

**City of Calistoga
Proposed Benefit Data Information to be Collected
September 2014**

Benefit data elements for a total compensation study normally include at least the following (which are generally available to all staff in a specific job classification):

Monthly Salary – The top of the normal, published salary range. All figures are presented on a monthly basis.

Employee Retirement – This includes two figures: the amount of the employee's State (PERS) or other public retirement contribution that is contributed by the agency and the amount of the agency's Social Security contribution (and/or any other retirement plan, such as PARS, 1937 Act, or 401k). We will also identify the average amount of dollars that each agency spends to fund enhanced PERS benefits.

Insurance – This is the maximum amount paid for employees plus dependents for a cafeteria or flexible benefit plan and/or health, dental, vision, life, long-term and short-term disability, and employee assistance program insurance.

Leave – Other than sick leave, which is usage-based, the amount of days off for which the City is obligated. All days will be translated into direct salary costs.

Holidays – The number of holidays (including floating) available to the employee on an annual basis.

Vacation – The number of vacation days available to all employees after five years of employment. Add policy of increased vacation allowance by years of service.

Administrative/Personal Leave – Administrative leave is normally the number of days available to management staff to compensate for the lack of payment for overtime. Personal leave may be available to other groups of employees to augment vacation or other time off.

Automobile – This category includes either the provision of an auto allowance or the provision of an unmarked auto for personal use. If a classification is provided with a car, we factor a \$450/month value into total compensation.

Deferred Compensation – This is any deferred compensation provided to all members of a classification with or without the requirement for an employee to provide a matching or minimum contribution.

Other – Any other benefits that are entitlements to all employees in a classification.

- Longevity – Summary of the percentage salary increases or flat lump sum amounts each employee receives after a certain number of years of service.
- Retiree Health – Summary of retiree health benefits offered; show quantified if others provide.

A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H
Ranking	Agency	Comparison Score	Services Provided	Geographic Proximity	Cost of Living	FTE Ratio to Population served	Total FTE Expenditure ratio
1	City of Callisoga	5	1	1	1	1	1
2	CITY OF HEALDSBURG	24	1	6	6	3	8
2	CITY OF ST. HELENA	24	1	2	9	4	2
4	City of Sebastopol	37	14	5	9	2	7
4	Town of Yountville	37	12	3	12	6	4
6	Petaluma	42	5	13	2	8	14
7	Town of Windsor	44	5	4	5	15	15
8	City of Cloverdale	45	5	11	11	9	9
8	City of Lakeport	45	5	15	14	5	6
10	City of Setaona	46	14	10	3	16	3
11	City of American Canyon	49	5	14	10	7	13
12	City of Napa	50	10	9	4	11	16
12	Rohert Park	50	10	7	8	13	12
14	City of Cotati	51	12	8	7	14	10
15	City of Vacaville	57	1	16	13	10	17
16	Town of Corte Madera	67	16	17	17	12	5
17	City of Geardale	72	16	12	16	17	11

Legend for columns: Lower numbers are more similar to City of Callisoga.

Column A: Ranking based upon Comparison Score (Bold indicates those recommended as proposed comparator.)

Column B: Agency Name

Column C: Comparison Score is equal to the sum of the rankings for each criteria.

Column D: Services Provided is the similarity in scope of services provided specifically in the following areas: fire, police, water treatment, water distribution, wastewater collection, wastewater treatment.

Column E: Geographic Proximity is the distance of each agency from City of Callisoga.

Column F: Cost of Living Average is the average cost of living in the local geographic area.

Column G: Total FTE Ratio to Population served.

Column H: Total Expenditure - FTE Ratio is the total expenditure per 1 FTE (in thousands).

