



## City of Calistoga Planning Commission Agenda Item Summary

---

<b>DATE</b>	January 27, 2016
<b>APPLICATION</b>	Use Permit UP 2015-11 & Design Review DR 2015-8
<b>PROPERTY OWNER</b>	City of Calistoga
<b>APPLICANT</b>	Boys and Girls Clubs of St. Helena and Calistoga
<b>ITEM</b>	Consideration of use permit and design review applications allowing the construction and operation of 1) the Boys and Girls Club of Calistoga, and 2) a modular building for city use at 1401 N. Oak Street
<b>RECOMMENDATION</b>	Approve use permit and design review with conditions
<b>SUGGESTED MOTION</b>	"I move that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution approving a use permit and design review allowing the construction and operation of the Boys and Girls Club of Calistoga and a modular building for city use at 1401 N. Oak Street."
<b>POTENTIAL CONFLICTS</b>	None

# CITY OF CALISTOGA

## STAFF REPORT

**TO:** CHAIRMAN COATES AND MEMBERS OF THE  
PLANNING COMMISSION

**FROM:** ERIK V. LUNDQUIST, SENIOR PLANNER

**MEETING DATE:** JANUARY 27, 2016

**SUBJECT:** BOYS & GIRLS CLUB AND CITY REC BUILDING  
1401 N. OAK STREET  
USE PERMIT UP 2015-11 & DESIGN REVIEW DR 2015-8

---

1 **ITEM**

2 Consideration of use permit and design review applications allowing the  
3 construction and operation of 1) the Boys and Girls Club of Calistoga, and 2) a  
4 city recreation services modular building at 1401 N. Oak Street

5 **BACKGROUND**

6 On August 18, 2015, the City Council adopted Resolution 2015-102 authorizing  
7 the City Manager to execute a ground lease and joint use agreement for the  
8 development of a new Boys and Girls Club facility on the subject property,  
9 whereby the Club would develop the project and provide community  
10 programming, while allowing City use of the facility for City and community uses.  
11 The City would continue to own the property.

12 On December 15, 2015, the City Council adopted Resolution 2015-142 adopting  
13 an addendum to the previously adopted mitigated negative declaration for the  
14 Logvy Community Park Master Plan and approving a revised Master Plan  
15 replacing the teen center/art center and community gardens with the Boys and  
16 Girls Club and other minor modifications.

17 On October 14, 2015, the Planning Commission reviewed and provided feedback  
18 on the conceptual plans for the project. An excerpt of the October 14, 2015  
19 Planning Commission meeting minutes is attached to this report.

20 **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

21 Park overview: Logvy Community Park is a 10.24-acre community park located in  
22 the central portion of the city comprised of two parcels, a 9.18 acre parcel and  
23 the subject 1.06 acre parcel. Surrounding land uses include several two-story  
24 apartment buildings that are located to the east of the project site on N. Oak  
25 Street. The apartments have entrances and balconies that face the project site.  
26 Similar apartment buildings are located across from the site on Washington  
27 Street.

28 To the north and west of the project site are Napa County Fairground facilities.  
29 The Fairground facilities operate year-round and offer a variety of services and  
30 events to area residents and visitors, including a recreational vehicle park, a golf  
31 course, picnic and barbeque areas, a race track, and event grand stand. The  
32 Napa County Fairgrounds is also the site of the annual Napa County Fair.

33 Project site: The 1.06-acre project site is situated in the northernmost portion of  
34 the community park. Immediately south of the project site is the community  
35 swimming pool facility.

36 In 2008, two uninhabitable residential structures and some associated trees and  
37 landscaping were removed from the project site as called for in earlier versions of  
38 the Logvy Community Park Master Plan, leaving this area cleared for future  
39 improvement. The property has served as the temporary location for the  
40 community garden and dog park pending future development of community  
41 facilities, as expressed in the Logvy Community Park Master Plan. The  
42 surrounding vegetation is mostly comprised of isolated groupings of trees along  
43 the perimeter of the site, including a number of valley oaks.

