the applicant didn't work to submit a design that is more compatible with Calistoga. He questions whether ATMs are necessary for a single bank on opposite sides of the street.

**Commissioner Kusener** doesn't see the necessity for the proposed ATM because it duplicates the existing ATM across the street. He wants to see something that enhances the downtown, not duplicate what is already there. If it were approved, it would need to be less-intrusive.

**Ms. Deepak** stated that the proposed ATM has essentially the same functions, but the ATM at the existing bank, is heavily used and there is inadequate room to add another ATM. It would also be recessed from the sidewalk to provide an ADA landing area. The design is preliminary and they will work with the Planning Department on an acceptable design with appropriate finishes.

A motion by **Vice-Chair Coates** and seconded by **Commissioner Kusener** to adopt a resolution recommending that the City Council deny an amendment to the Downtown Commercial Zoning District allowing off-site automated teller machines was adopted unanimously.

A motion by **Commissioner Kusener** and seconded by **Vice-Chair Coates** to adopt a resolution denying a conditional use permit for an off-site walk-up free-standing ATM kiosk located at 1450 Lincoln Avenue carried unanimously.

The applicant was advised that the City will notify her of the City Council public hearing date when it is set.

#### **H. MATTERS INITIATED BY COMMISSIONERS**

None

#### **I. DIRECTOR REPORT**

Ms. Goldberg advised the Commission of upcoming agenda items.

#### **J. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 7:15 p.m. to September 11, 2013.

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Lynn Goldberg  
Planning Commission Secretary