AGENCIES PREVIOUSLY USED AS COMPARATOR FOR PAST STUDIES

City of Calistoga
 Proposed List of Comparators
 Total Compensation Study
 September 2014

Geographic Proximity Sort City	Geographic Proximity Ranking	Authorized FTE Population Ratio (per 1000)	Authorized FTE Population Ratio (per 1000)	Agency Financial to FTE Sort City	Agency Financial to FTE Sort City Ranking	Cost of Living Sort City	Cost of Living Sort City Ranking	Comparable Services	Comparable Services Ranking	Criteria Comparison Score	Overall Rank
City of Calistoga	1	1	1	City of Calistoga	1	City of Calistoga	1	City of Calistoga	1	5	1
City of American Canyon	14	7	7	City of American Canyon	13	City of American Canyon	10	City of American Canyon	5	49	11
City of Clearlake	12	17	17	City of Clearlake	11	City of Clearlake	18	City of Clearlake	16	72	17
City of Cloverdale	11	8	8	City of Cloverdale	9	City of Cloverdale	11	City of Cloverdale	5	45	8
City of Cotati	8	14	14	City of Cotati	10	City of Cotati	7	City of Cotati	12	51	14
City of Healdsburg	6	3	3	City of Healdsburg	8	City of Healdsburg	6	City of Healdsburg	1	24	2
City of Lakeport	15	5	5	City of Lakeport	6	City of Lakeport	14	City of Lakeport	5	45	8
City of Napa	8	11	11	City of Napa	16	City of Napa	4	City of Napa	10	50	12
City of Sebastopol	5	2	2	City of Sebastopol	7	City of Sebastopol	9	City of Sebastopol	14	37	4
City of Sonoma	10	16	16	City of Sonoma	3	City of Sonoma	3	City of Sonoma	14	46	10
City of St. Helena	2	4	4	City of St. Helena	2	City of St. Helena	15	City of St. Helena	1	24	2
City of Vacaville	16	10	10	City of Vacaville	17	City of Vacaville	13	City of Vacaville	1	57	15
Petaluma	13	8	8	Petaluma	14	Petaluma	2	Petaluma	5	42	6
Rohnert Park	7	13	13	Rohnert Park	12	Rohnert Park	8	Rohnert Park	10	50	12
Town of Corte Madera	17	12	12	Town of Corte Madera	5	Town of Corte Madera	17	Town of Corte Madera	16	67	16
Town of Windsor	4	15	15	Town of Windsor	15	Town of Windsor	5	Town of Windsor	5	44	7
Town of Yountville	3	6	6	Town of Yountville	4	Town of Yountville	12	Town of Yountville	12	37	4

City of Calistoga
Proposed List of Comparators
Total Compensation Study
September 2014