44 Primary access to the garden and dog park are from an interim dirt and gravel  
45 driveway behind the community pool, which also provides access to the City's  
46 maintenance yard located to the west of the project site. Secondary access to the  
47 site is provided by an interim access driveway on N. Oak Street.

48 Proposed Development: The project generally consists of a new Calistoga  
49 Clubhouse building, a modular building for City use, parking areas, vehicle drop-  
50 off area, and sidewalk and landscaping improvements.

51 The Calistoga Clubhouse building, approximately 13,800 square feet in size,  
52 would be centered on the site along the southern property line. The building  
53 would be divided into several spaces, including an art room, computer/tech lab,  
54 dining area, kitchen, learning center, games room, employee offices, storage,  
55 restrooms, and gymnasium, along with outdoor courtyards.

56 The utilitarian architectural design incorporates low profile butterfly roof lines with  
57 the higher gym roof to the rear away from the street. The exterior is clad with  
58 horizontal grey and sandstone öko skin, which is a glass fiber-reinforced  
59 concrete. Aluminum louvers would be installed to provide accents above and/or  
60 below the windows. The lower structures would be constructed on-site and have  
61 a standing seam metal roof. The gymnasium would be a metal pre-manufactured  
62 building with All Weather Insulated Panels (AWIP) roofing wrapping down the  
63 side walls of the gym. End walls of the gym would be öko skin with translucent  
64 windows above. Two siding colors would be used, sandstone and grey.

65 The City modular building, located in the rear southwestern corner, would be  
66 approximately 1,728 square feet in size and would be used for City recreational  
67 services. It would be a typical commercial modular painted in a color compatible  
68 with the Club.

69 Landscaping would preserve several large valley oak trees around the perimeter  
70 of the property, and install new trees, shrubs and perennials. The landscaped  
71 areas would also function as bio-swales.

72 Thirty parking spaces are proposed behind and to the north of the Club. A drop-  
73 off/pick-up area is proposed at the front of the building. The parking and drop-off  
74 area would be accessed from N. Oak Street via a 24-foot wide driveway entrance  
75 located near the northeast corner of the site. The drive aisle would extend along  
76 the north property line onto the Fairgrounds, which is County-owned land. The  
77 Club has been in discussions with the County to obtain the proper access  
78 easements to use this land for access and to use other areas for overflow  
79 parking, as discussed below.

80 In conjunction with the new drop-off area, the one-way exit would be configured  
81 to provide a standard tee intersection alignment at the intersection of N. Oak  
82 Street and Washington Street in order to reduce potential conflicts as users enter  
83 and exit the main entrance into the community park. Intersection improvements  
84 would include the installation of crosswalks to allow safe pedestrian access  
85 across the community park driveway.

86 Along N. Oak Street, a new 4-foot wide sidewalk and planter strip would be  
87 constructed as part of the project. The sidewalk would extend on-site from the  
88 new driveway entrance at the northeast corner of the site to the southern  
89 perimeter of the project site, where it will ultimately connect with the pedestrian  
90 path that leads to the community swimming pool facility and a future pathway  
91 along the perimeter of the park. The planter strip would enable the preservation  
92 of existing trees along N. Oak Street. The City is committed to installing a  
93 pathway along the park's perimeter from the Calistoga Family Apartments,  
94 located at 1715 Washington Street, to the site. An ADA ramp and curb returns  
95 would be provided to connect pedestrian crossings. These improvements are  
96 further discussed in the circulation section below.

## 97 **DISCUSSION**

### 98 **Land Use**

99 General Plan and Logvy Master Plan: The Club is consistent with the General  
100 Plan. The General Plan Land Use Diagram designates the project site as  
101 Public/Quasi-Public. As identified in the Land Use Element of the General Plan,  
102 uses allowed under the Public/Quasi-Public land use designation generally  
103 include public facilities such as parks and schools.

104 The City Council adopted Resolution 2015-142 approving revisions to the Logvy  
105 Master Plan. As revised, the project is consistent with the Master Plan.

