

## CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF THE 5<sup>TH</sup> CYCLE HOUSING ELEMENT

### *Evaluation of Previous Housing Element*

California Government Code Section 65588 requires that a Housing Element evaluate the appropriateness, effectiveness, and progress relative to achieving its stated goals and objectives. This complete and thorough review process provides material that informs best practices for achieving successful implementation over the next planning period. Additionally, by comparing the City's Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) performance between 2015 and 2023 against the current RHNA target, the City can identify the strengths and weaknesses of current strategies. Accomplishments under the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element are evaluated in this chapter to determine the effectiveness of the previous housing element, the City's progress in implementing the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element, and the appropriateness of the housing goals, objectives, and policies.

The City of Calistoga's 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element was adopted on January 6, 2015 after a public outreach and engagement process that included a general community meeting and public hearings with the Planning Commission and City Council. Through this process, the resulting 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element focused on achieving an adequate supply of safe, decent housing for all residents of Calistoga through maintaining and preserving the existing housing stock, preserving the character of Calistoga's residential neighborhoods, meeting the City's regional housing needs allocations, and providing additional affordable housing. Specifically, the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element identified the following goals:

- Goal H-1      Maximize opportunities for the development of housing to accommodate anticipated growth and facilitate mobility within the ownership and rental housing markets.*
- Goal H-2      Promote housing that meets the needs of extremely low-, low- and moderate-income households, particularly those who work in Calistoga.*
- Goal H-3      Maintain the City's housing stock and protect the affordability of affordable units.*
- Goal H-4      Address the housing needs of special-needs population groups, including seniors, farmworkers, the disabled, large families, and female-headed households.*
- Goal H-5      Maintain and enhance the physical condition and aesthetic qualities of existing residential neighborhoods.*
- Goal H-6      Remove governmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement and development of housing, where feasible.*
- Goal H-7      Prevent housing discrimination on the basis of race, color, sex, religion, age, ancestry, marital status, children or disability*
- Goal H-8      Reduce energy use and greenhouse gas production in existing and new residential development.*

*RHNA Progress***TABLE 2-1 2015-2023 REGIONAL HOUSING NEEDS ALLOCATION ACCOMPLISHMENTS**

Income Level	RHNA Allocation	Total Through 2021	Percent Complete
Extremely Low	3	3	100%
Very Low	6	20	333%
Low	2	12	600%
Moderate	4	8	200%
Above Moderate	15	40	266%
<b>Total</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>83</b>	<b>307%</b>

As indicated in Table 2-1, the City met all of its RHNA housing targets. This success is attributed to a combination of the City's strong financing programs, successful core operational practices, meaningful zoning code changes, and a relatively low RHNA. A summary of these programs is provided below and includes a reference to specific action items that were included in the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element. Additional information and analysis on each policy and program is provided in Table 2-3. Specific projects that highlight Calistoga's efforts in achieving their housing goals are also included below. The section concludes with a discussion on action items that were not addressed during the planning period.

The 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element also included policies and actions to achieve each of the identified goals. Table 2-3 analyzes each implementation action provided in the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element, describing the results of the action and recommending whether each policy or implementation action should remain, be modified, or be removed in this update to the Housing Element.

*Quantified Objectives Progress*

The City has fully met its Quantified Objectives for the current planning period in the moderate-income category and has partially met its objectives for the other income categories as shown in Table 2-2. Existing units shown are a combination of renter and owner-occupied household income level by tenure provided by the United States Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD).

**TABLE 2-2 PROGRESS ON HOUSING PRODUCTION, 5<sup>TH</sup> CYCLE: 2015-2022**

Target Income Group	No. of Units in 5 <sup>th</sup> Cycle RHNA	Units Built in 5 <sup>th</sup> Cycle	Existing Units Citywide (2017)
Extremely Low (≤30% of AMI <sup>1</sup> )	6	3	325
Very Low (31 - 50% of AMI)	28	20	445

Low (51 - 80% of AMI)	13	12	315
Moderate (81 - 120% of AMI)	4	8	200
Above Moderate (≥120% of AMI)	29	40	895
<b>Total</b>	<b>80</b>	<b>83</b>	<b>2,180</b>

Of the 325 existing households with an extremely low income, 105 are owner-occupied (8 percent of all owner-occupied units) and 220 are renter occupied (24 percent of all renter-occupied units). This disproportionate number of existing renter-occupied extremely low-income households could be due to increased demand in home ownership in Calistoga.

Progress on Quantified Objectives for housing rehabilitation, special needs and conservation are summarized in Table 2-3. The rehabilitated housing objectives are the number of units that were rehabilitated during the planning period. The special housing needs objectives are the number of units that were provided for special needs groups (Calistoga Family Apartments). The conserved affordable housing objectives are the number of units whose affordability was preserved during the planning period through deed restrictions.

