

MINUTES

CALISTOGA PLANNING COMMISSION

October 9, 2013

The meeting was called to order at 5:30 pm.

A. ROLL CALL

Commissioners present: Chairman Jeff Manfredi, Vice Chairman Paul Coates, Commissioners Carol Bush, Scott Cooper and Walter Kusener. Staff present: Planning & Building Director Lynn Goldberg, Senior Planner Erik Lundquist.

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

C. PUBLIC COMMENTS

There were no public comments.

D. ADOPTION OF MEETING AGENDA

The meeting agenda of October 9, 2013 was accepted as presented.

E. COMMUNICATIONS/CORRESPONDENCE

A letter from Kristin Casey regarding Item G.1. was distributed to the Commission.

F. CONSENT CALENDAR

1. Minutes for the September 11, 2013 Planning Commission meeting

The September 11, 2013 Minutes were accepted as presented.

G. PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. Single-Family Residential Design Guidelines (CI 2013-1):

Consideration of a recommendation to the City Council to adopt guidelines to be used in reviewing the design of new single-family dwellings and additions to existing single-family dwellings

Planning Director Goldberg presented the staff report, advising that in addition to comments on the draft guidelines, direction is also requested from the Commission regarding whether to expand design review to apply to homes of less than 4,000 square feet. She noted that the Commission should take its time in reviewing the guidelines and that it may take several meetings to attain the final draft that will be conveyed to the City Council.

Commissioner Bush believes that the guidelines should be optional and shouldn't deter creative design.

In response to questions from **Commissioner Kusener**, Senior Planner Lundquist explained that since there is no longer a design review board and the design advisory panel is currently inactive, the proposed design guidelines would not be a duplicative effort. Ms. Goldberg explained that

staff reports wouldn't evaluate an application in terms of every guideline; they are most useful when seeking to avoid unattractive design. The guidelines would be provided to anyone considering building a new home for them to consider in their design.

Commissioner Kusener believes that we should be careful about being too restrictive. He supports the guidelines concept and protecting existing neighborhoods, but some provisions might be too detailed and restrictive, such as requiring gutters to be the same color as the building. Some guidelines are personal taste, such as encouraging porches.

In response to a question from **Commissioner Cooper**, Ms. Goldberg responded that the guidelines would not preclude manufactured homes, since the modern designs are indistinguishable from conventionally-constructed residences. **Commissioner Cooper** supports adding staff-level review for residences of less than 4,000 square feet.

Chairman Manfredi supports this type of staff review, and believes that all new homes should have some type of design review.

Commissioner Bush agreed with these comments.

Vice-Chair Coates is concerned that the proposed design guidelines represent more government regulations and unnecessary restrictions. His house wouldn't comply with the guidelines because the garage is too wide and bringing the living portion forward on the lot would reduce landscaping and increase the amount of hard surface. Contrasting colors aren't needed. Applying the guidelines could affect the eclectic nature of design in the community and preclude residents from expressing themselves. He supports protection from inappropriate design, however he doesn't support staff level review with such extensive guidelines. Some of the proposed provisions are great.

Chairman Manfredi opened the public hearing.

Kristin Casey requested that the third guideline under Building Form and Massing be expanded to limit development to a one-story design when it's adjacent to an all one-story neighborhood.

Jim Barnes doesn't support too many rules and regulations. "Shoulds" can turn into "shalls." People should have the ability to have the design they want. His two-story addition couldn't have been built under the guidelines in his neighborhood, since it's all single-story. He doesn't support requiring that homes be all one size.

Kristin Casey clarified that she wasn't proposing that neighborhoods have to be all one design; she is just concerned about putting multi-story homes near single-story homes

Chairman Manfredi closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Bush thinks that the guidelines are too restrictive and subjective.

Vice-Chair Coates believes that guideline B.1. is too vague and B.2. is too restrictive – it could prohibit boxy design types. Some of the guidelines could have unintended consequences. He supports the proposed landscaping guidelines.

Commissioner Cooper thinks that the guidelines should highlight areas that the Commission feels strongly about.

Commissioner Kusener supports the concept of the guidelines; they could be helpful for property owners building a home or adding on.

In response to a question by **Vice-Chair Coates**, Ms. Goldberg clarified that the guidelines would be used to optimize the design of a two-story addition in a neighborhood with all single-story houses, but they would not preclude the addition if it met all of the zoning district's development standards. **Vice-Chair Coates** noted that you can see from the ground floor of a house into a neighbor's property over a six-foot fence; therefore, additional measures are not needed to protect the privacy of single-story homes from two-story houses.

Chair Manfredi suggests adding "maintaining the eclectic design character" of Calistoga to the design objectives. He supports the general use of guidelines, although few applications for new homes have been processed recently. Design review has never been very restrictive in this town. The Commission could be required to review less than 4,000 square foot houses instead of staff. The guidelines could be pruned down; perhaps they're overdone. However, not everyone has good taste.

Ms. Goldberg noted that it takes just one case of inappropriate design for a neighborhood to be adversely affected.

It was the consensus of the Commission that the commissioners provide their suggested changes to the draft guidelines to staff, with an overall direction of condensing them.

The Commission voted unanimously to continue the item to the next Commission meeting.

2. **Zoning Map Amendment ZOA 2013-8:** Consideration of a recommendation to the City Council on an amendment to the Calistoga Zoning Map to rezone four vacant properties, generally located behind the Riverlea Square commercial center from the R-3 to the R-2 Multiple-Family Residential District

Ms. Goldberg presented the staff report, explaining that the proposed zone change is recommended in order to provide conformance between the General Plan Land Use Map and the Zoning Map. She noted that the request from Kristin Casey that future development on the site be limited

to single-story could not be accommodated without a planned development zoning district or an amendment to the General Plan.

Vice-Chair Coates noted that future development of the site will be subject to design review and the Commission would have an opportunity to address the neighborhood's concerns at that time.

Chairman Manfredi opened the public hearing.

Lauren Lugo, 2421 Kathy Way, supports the rezoning because of concerns about multi-family, which is hard to maintain and would have additional traffic.

Chairman Manfredi reiterated that whatever is eventually proposed for the site will be subject to design review and environmental review through a public process.

In response to a question from **Guadalupe Cruz**, 2419 Kathy Way, Ms. Goldberg explained that the locations of any future curb cuts would be determined by a future development proposal.

Kristen Casey supports adding a provision in the proposed single-family residential design guidelines to be aware and considerate of neighborhood character.

Chairman Manfredi closed the public hearing. He doesn't see an opportunity as part of this rezoning action to address Ms. Casey's concern.

A motion by **Commissioner Bush** and seconded by **Chairman Manfredi** to adopt a resolution recommending to the City Council the approval of Zoning Map Amendment ZOA 2013-8 was approved unanimously.

H. MATTERS INITIATED BY COMMISSIONERS

None

I. DIRECTOR REPORT

Ms. Goldberg advised the Commission that the October 23, 2013 meeting had been cancelled and reminded the Commission that there are no meetings scheduled for the fourth Wednesdays of November and December. The City is still seeks applicants for upcoming Commission vacancies.

J. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 6:35 p.m. to November 13, 2013.



Lynn Goldberg
Planning Commission Secretary