106 Zoning: The project site is zoned P Public/Quasi-Public. The P District allows  
107 public parks, libraries, schools, community centers and other uses similar in  
108 nature upon determination of the Planning Commission. During the October 14,  
109 2015 Planning Commission meeting, the Planning Commission expressed that

110 the Club was similar to the list of conditionally-allowed uses in the P District.  
111 Furthermore, the Club has been designed to meet Zoning District development  
112 standards (i.e., setbacks and lot coverage). The following table compares the  
113 project's design with the development standards of the P District.

Development Standard per Zoning Code (P District)	Project	Compliant
Minimum front yard	20 feet	60 feet Yes
Minimum side yard	0 feet, unless adjacent to residential use or designation	feet Yes
Minimum rear yard	15 feet	feet Yes
Maximum floor area ratio	80%	33% Yes
Maximum building height	30 feet	31 feet Yes
Minimum setback for parking	20 feet – front yard 5 feet – side yard	30 feet 5 feet Yes

114

### 115 **Site Plan**

116 The site plan relies on acquiring an access and utilities easement from the  
117 County. City and county staff, along with input from the applicant, have prepared  
118 a draft access and utilities easement that will be executed prior to construction. A  
119 temporary construction easement has also been drafted to address the  
120 temporary use of the Fairgrounds for construction staging.

121 Subsequent to the October 14, 2015 Planning Commission meeting, the site plan  
122 was slightly modified to address some of the concerns/issues raised by staff, the  
123 Planning Commission and the public. A summary of the changes are, as follows:

- 124 • An additional drop-off/pick-up parking space has been added to the  
125 front loading lane;
- 126 • An enclosure has been added to screen the exterior kitchen door;
- 127 • Direct access from the City building to the community pool has been  
128 incorporated into the site design;
- 129 • Additional bike racks have been added.

130 With the site plan changes and suggested conditions of approval, the site layout  
131 should achieve the foreseeable needs of the Boys and Girls Club and the City.  
132 Additionally, the site plan provides an appropriate balance among vehicles,  
133 pedestrians & bicyclists and landscaping.

### 134 **Architectural Design**

135 The architectural design, as described above, is contemporary and uses durable  
136 materials. The design draws from the community pool's architecture as  
137 evidenced by the roof lines and horizontal siding. The architectural design also

138 mimics the metal buildings on the Fairgrounds property. The massing of the  
139 buildings are broken up by the varied roof lines and window placements and  
140 variations in the elevations. Staff believes that the architectural design will not  
141 create a monotonous feel because it is unique but understated such that the  
142 City's small-town character would be maintained.

### 143 **Circulation and Parking**

144 A traffic impact study<sup>1</sup> was prepared by W-trans to assess on- and off-site  
145 circulation and the adequacy of the proposed parking supply. The parking study  
146 assumed that most students who would use the site would either walk or ride  
147 their bikes after school. It was also assumed that during the p.m. peak hour,  
148 most parents would drive to pick up their children after work but before heading  
149 home. The intersections near the project (e.g., Washington Street/Oak Street and  
150 Washington Street/Berry Street) are operating with a Level of Service (LOS) A  
151 and based upon the project description they are expected to continue operating  
152 at a LOS A. As such, no off-site intersection improvements are warranted.

153 Regarding pedestrian connectivity, there are currently no sidewalks along the  
154 project site frontage. The closest existing sidewalks are on the east side of North  
155 Oak Street. As part of the project, the City intends to construct a pathway along  
156 the southwesterly side of Washington Street between the site and the Calistoga  
157 Family Apartments, which would provide a connection to existing facilities. The  
158 sidewalks would improve conditions that exist without the project, resulting in a  
159 benefit to pedestrian access and a complete connection that would allow children  
160 to walk to the site from Calistoga Elementary School, which is located on Berry  
161 Street two blocks south of Washington Street. However, a condition of approval  
162 is recommended to ensure that connectivity between on-site pedestrian facilities  
163 and the existing off-site network is consistent with the City's specifications. As  
164 such, a condition of approval is recommended requiring sidewalks along the  
165 project frontage on North Oak Street and crosswalks on the south leg of the  
166 Washington Street/N. Oak Street intersection.