**TABLE 2-3 PROGRESS ON QUANTIFIED OBJECTIVES, 5<sup>TH</sup> CYCLE: 2015-2022**

<b>Income Category</b>	<b>Extremely Low</b>	<b>Very Low</b>	<b>Low</b>	<b>Moderate</b>	<b>Above Moderate</b>	<b>Total</b>
Rehabilitation	0	10	10	0	0	20
Special Needs	22	10	42	0	0	74
Conserved	0	73	100	0	0	173

### *Financing Programs*

The City has a robust financing program that provides a range of housing development opportunities and residential services, especially for households who rely on affordable housing. The City's Affordable Housing Fund serves as the primary source of funding for affordable housing programs, which is at times supplemented by General Fund allocations, CDBG and HOME grants, and private funding. The Affordable Housing Fund is primarily financed by the assessment of the City's Affordable Housing Development Impact Fee and the Commercial Linkage Fee, which is applied to new commercial development projects or projects that convert or demolish existing affordable housing units (A2.3-1 and A3.1-1). However, the City's other development impact fees can also provide funding for housing related programs and capital improvement projects, indirectly. This includes city-wide ADA improvements and the maintenance and revitalization efforts to retain the City's existing housing stock in its older residential neighborhoods (A4.4-1, A4.4-2, A4.4-3, and A5.2-1).

Between 2015 to 2023 the City used approximately \$1.5 million of the local funding to purchase three properties for future use as affordable housing development sites (A2.1-4, A4.2-1, and A4.2-2). In 2020, the City also approved a \$2 million loan and fee deferral package for the 78-unit Lincoln Avenue Apartments project that would subsidize a portion of the affordable housing project's water and wastewater fees (A1.3-5).

During the planning period, the City also provided funding for a variety of housing service partners. This includes Community Action Napa Valley for operation of homeless shelters, the Hope Center, Calistoga Family

Center and UpValley Family Center to help maintain housing referral services, City of Napa Housing Authority, Napa Valley Fair Housing, Rebuilding Calistoga (A2.1-5, A4.1-4, A4.2-3, A5.1-2 and A7.1-2). Beyond homeless and emergency housing support services, the City has also directed funding to programs that encourage its homeowners to maintain their properties in a safe condition (A5.1-3 and A5.1-2).

### *Core Operations*

As part of its standard operating procedures the City provides information on available housing programs on a daily basis. General housing information is available both at City Hall and on the City's Housing Resources website (A4.1-6, A4.3-2, and A5.1-1). However, the City also provides specialized information relative to emergency housing services, weatherization, energy-efficiency programs, such as HERO and CalFirst, and the City's Mill Act program (A4.1-5, A5.2-3, A6.1-1, and A8.1-1). Information regarding fair housing practices, is provided in both English and Spanish at City Hall, the UpValley Family Center, and on the City's Housing Resource webpage (A7.1-1).

During review of development proposals or enforcement cases the city also regularly applies local and state standards, such as the City's Universal Design Policy, the City's Residential Design Standards, ADA, state standards for water-efficient landscape design, the State Green Building Code, and the State Historic Building Code (A4.4-1, A4.4-2, A5.2-2, A5.3-1, and A8.1-2). The City also maintains an annual inspection program for mobile home parks and multi-family housing developments (A5.1-5). Every year, the City provides public information on existing affordable housing and new development projects. The City also annually reports and monitors all affordable housing projects to verify rents and household incomes (A3.2-1).

### *Zoning Code Changes*

Between 2015 and 2021, the City adopted zoning code changes that contributed to housing production by providing exceptions for residential floor area from maximum floor area ratio (FAR) limits and supporting the development of second residential units (Accessory Dwelling Units or ADUs) (see A1.1-2 and A1.2-2). Additionally, the City passed zoning code changes that expanded the area permitting the development of supportive and transitional housing projects, as well as incentivizing the inclusion of affordable housing targeted for very low, low-, and moderate-income households in market rate developments through a density bonus program (A2.1-1, A2.3-2, A4.1-8, A6.1-2, and A6.1-7).

