



# City of Calistoga

## Planning Commission

### Agenda Item Summary

---

<b>DATE</b>	August 14, 2019
<b>ITEM</b>	Dr. Wilkinson's Hot Springs Resort Expansion and Site Modifications Use Permit and Design Review UP 2019-11 & DR 2019-6
<b>APPLICANT</b>	Robert Kline, LD Mud, LLC
<b>PROPERTY ADDRESS</b>	1507, 1539, 1547 Lincoln Avenue
<b>ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NOS.</b>	011-092-008, -009, -010, -011, -012, -013, -016, -017
<b>GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION</b>	Downtown Commercial Downtown Character Area - Historic District
<b>ZONING DISTRICT</b>	DC: Downtown Commercial
<b>STAFF CONTACT</b>	Zach Tusinger, Senior Planner
<b>POTENTIAL CONFLICTS</b>	None
<b>RECOMMENDATION</b>	Approve use permit and design review applications with conditions
<b>SUGGESTED MOTION</b>	"I move that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution approving Use Permit 2019-11 and Design Review 2019-6"

**CALISTOGA PLANNING COMMISSION**  
**STAFF REPORT**

**To:** Calistoga Planning Commission  
**From:** Zach Tusinger, Senior Planner  
**Meeting Date:** August 14, 2019  
**Subject:** **Dr. Wilkinson’s Hot Springs Resort Expansion and Site Modifications (UP 2019-11 and DR 2019-6)**

---

1 **ITEM**

2 Consideration of use permit (UP 2019-11) and design review (DR 2019-6) applications  
3 for a three-guest unit expansion project, the addition of alcoholic beverage and  
4 walkaway food sales, and a reconfiguration of the site layout and parking at the Dr.  
5 Wilkinson’s Hot Springs Resort at 1507, 1539 and 1547 Lincoln Avenue (APNs 011-  
6 092-008/-013, -016, -017).

7 **KEY ISSUES**

- 8 • Three additional guest rooms and the addition of a bar and walkway food  
9 element
- 10 • Reconfiguration of site layout
- 11 • Increased parking demand and supply
- 12 • Color and minor design modifications

13 **BACKGROUND**

14 Project Setting: The two-acre property is located within the DC: Downtown Commercial  
15 Zoning District at the northwest corner of the intersection of Lincoln Avenue and Fair  
16 Way. Cal-Mart is located to the south across Fair Way. Immediately across Lincoln  
17 Avenue is the former gliderport property. To the north are several vacant properties and  
18 the athletic fields behind the high school. Immediately adjacent to the resort’s west side is  
19 the Fair Way Manor mobile home park.

20 History: The resort began in 1952 as Dr. Wilkinson’s Hot Springs & Mud Baths. Over  
21 time, the property developed into a resort through the addition of guest rooms and other  
22 amenities. In 1981, approval was given for Wilkinson’s to add 13 guest units. Several  
23 years later in 1985, Wilkinson’s was approved for further modifications that included the  
24 demolition of several smaller buildings that predated the resort use. In their place, a  
25 swimming pool, laundry facility, and administration offices were added. Today, the  
26 resort features 42 guest units and a spa. The bulk of the resort is within a collection of  
27 mid-century buildings clustered at the south end of the property. Three additional  
28 buildings, including two former single-family homes fronting Lincoln Avenue, house  
29 guest units and complementary uses.

30 Chartres Lodging purchased the resort this year from the Wilkinson family with the  
31 intent of enhancing and modernizing the resort, while preserving its unique character.

32 **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

33 The use permit and design review applications request approval to allow the addition of  
34 three additional guest units, a bar, a walkaway food and beverage cafe, and a  
35 reconfiguration of the site that would allow for 16 additional parking spaces, for a total of  
36 51 spaces. The existing parking lot would be replaced with open space, while a new,  
37 larger parking area would be constructed at the rear of the property. As part of the  
38 parking modifications, the project's vehicular entrance would be moved from its current  
39 location to the north end of the resort's Lincoln Avenue frontage. The vehicular exit  
40 would remain at its current location on Fair Way.

41 The three new guest rooms would be created through the reuse and reconfiguration of  
42 existing multi-purpose and storage space and would not result in any new square  
43 footage. The lobby and hotel registration area would be relocated to existing office  
44 space closer to the new parking area, freeing up space for one of the additional guest  
45 rooms.



