

17.41.050 Design Review Findings
RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES
Multi-Family Residential

Guideline	Meets	Does Not Meet	Does not Apply	Findings (How proposal meets intent of guideline)
A. SITING				
1. Views. Views (particularly of the palisades and hillsides), and on-site mature trees and other natural amenities shall be preserved and incorporated into development proposals whenever possible.	X			Views not blocked. Arborist report and tree removal permit required to support tree removal as conditioned.
2. Privacy. Buildings should be oriented to promote privacy to the greatest extent possible.	X			Orientation follows shape of the lot. Second floor, outdoor screening elements included as conditioned.
3. Building Clusters. Large projects should be broken up into clusters of structures.			X	Not applicable.
4. Circulation. Parking and vehicular circulation should be separate from pedestrian circulation	X			Driveway provided for vehicles. Separate walkways leading to home entries.
B. BUILDING FORMS & MASSING				
1. Adjacency. The scale and mass of new infill buildings should be reduced by stepping down the building height towards adjacent smaller structures.	X			Required setbacks are met or exceeded, including a larger setback than required (nearly three additional feet) on the side adjacent to the northern one story residence to effectively be the “step down” by stepping back from the required setback distance. There is not much ground floor area on this side for a step down in design due to the interior tuck-under parking, open space, and the driveway occupying the ground level.
2. Height Variability. Building heights should be varied to give the appearance of a collection of smaller structures.	X			Dormers provide variation in roof plane.
3. Step Down. Consideration should be given to stepping back upper stories to reduce the scale of facades that face a street, common space and adjacent residential structures			X	Guideline is for consideration to be given. No stepbacks end up in the design, however the design is similar in general form to Wineridge Apts (1714 Washington) and Calistoga Family Apts (1715 Washington). Other nearby multifamily 1411 Fourth St and Canary Apts (1511 Fairway) do not have stepbacks.
4. Details. The perceived height and bulk of multi-story buildings should be reduced by dividing the building mass into smaller-scale components and adding details such as projecting eaves, dormers and balconies. The use of awnings, moldings, pilasters and comparable architectural embellishments are also encouraged when functional and/or consistent with the building’s architecture.	X			Includes eaves, dormers, balconies, awnings.

Guideline	Meets	Does Not Meet	Does not Apply	Findings (How proposal meets intent of guideline)
C. BUILDING ARTICULATION				
1. Setback. Buildings that are oriented to a street or interior drive should have varying setbacks to provide visual interest.	X			Varying setbacks used at front porches and entries.
2. Facades. All facades of a building should be articulated and incorporate variation in massing, roof forms and wall planes, as well as surface articulation. While they do not need to be identical, there should be a sense of overall architectural continuity.	X			Variations in roof and wall planes. Architectural continuity provided.
3. Blank Walls. Extensive, unarticulated exterior walls are discouraged. Massing offsets, varied textures, openings, recesses and design accents are encouraged to provide visual interest.	X			Offsets, openings, and recesses provided on second floor.
4. Interest. Architectural elements that add visual interest, scale and character, such as balconies, trellises, recessed windows, overhangs and porches are strongly encouraged.	X			Balconies, overhangs, and porches provided.
5. Projections. Balconies should be recessed from the building face and use appropriate screening measures, such as solid walls or landscaping, to protect the privacy of users and residents of neighboring units. The supports for overhanging upper floors or decks shall be designed to provide a substantial appearance integrated with the overall design of the building.	X			One balcony recessed; screening feature provided for another balcony.
6. Visual Interest. The use of vertical elements such as towers may be used to contrast with the predominant horizontal massing and provide visual interest.	X			Board and batten vertical details provided.
7. The design of an infill project in a potential historic district, as identified in the General Plan, should be compatible with any prevailing architectural styles and details in the neighborhood.			X	Not historic.
8. Accessory buildings, such as management offices, storage facilities, recreational facilities and pool equipment buildings shall be designed as an integral part of a project. They shall be similar in material, color, and detail to the principal buildings of a development.			X	No accessory building.
D. ROOFS				