### *Project Highlights*

The success of Calistoga's 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element through funding availability, strong core operational practices, and zoning code changes have facilitated the following new affordable housing development projects:

- Calistoga Center: Approval of 104 units of farmworker housing, supplemented by annual supportive funding for this site and two others to the Napa County Housing Authority. (A4.1-3)
- Calistoga Senior Apartments: Approval of a 58 percent density bonus for a 30-unit senior apartment project that serves very low- and low-income seniors in which three units were designated as fully accessible and the remaining units were designed as adaptable to the disabled. (A1.2-1, A4.1-9, and A6.1-2)
- Lincoln Avenue Apartments: In 2020 the City approved a \$2 million loan and fee deferral package for the 78-unit Lincoln Avenue Apartments project that would subsidize a portion of the affordable

housing project's water and wastewater fees. Additionally, the project received a 25 percent density bonus in 2018. (A1.2-1, A1.3-5, and A6.1-2)

### ***Action Items Not Completed***

Although Calistoga achieved its RHNA objectives in all income categories the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element includes a number of action items that were not completed during the planning period for various reasons. These items are as follows:

- Alternative housing arrangements for re-zonings to Planned Unit Development (PUD) districts. No property owners chose to pursue this program as a development project. (A1.2-4)
- Adopt a mobile home park conversion ordinance. (A3.1-2)
- In 2018 the City hired a full-time Code Enforcement Officer who has issued citations for unsafe living conditions. However, currently this position is not filled. (A5.1-4)
- Encourage larger residential subdivisions (10 or more units) to provide a range of lot sizes and designs. The City did not receive any larger subdivisions during the planning period. (A5.3-2)
- Allow joint utilization of parking spaces in certain conditions. The City did not receive a request for an alternative parking space configuration. (A6.1-3)

### ***Housing and Services for Special Needs Populations***

Calistoga provides services and facilitates housing for special needs populations such as farmworkers, seniors, people with disabilities, unhoused individuals and families, and families with female heads of household. To finance these programs, the City maintains its Affordable Housing Fund as a source of funding for housing for special-needs population groups (A4.2-1). While many programs provide services to a breadth of special needs populations, the following are specific actions that contributed to targeted efforts:

- Farmworkers: In 2015, the City used CDBG funds to support programs for fair housing resources, residential rehabilitation, and farmworker housing. This effort resulted in the approval and construction of a 104-unit farmworker housing project. The City continues to provide annual funding to the Napa County Housing Authority to support the three farmworker housing centers, including the Calistoga Center (A2.1-5, A4.1-3, and A4.2-3)
- Seniors: During the planning period, the City approved a density bonus for the Calistoga Senior Apartments project. Three of the units in the project were designated as fully accessible units the remaining units are constructed to accommodate fully accessible renovations as needed (A1.2-1, A4.1-9, and A6.1-2)
- People with Disabilities: The City uses CDBG and HOME residential rehabilitation grant funds to retrofit existing housing that provides disabled accessibility (A4.4-3). As part of its Capital Improvement Program, the City has also continued ADA ramp replacement projects city-wide which serves to increase its accessibility (A5.2-1). The City advises members of the public on reasonable accommodation provisions as appropriate (A.4.4-4)
- Unhoused Individuals and Families: The City provides annual funding to Napa Valley Community Action and the Calistoga Family Center to provide homeless services and the operation of homeless shelters (A4.1-4)

- Families with Female Heads of Household: In 2015, the City adopted an ordinance to allow supportive and transitional housing as a permitted use in the Rural Residential and Rural Residential-Hillside Zoning Districts. While the provision of supportive and transitional housing supports many types of individuals, it is especially an important type of housing for female heads of households that may require emergency housing services (A4.1-8 and A6.1-7). Funding to the Calistoga Family Center and the UpValley Family Center also provide housing referral services (A4.1-4)

### *Appropriateness of Housing Element*

The overarching goals and policies of the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element continue to be appropriate and will be generally kept in the Housing Plan, with modifications to streamline or clarify objectives where appropriate. As indicated in Table 2-3, many housing programs continue to be appropriate and the intent of these programs will be kept in the Housing Element and revised to address identified specific housing needs, constraints, or other concerns identified as part of this update.

The policies and programs of the 5<sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element that were developed to modify the City's former Zoning Code have been implemented and will be removed from the Housing Element as they are no longer necessary.

This update to the Housing Element will revise existing programs and include new programs, where appropriate, to ensure that the City's priorities are addressed, that requirements of the State law are addressed, and that constraints to housing are removed, to the extent feasible. See Chapter 8 for the goals, policies, and actions of the 2023-2031 Housing Element.

