

CALISTOGA PLANNING COMMISSION
STAFF REPORT

TO: Calistoga Planning Commission
FROM: Jeff Mitchem, Planning & Building Director
MEETING DATE: January 25, 2023
SUBJECT: **Design Review for 2008 Grant Street (DR 2021-3)**

ITEM

Consideration of a design review application for 15 single-family residences on a 5.84-acre site at 2008 Grant Street (APN 011-010-033). Refer to **Attachment 1** for Draft Resolution.

BACKGROUND

Following is an overview of recent relevant case history for the subject case:

- February 2021, DeNova Homes, Inc. (DHI), made applications for a Vesting Tentative Map and Design Review for a 15-lot subdivision. DHI also submitted with the City applications the State Housing and Community Development (HCD) “SB330” application. City staff determined the applications to be complete on May 7, 2021.
- February 7, 2022 to March 8, 2022. The City prepared an Environmental Checklist, Initial Study and Mitigated Negative Declaration (IS/MND) which were posted and advertised to provide the CEQA-mandated 30-day public review period.
- March 23, 2022, Planning Commission public hearing. No action was taken on the applications at that time and the hearing was continued to a publicly-noticed Planning Commission work session.
- April 27, 2022. Prior to the hearing, DHI requested that the Design Review application (for review of the proposed homes), be deferred until DHI and the Commission had reached consensus regarding revisions to address the Commission’s concerns with the vesting tentative map, grading and utility plans. DHI made modifications to the Vesting Tentative Map, grading and utility plans, and landscape plans, to address certain concerns of the Planning Commission and adjacent neighbors.
- June 22, 2022, Planning Commission approved a Tentative Map application (TM 2021-1 and a Mitigated Negative Declaration) to allow subdivision of the site to create 15 residential lots. Refer to **Attachment 2** for the Staff Report and Resolution for TM 2021-1.

The property is under the Medium Density Residential General Plan Land Use Designation, which allows for the development of 4 to 10 units per acre. The project is

located in the R-1 (One-Family Residential) zoning district, which permits single-family dwellings.

Surrounding uses include single-family residential to the east, west, and south; the Calistoga Seventh Day Adventist Church to the southwest; and single-family residential and a vacant lot to the north. Properties east, west, and south of the site share its Medium Density Residential General Plan Land Use Designation and R-1 zoning district. Properties to the north have a Low-Density Residential General Plan Land Use Designation and R-1-10-PD (One-Family Residential, Planned Development) zoning district.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Design Review, prescribed by CMC 17.41, is the necessary land use entitlement to allow construction of 15 single-family residences (see **Attachment 3** for 2008 Grant Street Project Plans).

Project Components

Approved under previous entitlement (TM 2021-1, Mitigated Negative Declaration), are 15 single-family lots (Lots 1-15), landscaped open space (Parcel D), and landscaped bio-retention area (Parcel E) would comprise approximately 3.82 acres. The private street extension of Redwood Avenue would be approximately 1.01 acres (Parcel A). The area around the existing drainage channel would remain as undeveloped open space totaling approximately 1.01 acres (Parcels B, C, and F). Key project components previously approved are:

- **Tree Removal Permit provisions.** The project includes the removal of trees onsite to accommodate the proposed development. The site contains a total of 151 trees, including black walnut, coast live oak, coast redwood, English walnut, Oregon ash, pecan, and valley oak. Under the proposed project, 46 trees would be preserved, and 105 trees would be removed, including 3 non-protected trees and 102 protected trees. Onsite tree replacement was approved as part of the landscaping plan and would involve replanting 112 native species along with the drainage feature and replanting 198 trees throughout the project site, including native and ornamental species. Additionally, the project would contribute to the planting of 75 trees off-site or an equivalent monetary fee paid to the City for offsite planting.
- **Grading & Drainage.** Site development would involve grading and installation of new infrastructure while preserving the existing drainage channel feature. The site modifications were designed to meet current engineering standards to manage stormwater onsite and avoid onsite flooding. New development is subject to requirements to demonstrate that stormwater discharge flow rates would not exceed pre-project conditions and that the site has capacity to manage stormwater collected onsite. The approved grading plan modifies the existing topography to direct runoff to site areas and to infrastructure designed to accommodate stormwater flows. Maintenance of the drainage channel and correction of any

potential erosion issues near the drainage were included as conditions of approval of the Vesting Tentative Map.