*Project from Lincoln Avenue*

46 One of the two former homes facing Lincoln Avenue (referred to herein as 1539 Lincoln)  
47 is planned to be repurposed into a “walkaway food” and beverage space that, while  
48 open to the public, would be marketed as primarily for resort guests. The project plans  
49 envision the addition of a wrap-around porch. At the rear of this building, a small,  
50 existing accessory structure would be repurposed into an outdoor beer and wine bar  
51 facing a large activity lawn, intended to primarily serve resort guests. Food and  
52 beverage operations would be from 9 AM to 10 PM. A total of 10 indoor seats and 12  
53 outdoor seats would be dedicated to these operations.

54 The other former single-family home at 1547 Lincoln is listed by the City as a Secondary  
55 Historic Resource. It is in generally good repair and has many outstanding Victorian  
56 architectural features. The application contemplates preserving the exterior of this

57 structure largely as is. It is currently used for guest accommodations and will continue to  
58 do so under the submitted plans.

59 Other than additional lot coverage created through the addition of the wrap-around  
60 porch on 1539 Lincoln Avenue, there would be no new square footage or lot coverage  
61 added as part of this project.

62 The plans show a unifying paint, landscaping, and lighting scheme for the whole resort  
63 property. A light gray and white color palette with dark bronze accents and dark gray  
64 roofing is proposed for all the buildings. New street trees are planned, along with trees  
65 along the western project boundary, between the proposed parking lot and the existing  
66 mobile home park.

## 67 **DISCUSSION**

### 68 **A. General Plan Consistency**

69 This project conforms to the existing Downtown Commercial land use designation as  
70 identified in the General Plan. Visitor accommodations are permitted in the Downtown  
71 Commercial land use designation if they conform to all relevant General Plan policies.  
72 The Downtown Commercial land use designation also provides for further commercial  
73 development focused on the downtown through Land Use Element Policy P1.1-2. The  
74 addition of the walkaway food business and bar furthers this policy.

75 The General Plan designates the project site as being within the Land Use Element's  
76 Downtown Character Area, at the north end of the Historic District sub-area. Relevant  
77 land use considerations include:

- 78 • *Encourage the establishment of land use "anchors" in the form of signature*  
79 *developments at either end of the character area.*
- 80 • *Encourage greater building density/intensity and allow required parking to be*  
81 *located on-site in shared parking spaces.*
- 82 • *Support renovation of Doctor Wilkinson's Hot Springs Resort. Renovations*  
83 *should maintain its signature thermal hot springs resort status and be respectful*  
84 *of its historic presence in town. Ground level retail-commercial active uses may*  
85 *be provided along its street frontages.*
- 86 • *Redevelopment of Doctor Wilkinson's Hot Springs Resort and the gliderport*  
87 *properties should collectively form an "anchor" at the northern end of the Historic*  
88 *District. Along each property's Lincoln Avenue frontage, development should be*  
89 *comparable in scale and mutually supportive in use.*

90 The planned improvements to the resort are in accordance with the above  
91 considerations pertaining to the Historic District sub-area. They are also consistent with  
92 applicable Community Identity Element and Urban Design Plan policies by adding a  
93 porch to one of the project buildings, enhancing the pedestrian environment by adding  
94 street trees, and by providing a non-formula restaurant and bar.

95 Historic Resources: Land Use Element Policy P.3.1-1 provides that “the preservation of  
 96 historic properties shall be encouraged through restoration, sensitive renovation, and  
 97 adaptive reuse.” While the bulk of the resort is not considered historic, the mid-century  
 98 architecture is planned to be preserved and enhanced under the proposed plan. As  
 99 discussed above, the applicant plans to maintain the historic character of the 1547  
 100 Lincoln Avenue building and sensitively restore it.

101 The 1539 Lincoln Avenue structure (identified in the project submittal as “Edy’s  
 102 Arthouse”) is included in Napa County’s historic inventory. The proposed changes to the  
 103 structure, including the addition of a wrap-around porch, seem sensitive and appropriate  
 104 to its character. However, due to its listed status, staff recommends that the approvals  
 105 pertaining to this structure be specifically deferred until after a Current Conditions  
 106 Assessment and Standards Report is prepared for the property. A condition of approval  
 107 is included that approves the design for 1539 Lincoln conceptually, but directs staff to  
 108 review the final design administratively after the assessment is complete and plans  
 109 modified accordingly.

110 **B. Zoning Compliance**

111 Chapter 17.21 of the Zoning Ordinance describes the development standards and the  
 112 uses permitted in the DC Zoning District where the project site is located. Visitor  
 113 accommodations, alcohol sales, and walkaway businesses are conditionally permitted  
 114 in the DC District.