Agency	Miles from Client	FTE	Agency Financial Comparison (Expenditures)	Median Household Income (2014)	Median Home Price (2014)	Pop.	% above / below U.S. Cost of Living Average (2014)	Agency Financial FTE Ratio (Expenditures)	Authorized FTE Population Ratio (per 1000)	Notes and Services Provided	County	Fire	Police	Water Treatment	Water Distribution	Wastewater Collection	Wastewater Treatment	Comparable Services Score	Diff from Calistoga (Absolute Value)	Ranking
City of Calistoga	-	69	\$15,075,440	\$50,128	\$487,700	5,194	66.0%	\$218	13.28	Administration; Fire; Planning and Building; Police; Public Works (Streets/Sewer/Storm Drains/Sidewalk, Water/Wastewater Treatment); Community Resources	Napa County	X	X	X	X	X	X	6	0	1
City of American Canyon	40	116	\$34,818,741	\$83,609	\$339,800	20,001	37.6%	\$296	5.87	Administration, Community Development, Economic and Business Development, Parks and Recreation, Public Works, Transportation	Napa County	X		X	X	X	X	5	1	5
City of Clearlake ¹	36	46	\$4,597,202	\$25,916	\$100,300	15,194	-7.0%	\$101	2.99	Administration, Animal Control, Engineering, Police, Public Works	Lake County		X					1	5	16
City of Cloverdale	35	47	\$5,391,244	\$56,978	\$318,000	8,841	35.0%	\$115	5.45	Administration; Development Services (building, engineering, planning, sewer, streets, water distribution and treatment, wastewater treatment); Economic Development; Police	Sonoma County		X	X	X	X	X	5	1	5
City of Colati ¹	29	30	\$4,854,400	\$83,750	\$379,900	7,288	46.0%	\$160	4.16	Administrative Services; Community Development (planning & building); Police; Public Works (engineering, streets, water distribution & sewer, buildings, parks)	Sonoma County		X		X	X		3	3	12
City of Healdsburg	26	172	\$9,938,251	\$57,875	\$561,500	11,541	80.60%	\$58	14.92	Administration; Electric Utility; Fire; Municipal Airport; Parks & Recreation; Planning & Building; Police; Public Works (engineering, streets, water distribution, sewer, and wastewater treatment); Transit	Sonoma County	X	X	X	X	X	X	6	0	1
City of Lakeport	46	48	\$18,779,665	\$39,877	\$175,600	4,807	7.10%	\$390	10.03	Administration, Community Development, Police, Public Works	Lake County		X	X	X	X	X	5	1	5
City of Napa	29	413	\$69,668,980	\$62,505	\$443,700	78,358	57.4%	\$169	5.27	Administration, Community Development, Building Division, Economic and Business Development, Parks and Recreation, Public Works, Transportation	Napa County	X	X	X	X			4	2	10
City of Sebastopol	24	95	\$11,133,924	\$53,975	\$619,500	7,440	92.00%	\$117	12.77	Administration; Building & Safety; Engineering; Planning; Police; Public Works (parks, sewer, streets, water distribution)	Sonoma County	X	X					2	4	14
City of Sonoma	30	33	\$16,089,814	\$63,147	\$517,100	10,801	72.20%	\$488	3.06	Administration; Building; Planning; Public Works & City Engineer (cemetery, parks, streets, water distribution)	Sonoma County		X		X			2	4	14
City of St. Helena ¹	8	65	\$15,062,511	\$71,118	\$858,800	5,943	135.50%	\$230	11.00	Administration; Building; Fire; Library; Planning; Police; Parks & Recreation; Public Works (sewer, streets, wastewater treatment, water distribution and treatment)	Napa County	X	X	X	X	X	X	6	0	1
City of Vacaville	53	499	\$160,740,308	\$73,024	\$311,200	93,613	33.7%	\$322	5.33	Administration, Community Services, Economic Development, Fire, Recreation Services, Public Works, Utilities	Solano County	X	X	X	X	X	X	6	0	1
Petaluma	37	342	\$39,538,513	\$76,909	\$478,200	59,000	64.9%	\$116	5.79	Administration, Economic Development, Community Development (Building & Planning), Fire, Recreation Services, Public Works	Sonoma County	X	X		X	X	X	5	1	5
Rohnert Park	29	194	\$30,035,218	\$56,625	\$352,100	40,722	41.2%	\$154	4.77	Administration, Animal Shelter, Development Services, Public Safety (Fire & Police)	Sonoma County	X	X		X	X		4	2	10
Town of Corte Madera ²	62	46	\$18,148,700	\$107,723	\$992,900	9,267	164.0%	\$397	4.94	Administration, Building, Fire, Planning, Police Public Works, Recreation	Marin County	X						1	5	16
Town of Windsor	21	97	\$47,411,413	\$79,075	\$422,400	26,597	54.4%	\$489	3.65	Administration, Building Inspection, Economic Development, Parks and Recreation, Planning, Public Safety, Public Works	Sonoma County	X		X	X	X	X	5	1	5
Town of Yountville	21	28	\$17,540,966	\$68,884	\$656,200	3,017	97.40%	\$628	9.25	Administration, Parks and Recreation, Building and Planning, Public Works	Napa County				X	X	X	3	3	12
1 - 2013-14 FY Budget																				
2 - The Town of Corte Madera is supported by a shared police service - the Central Marin Police Authority.																				

City of Callistoga
Proposed List of Comparators
Total Compensation Study
September 2014