167 Within the project site, the proposed pedestrian circulation system would provide  
168 patrons uninterrupted access from the parking stalls, loading zones, bicycle  
169 racks, and entrances to the facilities.

170 W-trans also assessed parking adequacy based on the projected parking activity  
171 for the proposed facility. According to the site plans, there would be about 19  
172 parking spaces for Boys and Girls Club purposes and an unloading zone with  
173 capacity for up to five vehicles. Six additional spaces on the site would be  
174 allocated to office purposes during typical weekday working hours. Parking would  
175 continue to be prohibited along the site's frontage on North Oak Street.

---

<sup>1</sup> The parking impact study prepared by W-trans was formatted as a traffic section of a California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Initial Study checklist. To reduce confusion the study is not included but available upon request.

176 The Zoning Code specifies parking requirements for land uses based on the  
177 maximum demand that could occur at any given time. The most similar land use  
178 to those described in Section 17.36.140 of the Zoning Code is "Places of  
179 Assembly." For this use, one space is required for each 5 seats or 10 feet of  
180 bench length, or for open seating, 1 space per 35 square feet of floor area. The  
181 largest single area within the building is the indoor basketball courts, which have  
182 an area of 4,836 square feet having fixed bench seating with assumed seating  
183 for up to 100 persons. Applying the 5-seat metric, the parking requirement would  
184 be about 20 spaces, or one more than is proposed in terms of dedicated parking.  
185 However, since such events would likely occur during periods when the space is  
186 closed to special events, it is anticipated that adequate parking would be  
187 available on-site through use of the supply normally reserved for the office uses.  
188 If events are expected to draw more than 100 attendees, it is likely that the  
189 parking demand would spill over to adjacent parking lots at the community  
190 swimming pool and the fairgrounds, if open.

191 Parking demand was also estimated using standard rates published by ITE in  
192 *Parking Generation*, 4<sup>th</sup> Edition, 2010. The parking demand of the project was  
193 estimated using the published standard rates for Recreational Community  
194 Center, Urban (ITE LU#495). The expected parking demand for the proposed  
195 project is 16 parking spaces, which is slightly less than the proposed parking  
196 supply. The proposed parking supply for the site would be adequate based on  
197 City municipal code and parking generation rates.

198 However, given the potential for parking to exceed the available supply when  
199 events drawing more than 100 persons are planned, a condition of approval has  
200 been incorporated that would require permission to use existing parking at either  
201 the community pool or the fairgrounds prior to the event.

202 Section 17.36.151 of the City's Municipal Code indicates that bicycle parking  
203 shall be provided at a rate of one bicycle space for every ten vehicle spaces at  
204 non-residential developments. However, given that the project is expected to  
205 serve primarily children who will not be driving to the site, it is recommended that  
206 substantially more than the minimum number required be provided. It is  
207 recommended that bicycle parking equivalent to the vehicle parking spaces be  
208 provided. The site plan indicates 19 bicycle parking spaces would be provided.  
209 Staff believes this is adequate to accommodate potential bicycle parking needs.

## 210 **Public Utilities and Grading**

211 The project would include connection to the City's water and wastewater  
212 systems, and potentially the City's reclaimed water system. The design and  
213 installation of the public utilities is subject to the review and approval of the Public  
214 Works Department. It should also be noted that on December 15, 2015, the City  
215 Council adopted Resolution 2015-144 authorizing the City Manager to execute a  
216 reimbursement agreement with the Club for preparation of plans, specifications  
217 and construction of infrastructure improvements for the City's building and

218 execution of easement agreements. Aside from the access and utilities  
219 easement, due to site constraints the Club building has a zero foot setback on  
220 the south side and to ensure compliance with the Building and Fire Codes, a ten  
221 foot wide “no build” easement is needed with the Washington Street right-of-way.

222 Substantial grading is proposed as a result of the recommendation of the project  
223 geologist. Due to existing soil conditions and the need to achieve adequate  
224 drainage, it is anticipated that the site will be excavated 3 feet below the existing  
225 grade to remove weak soils and replace them with structurally-compacted fill  
226 material. This level of grading is typical in areas where clay and weak porous soil  
227 exists. Staff is supportive of the grading provided particular trees are protected  
228 and erosion and sedimentation plans are in place. It is likely that the developers  
229 will submit grading plans in advance of the building plans.