Guideline	Meets	Does Not Meet	Does not Apply	Findings (How proposal meets intent of guideline)
1. The use of traditional roof forms such as gables, hips and dormers is encouraged. The use of mansard and flat roofs without a decorative cornice are strongly discouraged.	X			Gabled roof
2. Variation in ridgeline height and alignment is encouraged.			X	Guideline is an encouragement to apply the feature. Ridgeline ends up as a consistent height in the design, but dormers are used for roof plane height variations.
3. Roof overhangs should be sized appropriately for the desired architectural style. Where applicable to the architectural style, roof eaves should extend a minimum of 12 inches from the primary wall surface to enhance shadow lines and articulation of surfaces.	X			2-foot eaves
4. Flat carport roofs are prohibited.			X	No flat roof carports.
E. WINDOWS, DOORS & ENTRIES				
1. Window types, materials, shapes and proportions should complement the architectural style of the building.	X			Rectangular windows are in proportion to and complement the style.
2. Windows should be articulated with sills, trim, shutters or awnings that are authentic to the architectural style of the structure. Where architecturally appropriate, they may be inset from structure walls to create shade and shadow detail.	X			Trim used. Awnings over some windows.
3. In order to enhance privacy, windows shall not be positioned directly opposite an adjacent residence's windows.	X			Windows not directly opposite other windows.
4. The main entrance to a unit should be clearly identifiable and should be articulated with functionally- and architecturally-appropriate projecting or recessed forms so as to create a sheltered landing.	X			Main entrances clearly visible from Fourth Street
5. Entries should be in proportion to the building façade as a whole.	X			Entries with porches and awnings are proportional to the façade.
F. BUILDING MATERIALS, FINISHES & COLORS				
1. Materials, finishes and colors should be consistent with the desired architectural style and sensitive to any prevailing pattern in the vicinity.	X			Hardie panel siding and brown color to complement wood style siding in surroundings. The block does not have a prevailing pattern or styles.
2. Compatible accent colors should be used to enhance important architectural elements and details.			X	Compatible colors used in design.
3. Bright or intense colors should be used very sparingly, and shall typically be reserved for more refined or delicate detailing.			X	No bright colors.

Guideline	Meets	Does Not Meet	Does not Apply	Findings (How proposal meets intent of guideline)
4. Exterior materials should reflect those that have traditionally been used in Calistoga, including wood, stone and stucco. Reflective materials are prohibited.	X			Hardie panel siding and brown color to complement wood style.
5. Stairways shall be constructed of durable materials that are compatible with the design of the primary structure. Prefabricated metal stairs are strongly discouraged.	X			Durable materials used (concrete/wood).
6. Surface detailing should not serve as a substitute for well-integrated and distinctive massing.	X			Variations in wall plane for massing detail.
G. CIRCULATION				
1. Multi-family projects should incorporate pedestrian connections to adjoining residential, commercial, public and other compatible land use facilities.			X	Walkways connecting units to sidewalk. No other compatible facilities to connect to.
2. Cross circulation between vehicles and pedestrians shall be minimized. Clearly-marked walkways should be provided from parking areas to the main entrances of buildings.	X			Walkways and driveways are distinct. Walkway connection available between parking area and units.
3. Walkways should be located to minimize the impact of pedestrians on the privacy of nearby residences or private open space. Walkways should not be sited immediately adjacent to a building and should be separated with a landscaped planting area.	X			Walkways provided for each unit through landscaped front yard.
H. PARKING				
1. Parking areas should be located within a project's interior and not along street frontages.	X			Parking in the interior.
2. Carports and tuck-under parking should not be visible from public streets.	X			Not visible.
3. Guest parking may be visible from public streets.			X	No guest parking.
4. Garage doors should be articulated with trellises, panels and/or windows to break up their large planes.			X	No garage door.
5. The width of driveways as well as cuts at the curb shall be as narrow as possible.	X			Driveway width is not unnecessarily wide. Would meet PW standards.
I. LANDSCAPING				
1. A variety of height, textures and colors should be used in a project's landscape palette.	X			Variety shown in landscape plan.
2. A combination of trees, shrubs and ground cover should be incorporated into landscaping plans.	X			Variety shown in landscape plan.
3. Plantings shall be used to soften building lines. Landscaping around building peri-meters is encouraged.	X			Plants and trees planted in front of the building.