Agency	Miles from Client	FTE	Agency Financial (Expenditures)	Median Household Income (2014)	Median Home Price (2014)	Pop.	% above / below U.S. Cost of Living Average (2014)	Agency Financial FTE Ratio	Authorized FTE Population Ratio (per 1000)	Diff from Callistoga (Absolute Value)	Ranking
City of Clearlake	36	46	\$4,597,202	\$25,916	\$100,300	15,194	-7.0%	\$101	2.99	1	16
City of Lakeport	46	48	\$18,779,665	\$39,877	\$175,600	4,807	7.10%	\$390	10.03	1	14
City of Vacaville	53	499	\$160,740,308	\$73,024	\$311,200	93,613	33.7%	\$322	5.33	0	13
City of Cloverdale	35	47	\$5,391,244	\$56,978	\$318,000	8,641	35.0%	\$115	5.45	0	11
City of American Canyon	40	118	\$34,818,741	\$83,609	\$339,800	20,001	37.8%	\$296	5.87	0	10
Rohmert Park	29	194	\$30,035,218	\$56,625	\$352,100	40,722	41.2%	\$154	4.77	0	8
City of Cotati	29	30	\$4,854,400	\$63,750	\$379,900	7,288	46.0%	\$160	4.16	0	7
Town of Windsor	21	97	\$47,411,413	\$79,076	\$422,400	26,597	54.4%	\$489	3.65	0	5
City of Napa	29	413	\$69,668,980	\$62,505	\$443,700	78,358	57.4%	\$169	5.27	0	4
Petaluma	37	342	\$39,538,513	\$76,909	\$478,200	59,000	64.9%	\$116	5.79	0	2
City of Callistoga	0	69	\$15,075,440	\$50,128	\$487,700	5,194	66.0%	\$218	13.28	0	1
City of Sonoma	30	33	\$16,089,814	\$63,147	\$517,100	10,801	72.20%	\$488	3.06	0	3
City of Healdsburg	26	172	\$9,936,251	\$57,875	\$561,500	11,541	80.60%	\$58	14.92	0	6
City of Sebastopol	24	95	\$11,133,924	\$53,975	\$619,500	7,440	92.00%	\$117	12.77	0	9
Town of Yountville	21	28	\$17,540,966	\$68,864	\$656,200	3,017	97.40%	\$628	9.25	0	12
City of St. Helena	8	65	\$15,062,511	\$71,118	\$858,800	5,943	135.50%	\$230	11.00	1	15
Town of Corte Madera	62	46	\$18,149,700	\$107,723	\$992,900	9,267	164.0%	\$397	4.94	1	17

City of Calistoga
 Proposed List of Comparators
 Total Compensation Study
 September 2014

Agency	Miles from Client	FTE	Agency Financial (Expenditures)	Median Household Income (2014)	Median Home Price (2014)	Pop.	% above / below U.S. Cost of Living Average (2014)	Agency Financial FTE Ratio	Authorized FTE Population Ratio (per 1000)	Diff from Calistoga (Absolute Value)	Ranking
City of Clearlake	36	46	\$4,597,202	\$25,916	\$100,300	15,194	-7.0%	\$101	2.99	387400	16
City of Lakeport	46	48	\$18,779,665	\$39,877	\$175,600	4,807	7.10%	\$390	10.03	312100	14
City of Vacaville	53	499	\$160,740,308	\$73,024	\$311,200	93,613	33.7%	\$322	5.33	176500	13
City of Cloverdale	35	47	\$5,391,244	\$56,978	\$318,000	8,641	35.0%	\$115	5.45	169700	12
City of American Canyon	40	118	\$34,818,741	\$83,609	\$339,800	20,001	37.8%	\$296	5.87	147900	10
Rohnert Park	29	194	\$30,035,218	\$56,625	\$352,100	40,722	41.2%	\$154	4.77	135600	9
City of Cotati	29	30	\$4,854,400	\$63,750	\$379,900	7,288	46.0%	\$160	4.16	107800	7
Town of Windsor	21	97	\$47,411,413	\$79,076	\$422,400	26,597	54.4%	\$489	3.65	65300	5
City of Napa	29	413	\$69,668,980	\$62,505	\$443,700	78,358	57.4%	\$169	5.27	44000	4
Petaluma	37	342	\$39,538,513	\$76,909	\$478,200	59,000	64.9%	\$116	5.79	9500	2
City of Callistoga	0	69	\$15,075,440	\$50,128	\$487,700	5,194	66.0%	\$218	13.28	0	1
City of Sonoma	30	33	\$16,089,814	\$63,147	\$517,100	10,801	72.20%	\$488	3.06	29400	3
City of Healdsburg	26	172	\$9,936,251	\$57,875	\$561,500	11,541	80.60%	\$58	14.92	73800	6
City of Sebastopol	24	95	\$11,133,924	\$53,975	\$619,500	7,440	92.00%	\$117	12.77	131800	8
Town of Yountville	21	28	\$17,540,966	\$68,864	\$656,200	3,017	97.40%	\$628	9.25	168500	11
City of St. Helena	8	65	\$15,062,511	\$71,118	\$858,800	5,943	135.50%	\$230	11.00	371100	15
Town of Corte Madera	62	46	\$18,149,700	\$107,723	\$992,900	9,267	164.0%	\$397	4.94	505200	17