Applicable Development Standards		Proposed Development
Minimum Front Yard Setback	0 feet	0 feet
Minimum Interior Side Yard Setback	5 feet when abutting a residential district	>10 feet
Minimum Street Side Yard Setback	0 feet	0 feet
Minimum Rear Yard Setback	0 feet	>10 feet
Building Height	25 feet when abutting a residential district	25 feet
Floor Area Ratio (FAR)	2.0	0.4
Lot Coverage	80%	39%

115 As shown in the table above, the project is consistent with all DC District development  
 116 standards.

117 Parking: In its current configuration, with 35 parking spaces servicing 42 guest rooms  
 118 and a spa, the resort is under-parked per the Zoning Code. Due to relatively low past  
 119 occupancy rates, and the large amount of available street parking, this has typically not  
 120 been a concern. As part of the requested entitlements, the resort is required to come  
 121 into conformance with the parking requirements found in the Zoning Code. Based on all

122 the current and planned additional uses, the resort would require 74 off-street spaces  
123 (see Table 1 in the Parking Study which is included as Attachment 4). However, under  
124 CMC 17.36.040, the joint utilization of spaces among uses is allowed if it can be shown  
125 that the parking demands for the uses occur at different times.

126 The applicant commissioned a parking study that shows peak parking demand as being  
127 51 total spaces. Staff has reviewed the study and agrees with its conclusions. The plan  
128 includes 51 off-street parking spaces, plus two additional spaces for hotel registration.  
129 Due to the existing configuration of buildings on the site, it would be difficult to  
130 incorporate additional off-street spaces beyond this amount. The new parking lot will be  
131 tucked behind the existing building and be screened by ample fencing and landscaping.  
132 An existing fence screens the site from the adjacent mobile home park and would  
133 remain in place.

134 The project's proposed bicycle parking plan also meets the minimum Zoning Code  
135 standards.

### 136 **C. Aesthetics**

137 Design: The proposed design modifications are intended to enhance and unify the  
138 diverse architectural styles and elements found in the resort complex. The proposed  
139 colors (white and gray with dark trim) are complementary to other buildings in the area.  
140 The modifications would enhance the existing buildings and provide new vibrancy to  
141 one of Calistoga's most unique and historic hot springs resorts. The removal of the  
142 street-facing door at the current registration area is a relatively minor physical change  
143 necessary for that space's conversion into a guest room. The other minor modifications,  
144 such as the added wraparound porch and color updates across the various buildings  
145 would be in a manner that would comply with the policy direction of the General Plan.  
146 The relocation of the parking lot to the rear of the property will improve the appearance  
147 of the resort from the street.

148 Landscaping: The project's preliminary landscape plan shows the addition of street  
149 trees and a wide variety of native, drought-tolerant landscaping along the Lincoln  
150 Avenue frontage and throughout the site. The landscaping will provide shade and create  
151 visual interest along an otherwise bland section of Lincoln Avenue. The planned  
152 landscape will also serve to unify the disparate elements of the resort property.

153 Eighteen trees that are protected by the Calistoga Municipal Code due to their size  
154 would be removed and replaced at a 3:1 ratio. Only one of these is a native species and  
155 is identified in the arborist report as a coast live oak with "fair" structure due to co-  
156 dominant trunks.

### 157 **D. Resource Management**

158 The water and wastewater study prepared by Summit Engineering shows that usage at  
159 the property will remain under its current water and wastewater baseline. Based on this  
160 study, it is not expected that any additional allocations will have to be purchased by the  
161 applicant for this project.

162

163 **FINDINGS**

164 To reduce repetition, all necessary findings to approve the two applications are  
165 contained in the attached resolution.

166 **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

167 The applicant conducted a neighborhood outreach meeting regarding the project at the  
168 Calistoga Community Center on July 18, 2019. As of the writing of this report, staff has  
169 not received any written correspondence regarding this matter.

170 **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

171 Staff has determined that the proposed project is Categorically Exempt from the  
172 requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section  
173 15332 (In-fill Development Projects) of the CEQA Guidelines. No significant traffic  
174 impacts are expected from the project, and the property can be adequately served by  
175 city utilities.

176 **RECOMMENDATION**

177 Approve the use permit and design review applications with conditions.

**ATTACHMENTS**

1. Draft Resolution and Conditions of Approval
2. Vicinity Map
3. Project Description
4. Parking Study by Summit Engineering
5. Arborist Report
6. Project Plans