Guideline	Meets	Does Not Meet	Does not Apply	Findings (How proposal meets intent of guideline)
4. New and rehabilitated landscaping shall comply with the State of California Model Water-Efficient Ordinance, where applicable.	X			Required in BP process.
5. Plantings shall not interfere with lighting, clear line of sight or access to emergency equipment or utilities (e.g., fire hydrants, fire alarm boxes, water meters).	X			Condition included for tree clearance and vegetation height
6. Landscaping shall be protected from vehicular and pedestrian encroachment by raised planting surfaces and curbs.	X			Curbs and raised features used.
7. Gravel, bark and artificial turf is not allowed as a substitute for plant materials.			X	These materials do not substitute plant materials.
8. Trees should be used to create canopies and shade, especially along walkways, in parking areas and open space areas.	X			Trees planted in the front.
9. Trees and large shrubs shall not be planted under overhead lines or over underground infrastructure if growth may interfere with public utilities.	X			Landscaping plan prepared by licensed landscape architect for appropriate planting. Work in ROW requires an encroachment permit for further review.
10. When selecting tree species, consideration should be given to potential maintenance issues, nearby pedestrian activities and public rights-of-way.	X			Landscaping plan prepared by licensed landscape architect for appropriate planting. Work in ROW requires an encroachment permit for further review.
11. Trees and shrubs should be located and spaced to allow for mature and long-term growth.	X			Landscaping plan prepared by licensed landscape architect for appropriate planting. Work in ROW requires an encroachment permit for further review.
12. Potential root problems caused by trees and shrubs in or adjacent to the public right of way shall be avoided by careful selection and planting procedures. Root barriers shall be required for any tree placed where roots could disrupt adjacent paving or curb surfaces.	X			Landscaping plan prepared by licensed landscape architect for appropriate planting. Work in ROW requires an encroachment permit for further review.
J. COMMUNITY FACILITIES				
1. Buildings should be oriented to create courtyards and open space areas.			X	Open space provided, but not necessarily from building orientation creating these spaces.
2. Community features such as plazas, recreational areas, community gardens and other gathering places shall be included whenever possible.			X	Community features not applicable.
3. Common open space areas should be sheltered from the noise and traffic of adjacent streets and incompatible uses.			X	No common open space.
4. Children's play areas should be as publicly visible as possible.			X	No play area.

Guideline	Meets	Does Not Meet	Does not Apply	Findings (How proposal meets intent of guideline)
K. LIGHTING				
1. The design of exterior lighting fixtures should complement that of the residences in style and finish.			X	Details not yet identified. Proposed details in BP plans.
2. Lighting shall be arranged to provide safety and security for residents and visitors but prevent direct glare of illumination onto adjacent units.	X			COA to prevent light impacts.
3. Pedestrian-scaled lighting shall be located along all pedestrian routes of travel.			X	Building code requirements for lighting reviewed at BP.
4. Lighting sources shall be screened from off-site view.	X			COA for shielded lighting.
5. Lighting levels shall be the minimum necessary to provide safety and security while avoiding glare, light trespass and "sky glow."	X			COA for shielded lighting.
L. WALLS & FENCES				
1. Walls should be constructed of natural materials such as stone, wood, flagstone, or masonry with an architectural finish.			X	No walls.
2. The following fencing materials are not allowed: chain link, barbed wire, razor wire and unfinished precision masonry block.	X			Not used.
3. Vinyl and other manufactured fencing materials are acceptable if the overall appearance appears natural.			X	Not used.
4. Wrought iron fencing should be powder-coated to reduce the potential for rust.			X	Not used.
5. The face of retaining walls that are more than four feet in height and visible to the general public should be textured to provide visual relief.			X	No walls.
6. Walls visible to the general public, such as project perimeter walls, should be enhanced to provide visual relief and soften their appearance through techniques such as textures, staggered setbacks, wall inserts, decorative columns or pilasters and variation in height, in conjunction with landscaping.			X	No walls.
7. Stucco and plaster walls should be capped with a different material to give them a finished appearance.			X	No walls.
8. Walls should be constructed as low as possible while still performing screening, noise attenuation and security functions.			X	No walls.

Guideline	Meets	Does Not Meet	Does not Apply	Findings (How proposal meets intent of guideline)
9. At street or driveway corners, the area in front of fencing should be landscaped, and plantings or walls shall allow a clear line of sight.	X			Landscaping provided and conditioned to maintain tree clearance and landscaping height.
10. Walls on sloping terrain should be stepped to follow the terrain.			X	No walls.
M. UTILITIES				
1. All mechanical equipment shall be suitably screened or placed in locations that are not viewable from residences, common areas or the street. All screening devices shall be compatible with the architecture and color of the adjacent buildings.			X	No equipment identified. Proposed equipment would require review in BP process.
N. TRASH ENCLOSURES				
1. Trash enclosures should be located in non-conspicuous areas, well screened with landscaping, and designed so as to protect adjacent uses from noise and odors.	X			Located in the rear of the lot.
2. Trash enclosures shall be constructed of materials and finishes that complement those of the primary building. Gates shall be solid metal.			X	Details not yet identified. Proposed details in BP plans.
3. Trash enclosures shall be sized to accommodate recycling, yard waste and trash containers.	X			Sized to accommodate receptacles for units.
O. MAILBOXES				
1. Mailboxes shall be located in highly visible, heavily-traveled areas for convenience, to allow for casual social interaction and to promote safety.			X	Details not identified. There may not be a need for a common space with mailboxes due to the small scope of development.
2. Trash and recycling receptacles shall be provided adjacent to the mailboxes.			X	Receptacles next to mailboxes may not be required as mailboxes could be provided in front of each unit instead of in a common area.