- **Landscaping.** Proposed landscaping consists of new trees and vegetation in landscaped planting strips, residential yards, and the bio-retention area, as well as preservation of some trees where possible. The landscaping strips would be planted with Chinese Pistache street trees. Small specimen and accent trees planted in the front and backyards of residences include Western Redbud, Crape Myrtle, Saratoga Laurel, and Purple Leaf Plum trees. California Buckeye, Coast Live Oak, and Valley Oak are larger specimen trees that would be planted on some residential parcels and generally around the perimeter of the bio-retention area. A variety of shrubs, groundcover, and bioretention plants would be planted onsite, as shown in the landscape plan approved with the Vesting Tentative Map.
- **Fencing** is proposed around the perimeter of the site. Six-foot tall wood fences provide separation between the site and adjacent properties along the east, west, and south property lines. Fences would be installed on top of retaining walls on the north side of the property, comprising a solid wood good neighbor fence design with a central segment featuring a wood and wire fence design. Additional solid and mesh fencing separate from the property's perimeter fencing is proposed in certain lots adjacent to the drainage feature.

Architectural Design

Under review herein, the proposal features 15 single-family residences on the previously approved lots (lots 1-15). During relevant case history (cited above), the proposed architectural design was preliminarily reviewed and commented upon by the public and Planning Commission. The following summarizes the key comments and changes made in response:

- **Height.** During all three of the previous hearings, Commissioners and neighbors indicated a concern with the proposed two-story homes. DHI voluntarily agreed to limit the height of homes to a single-story-style, except allowing for limited "pop-ups" to a second story with windows oriented away from the adjacent neighbors to the rear of the proposed homes. DHI explained that a "pop-up" is a limited second-level area and would not include windows looking into the rear yard to provide the feeling and style of a single-story-home to the surrounding neighbors. The Commission indicated at this third hearing that it supported the use of such 2-story "pop-ups" and promoted the inclusion of at least ten (10) ADUs or "Junior" ADUs (less than 500 square feet).
- **ADUs.** Some Commissioners and Planning staff indicated their desire that the proposed homes include accessory dwelling units (ADUs), to provide alternate and additional housing opportunities. Two of the house plans include an ADU, thus meeting the Commission's desires for 10 ADUs in addition to the 15 "main" houses.
- **Massing.** In comparison with the originally proposed subdivision, all lots along the "eastern" property line were reduced in width and area, and the retaining wall was

moved into the lot from the rear property line, thus also reducing the length, the buildable area and the usable rear yard area of Lots 6 - 14.

- **Front Porches.** Commission and City staff indicated a strong preference that the home designs include porches. Large porches are included in the Plans 1 and 3 designs
- **Covered Outdoor Space.** Each home plan also includes an optional back yard covered patio area (“California room”).
- **Design Coherency.** Initial comments conveyed concern related to excessive design character variety (Farmhouse, Spanish, Craftsman, Italianate, etc.). DHI has simplified the design palate into three different house plans. Each of the three plans will be used five (5) times on the 15 lots. Each house plan has 2 different elevation styles, although there are three (3) total proposed elevation styles: Bungalow, Farmhouse and Ranch. Exterior finishes include vertical board-and-batten, horizontal siding, and brick or stone wainscoting.
- **Plan 1** is a 2200 square foot home with a 500 square foot ADU located in a second-level “pop-up”. This ADU has a separate side-entry door, but also can be accessed from the garage and the interior of the main home to provide flexibility if the ADU were to be rented to an unrelated person or occupied by a family member of the eventual homeowner. The ADU has an outdoor deck, which faces the side yard. The home does not exceed 25 feet in height as measured to the roof ridge. The typical Plan 1 setbacks are 20 feet to the main home (greater to the garage), fourteen feet to the porch, and an average 39 foot rear setback. The proposed elevation styles are Ranch and Farmhouse.
- **Plan 2** is a 2350 square foot single-story home with a 450 square foot “junior” ADU located within the home on the ground level. This junior ADU has an interior entrance from the main home, but also could have an exterior entrance. The typical Plan 2 setbacks are 20 feet to the home, 19 feet to the porch with an average 29 foot rear yard setback. The proposed elevation styles are Ranch and Bungalow.
- **Plan 3** is a 3230 square foot home, which differs from the rest in that all four bedrooms are “en-suite”, i.e. each bedroom has its own bathroom attached. Two of these bedrooms and a sitting area are located within the second floor “pop-up” area. This home is proposed at 25 feet in height as measured to the roof ridge. The second level is evident from the front of the home only – with a “dormer-style” window over the garage which provides the required egress from one of the second-level bedrooms while also adding further diversity to the streetscape for a more appealing neighborhood. All other windows are at the sides of the homes, so no windows will look into the rear yard. The typical Plan 3 setbacks are 20 feet to the home, 14 feet to the porch with an average rear yard setback of 28 feet. The proposed elevation styles are Bungalow and Farmhouse.
- **Setbacks.** The proposed plans have been fitted carefully into the site plan to ensure all required front, side and rear yard setbacks can be met. As side yard