### 230 **Trees**

231 There are 58 trees on the property and within the adjoining undeveloped  
232 Washington Street right-of-way. Of the total number of trees, 36 are protected  
233 trees per the City's Tree Ordinance (i.e., any tree >12” in diameter, any native  
234 oak >6”, or any valley oak). Although, the project arborist found that 22 of the 36  
235 protected trees would be removed by the project, 12 of the protected trees are  
236 predisposed to failure either because they are competing with neighboring trees  
237 or are showing signs of included bark (i.e., potential structural weakness).

238 In accordance with the City's Tree Ordinance, a tree protection and replacement  
239 plan will be required to be submitted to the City for review and approval to reduce  
240 the impact to the trees to be preserved during construction. The project arborist  
241 has suggested that 35 replacement trees be provided, as shown on the  
242 landscape plan.

### 243 **Resource Management**

244 The project proposes to connect to both the City's water and sewer service.  
245 Since the City's Standardized Use Table for the Resource Management System  
246 does not provide a projected water and wastewater demand for the proposed  
247 use, an engineered water and wastewater study was conducted indicating a  
248 water capacity needed for this project is 3.21 acre feet per year of water and 2.79  
249 acre feet per year of wastewater. It is foreseeable that the project would use the  
250 City's reclaimed water supply, which would reduce the overall demand on  
251 domestic water. As such, a reduced amount of water and wastewater may be  
252 obtained upon approval of the Public Works Department.

253 Per Section 19.02.050(I) CMC the project is exempt from obtaining a Growth  
254 Management Allocation provided the total allocation is allowed per the Resource  
255 Management System (RMS). Per Section 13.16.040 CMC, the City may allocate  
256 up to 8 acre-feet of water annually to non-residential projects. As of July 7, 2015  
257 report to City Council, 7.07 acre-feet were still available for allocation under the  
258 provisions of the RMS.



259

260 **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

261 The potential environmental impacts associated with the development of Logvy  
262 Park have been addressed as various phases were considered by the City. As part  
263 of its initial action to approve the Logvy Community Park Master Plan, the City  
264 Council adopted a Mitigated Negative Declaration and Mitigation Monitoring  
265 Program on May 18, 1999 (Resolution 99-27). The City Council subsequently  
266 adopted a Mitigated Negative Declaration (Resolution 2009-093) as part of its  
267 review of a 3,552-square foot Teen/Art Center building in 2009, which would have  
268 been located on the same site as the Boys and Girls Club facility. The Initial  
269 Study for that project addressed potentially-significant impacts to aesthetics, air  
270 quality, archaeological resources, biological resources, geology and soils, noise,  
271 public services, traffic and water quality.

272 The potential environmental impacts that could occur as a result of the proposed  
273 amendment to the Logvy Park Master Plan were considered to be substantially  
274 similar to those identified and addressed by earlier environmental reviews. As  
275 such, per Resolution 2015-142 an addendum to Mitigated Negative Declaration  
276 prepared for the Logvy Community Park Master Plan was adopted by the City  
277 Council pursuant to Section 15164 of the CEQA Guidelines on December 15,  
278 2015.

279 **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

280 An email dated December 3, 2015 was received from David Moon-Wainwright  
281 commenting on the architecture of the building.  
282

283 **RECOMMENDATION**

284 Approve use permit and design review with conditions  
285

286 **ATTACHMENTS**

- 287 1. Location Map
- 288 2. Draft resolution
- 289 3. Logvy Park Master Site Plan
- 290 4. Addendum to Mitigated Negative Declaration
- 291 5. Email dated December 3, 2015 from Mr. Moon-Wainwright
- 292 6. Proposed Project Narrative dated October 23, 2015
- 293 7. Arborist's Report dated November 24, 2015
- 294 8. Materials Board and Specification Sheets
- 295 9. Project Plans received December 9, 2015