



City of Calistoga

Planning Commission

Agenda Item Summary

DATE	February 26, 2020
ITEM	Use Permit and Design Review UP 2018-12 & DR 2018-9
APPLICANT	David Patel
PROPERTY ADDRESS	1807 Foothill Boulevard
ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NO.	011-290-046
GENERAL PLAN DESIGNATION	Low Density Residential Foothill Character Area Overlay
ZONING DISTRICT	R-1-10: One-Family Residential
STAFF CONTACT	Zach Tusinger, Senior Planner
POTENTIAL CONFLICTS	Commissioner Cooper
RECOMMENDATION	Consider approving use permit and design review applications with conditions
SUGGESTED MOTION	"I move that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution approving Use Permit 2018-12 and Design Review 2018-9 at 1807 Foothill Boulevard."

**CALISTOGA PLANNING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT**

To: Calistoga Planning Commission
From: Zach Tusinger, Senior Planner
Meeting Date: February 26, 2020
Subject: **Aurora Park Cottages
Use Permit UP 2018-12 and Design Review DR 2018-9
1415 Foothill Boulevard**

ITEM

Consideration of use permit (UP 2018-12) and design review (DR 2018-9) applications for a three-guest unit expansion project and associated on-site improvements at the Aurora Park Cottages at 1807 Foothill Boulevard.

KEY ISSUES

- A net gain of three guest units (for a total of ten) at an existing bed & breakfast inn in the R-1-10 Zoning District
- Conversion of existing two-bedroom guest cottage to front office and manager's unit (relocating it from the adjacent property)
- Architectural compatibility with existing structures

BACKGROUND

The subject 1.44-acre property is located on the south side of Foothill Boulevard between High Street and Lerner Drive, and slopes gently towards the road. This side of Foothill Boulevard between Petrified Forest Road and Lincoln Avenue is predominantly developed with hillside residential uses and several bed and breakfast facilities of good architectural character, including The Chanric Inn next door. On the opposite side of Foothill Boulevard, the area consists primarily of single-family residential uses. The seven existing cottages are accessed via a private drive that also serves several uphill single-family residences.

The guest cottages on the property have been in use as visitor



Aurora Park Cottages

31 accommodations since the 1950s. In 1998, a proposal to substantially alter the Aurora
32 Park Cottages was approved by the City, and included architectural changes, enlarged
33 structures and extensive landscaping. The project was ultimately abandoned by a
34 subsequent owner, and in 1999 a substantially less-comprehensive plan for exterior
35 changes was approved. Under new ownership, a use permit was approved in 2015
36 allowing for a seventh guest unit and the elimination of the onsite owner/manager
37 residence, which was relocated to the adjoining parcel.

38 **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

39 The use permit and design review applications request approval for the construction of
40 four new guest cottages, one of which would be designated as an accessible unit. The
41 single-story structures would be located on either side of a large oak, which would be
42 preserved. One of the existing guest cottages would no longer be used as a visitor
43 accommodation, but instead be expanded and converted to use as a front office and
44 manager's residence. This would result in a net gain of three guest units, for a total of
45 10. Six new parking spaces, including one ADA space, would be added for a total of 14
46 parking spaces.

47 The proposed new structures would be somewhat larger than the existing cottages (600
48 square feet versus 400 square feet) but will otherwise feature very similar architectural
49 features (wood siding, peaked roofs, exposed rafters with knee-braces, and small front-
50 facing decks). The site arrangement of the new cottages would continue the linear
51 layout of the buildings on the property.

52 **ANALYSIS**

53 **A. General Plan Consistency**

54 Land Use Element: The General Plan designation for the property is Low Density
55 Residential, which allows bed and breakfast establishments. The Foothill Character
56 Area overlay, which also applies to the property, supports a limited number of bed and
57 breakfast uses. Although the number of guest units would be increasing on the property,
58 the total number of establishments in the community would remain the same. Allowing
59 three additional guest units would be an allowed use in the land use designation. The
60 larger size of the planned guest cottages is in keeping with growing trends in the
61 industry.

62 Economic Development: Allowing this bed and breakfast expansion would be
63 consistent with General Plan Objective ED-1.1, which encourages the City to support
64 the lodging industry.

65 **B. Zoning Compliance**

66 The property is located within the R-1-10: One-Family Residential Zoning District. Bed
67 and breakfast inns and facilities are a conditionally-permitted use within this district.
68 CMC Chapter 17.35 delineates the specific bed and breakfast regulations.

69 The applicant has requested an exception in order to add three guest units, for a total of
70 10. Pursuant to CMC Section 17.35.040(C)(4) an exception may be granted to allow the

71 establishment of up to 10 rental units. Prior to approval of the exception, the Planning
72 Commission must consider the following special circumstances:

- 73 a. A bed and breakfast inn and facility or other visitor accommodation located on
74 the property was authorized by the City on or before January 1, 2010; and
- 75 b. The property is located within an R-1-10 zone; and
- 76 c. The property is established with no more than 10 rental units; and
- 77 d. The lot size exceeds 10,000 square feet.

78 The Aurora Park Cottages were established prior to January 1, 2010 and the 1.44-acre
79 property is located within the R-1-10 Zoning District. Upon approval of this permit, the
80 property would have 10 guest units (the maximum allowed). The proposal to operate a
81 10-unit bed and breakfast at this location meets the purpose and intent of the Ordinance
82 and it can be found to meet the special circumstances to allow the expanded use.

83 As shown in the table below, the project is also consistent with all R-1-10 Zoning District
84 development standards.

Applicable R-1-10 Development Standards		Proposed Development
Minimum Front Yard Setback	20 feet	20 feet
Minimum Side Yard Setback	5 feet	>5 feet
Minimum Rear Yard Setback	20 feet	>20 feet
Building Height	25 feet	approx. 15 feet
Parking	1 space per room, plus two for an onsite manager	14 spaces are provided

85 **C. Aesthetics**

86 The proposed designs of the new cottages and the addition to create the guest
87 services/manager's residence mirror the architectural style, colors, and elements of the
88 existing buildings on the property. Wood siding, trim, and asphalt shingle roofing would
89 all be designed to match the current materials of the existing cottages. Similarly, the
90 new cottages would be painted with light yellow siding and white trim to match the
91 existing units. Each cottage would feature a deck on the front. The addition of the four
92 proposed structures would enhance the existing bed and breakfast inn. No trees will be
93 removed, and the project is designed around two large existing oak trees. The existing
94 landscape scheme would be continued to the new cottages.

95 **PUBLIC COMMENTS**

96 As of February 14, 2020, staff has received two letters of concern and opposition from
97 neighbors. Those letters have been forwarded to the Planning Commission.

99 **ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW**

100 Staff has determined that the proposed project is Categorically Exempt from the
101 requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to Section
102 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures) of the CEQA Guidelines.

103 **FINDINGS**

104 To reduce repetition, all the necessary findings to approve the subject applications are
105 contained in the attached Resolution.

106 **RECOMMENDATION**

107 Based on the information provided, staff recommends approval of the use permit and
108 design review applications with conditions

ATTACHMENTS

1. Draft Resolution and Conditions of Approval
2. Vicinity map
3. Project description
4. Project plans