setbacks equal half the height of the home, Plans 1 and 3 are limited to those lots which are wide enough to accommodate the taller homes. The front yard setback for all homes is 20 feet, although the porches for the Plans 1 and 3 are setback 14 feet (CMD Section 17.38.020 C. allows porches to encroach into front and rear yards up to six feet).

CONSISTENCY ANALYSIS

The project's consistency with the City's plans, policies, and codes is evaluated below.

Calistoga General Plan

Land Use Designation

The site has a General Plan land use designation of Medium Density Residential. The designation allows the development of housing at densities of 4 to 10 dwelling units per acre. As such, the 3.82-acre developable site area would allow for 15 to 38 units.

The project is consistent with relevant Land Use Element policies, including:

- P2.1-1 All new development in the city shall comply with the policies of the individual land use designations in Section C of this Land Use Element.*
- P3.1-1 New development shall be focused within the existing developed areas, and not at the city's periphery.*
- P3.1-3 The approval of all development projects shall be coordinated with the provision of infrastructure and public services required to meet the needs of the development.*

Housing Element

The Housing Element of the General Plan provides a long-term, comprehensive plan to address existing and projected housing needs of the community. The site is identified as a Housing Opportunity site in the Housing Element site inventory, which identifies sites with realistic development opportunities for the provision of housing.

The project would be consistent with relevant Housing Element policies and actions, including:

- P1.2-1 Make the best use of available housing sites when they are developed.*

Residential Design Guidelines

The project is subject to the City's Single-Family Residential Design Guidelines, per CMC Section 17.41.050(C). Staff believes the project is consistent with the Residential Design Guidelines (Refer to **Attachment 4** for the Design Review Matrix):

- **Streetscape.** Main entrances of homes are identifiable from the street. Entry patios and porches are incorporated into the design. Garages are subordinate to the home design. Home orientation is similar to those in the surroundings.

- **Building Form and Mass.** Buildings incorporate variations in wall planes. Buildings are within allowable height limits and would be compatible with the mix of one- and two-story homes in the surroundings. Second stories are set back greater than minimum requirements and some step back from first stories are added to the designs.
- **Building Articulation.** Variation in massing, wall planes, and roof forms are applied. Accents, architectural features, and variation in materials add interest to the designs. Porches and entry spaces are incorporated into the architecture.
- **Roofs.** Different ridges in the roof designs provide variation in roof forms. Roof overhangs are provided in the designs and are appropriate for the styles.
- **Building Materials and Finishes.** Materials, finishes, and colors are consistent with the architectural styles. Exterior materials reflect the appearance of traditional materials such as wood, stone, and stucco. Designs apply distinct massing with variation in the wall planes.
- **Windows, Doors, and Entries.** Entrances are identifiable and entries are proportional to the buildings. Windows complement the buildings and are articulated by compatible trim or shutters. Second-story windows are not directly opposite to other residential windows.
- **Garages and Driveways.** Garage doors are set back from the street and do not significantly cover the front façades. Garage doors are articulated with details and panels to break up large planes. Driveways are sized appropriately for garages.
- **Landscaping.** A variety of trees, shrubs, and groundcover are proposed in the landscaping plan, with consideration of appropriate plantings given by a landscape architect. Trees and shrubs would not interfere with equipment and utilities.
- **Lighting.** Lighting fixtures are compatible with the designs and would be consistent with lighting requirements in the municipal code.
- **Walls and Fences.** Fences would use allowable materials.
- **Viewshed protection.** The designs meet allowed height limits and site orientation minimizes impacts to ridgelines.

Zoning Code and Development Standards

The project site is zoned R-1 One-Family Residential (R-1). The intent of the R-1 Zoning District is to allow the development of single-family and special needs residential uses that are consistent with the Calistoga General Plan and State law, in a manner that provides generous private open space and setbacks. Single-family dwellings are identified as permitted uses in this district.

The following table compares the project’s design with the development standards of the R-1 District.

R-1 District Development Standard per Zoning Code	Project	Compliant
---	---------	-----------

Site Area		5.84 acres (4.83 Developable)	
	Lots & Bioretention	3.82 acres	
	Private Streets	1.01 acres	
	Drainage Channel	1.01 acres	
Minimum front yard	20 feet	20 feet or greater	Yes
Minimum side yard	7.9 feet (Plan 1 Farmhouse) 5 feet (Plan 1 Others) 11.25 feet (Plan 2) 11.13 feet (Plan 3)	10.7 feet or greater (Plan 1) 12.5 feet or greater (Plan 2) 12.5 feet or greater (Plan 3)	Yes
Minimum rear yard	20 feet	24 feet or greater	Yes
Maximum lot coverage	40 percent	33.7 percent or less	Yes
Maximum building height*	25 feet	14 feet 3 inches (Plan 1 Italianate) 15 feet 1 inch (Plan 1 Craftsman) 16 feet (Plan 1 Farmhouse) 22 feet 6 inches (Plan 2 All) 22 feet 3 inches (Plan 3 All)	Yes
Parking	2 per unit	2 per unit	Yes
Minimum lot area	6,000 square feet	9,036 square feet or greater	Yes
Minimum lot width	60 feet	74 feet or greater	Yes
Minimum lot depth	100 feet	101 feet or greater	Yes

**Building height for a building with a gable or hip roof is measured at the distance from grade to the intersection between the wall and the roof eave plus half of the distance between the roof eave and the roof ridge, per CMC Section 17.38.040.*

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

On June 22, 2022, Planning Commission adopted an Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration (IS/MND) for the project in accordance with the requirements of Section 15070(b) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Development of the project is subject to implementation of mitigations identified within the IS/MND, compiled within the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (MMRP).

In accordance with CEQA guidelines, a notice of intent to adopt an IS/MND and notice of public hearing for the project was mailed to property owners within a 600-foot radius and posted to the City's website on February 7, 2022. A 30-day public review period for the project began on February 7, 2022, and concluded on March 8, 2022. The IS/MND was distributed to interested or involved public agencies, organizations, and private individuals for review. In addition, the IS/MND has been made available for general public review at City Hall and on the City's website: <https://www.ci.calistoga.ca.us/city-hall/departments-services/planning-building-department/2008-grant-street-project>. During the public review period, the project received 16 written comments. The IS/MND is incorporated herein by reference.

FINDINGS

To reduce repetition, the basis for making the required findings to approve the project's requested entitlements are contained in the attached Draft Resolution (**Attachment 1**) and Exhibits (Exhibit A, Conditions of Approval and Exhibit B, MMRP).

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the information and analysis contained in this report, Staff recommends that the Planning Commission adopt a resolution approving design review application DR 2021-3 for 15 single-family residences located at 2008 Grant Street, with conditions.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Draft Resolution
2. Staff Report & Resolution, Initial Study/Mitigated Negative Declaration with Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program, June 22, 2022 Planning Commission Hearing
3. 2008 Grant Street Project Plans
 - a. Design Narrative
 - b. Colors & Materials
 - c. Site Plan
4. Design Review Matrix