**TABLE 2-3 CITY OF CALISTOGA 5TH CYCLE HOUSING ELEMENT EVALUATION**

Housing Element Objective, Policy or Action Name/Number	Program Description and Objective	Actionable Timeframe / Notes	Recommendation to Retain, Modify or Remove the program
<b>Goal H-1: Maximize opportunities for the development of housing to accommodate anticipated growth and facilitate mobility within the ownership and rental housing markets.</b>			
Objective H-1.1	Ensure that an adequate amount of land is available for residential development for all economic segments of the community and to meet the City’s regional share of housing.		Retain
Policy 1.1-1	Maintain a supply of residentially-designated land at appropriate densities that is adequate to accommodate Calistoga’s share of the regional housing need and accommodate projected housing needs.		Retain
Policy 1.1-2	Encourage the development of housing in combination with commercial uses.		Retain
Policy 1.1-3	Encourage the development of housing where public services are available.		Retain
Action A1.1-1	Amend Zoning Code to provide that the City shall not change the general plan or zoning designations with respect to land where housing is an allowed use to a less intensive use, in order to maintain supply of residentially designated land at higher densities,	Within two years of Housing Element certification.	Modify

	unless there are corresponding changes to create no net loss in residential capacity.		
Action 1.1-2	Amend the commercial zoning districts of the Zoning Code to exclude residential floor area from the calculation of the maximum floor area allowed for a mixed-use project, as provided by the General Plan’s commercial land use designations.	Amendments were completed in 2015.	Remove
Action1.1-3	When awarding Growth Management System allocations, give preference to the construction of residential units on vacant, underdeveloped or redeveloped land with necessary public infrastructure already in place.	Housing Units Caps (non-voter initiated) no longer allowed by SB 330.	Remove
Action1.1-4	When awarding Growth Management System allocations, give preference to residential units that are proposed as part of a mixed-use development project.	No preferential treatment was required because sufficient allocations were available for all residential developments.  Housing Units Caps (non-voter initiated) no longer allowed by SB330.	Remove
Action1.1-5	Ensure that any amendments to the Housing Element or other General Plan elements maintain internal consistency with the General Plan as a whole.	Timeframe: Ongoing.  All amendments were reviewed in 2015 to ensure consistency with the General Plan as a whole. There have been no amendments since that time.	Retain
Objective H-1.2	Make effective use of residential development sites.		Retain



Policy P1.2-1	Make the best use of available housing site when they are developed.		Retain
Policy P1.2-2	Promote the development of second dwelling units on lots with single-family residences.		Modify Change to “accessory dwelling unit” instead of “second dwelling unit”
Policy P1.2-3	Accommodate alternative kinds of housing (e.g., share housing, clustered housing, co-housing, cottage-style housing, and non-profit housing co-operatives) in areas designated for medium- and high-density residential development and commercial uses.	Different housing typologies has been identified as desirable by the community.	Retain
Action A1.2-1	Encourage new residential development to be built with no less than 50 percent of the maximum number of dwelling units prescribed by the General Plan for specific properties, subject to conformance with the City’s residential design guidelines and the General Plan’s residential design policies.	Timeframe: Ongoing  Completed as required. During the planning period, the City has approved a 58 percent density bonus for the Calistoga Senior apartments project (2016), a 28 percent density bonus for the Calistoga Vista project (2017) and a 35 percent density bonus for the Lincoln Avenue Apartments project (2018). No other major residential projects were reviewed during this time.	Retain

Action A1.2-2	Consider amendments to the Zoning Code’s regulations for second residential units, such as deleting the requirement that the owner of a property with both a primary and second dwelling unit occupy one of them, and the reduction of development impact fees.	Timeframe: Within one year of Housing Element certification.  Completed in 2015 with further modifications adopted in 2017, 2018, and 2020.	Remove
Action A1.2-3	Exempt second dwelling units from the Growth Management System allocation requirement.	Timeframe: Ongoing; provided by CMC Section 19.02.050(A)  ADUs are exempt from this per State legislation. The Growth Management System is also no longer allowed by SB 330.	Remove
A1.2-4	Allow alternative housing arrangements through the approval of property rezoning to a Planned Development District.	Timeframe: Ongoing	Modify to allow alternative housing arrangements through by-right housing instead of limiting to Planned Development District
Objective H-1.3	Provide public services and facilities needed for the development of housing.		Retain

<p>Policy P1.3-1</p>	<p>Ensure that new development does not outpace Calistoga’s ability to provide services to meet the existing and future needs of its residents.</p>		<p>Modify to focus on services, not limiting housing development</p>
<p>Actions A1.3-1</p>	<p>Update the Capital Improvement Program to ensure that sewer, water, and street improvements facilitate residential development.</p>	<p>Timeframe: Annually Included updated Capital Improvement Program in annual budget, including sewer, water, and street improvements.</p>	<p>Retain</p>
<p>Actions A1.3-2</p>	<p>Provide periodic reports to the City Council on the available water supply and wastewater treatment capacity and awarded and available Growth Management System allocations.</p>	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing Housing Units Caps (non-voter initiated) no longer allowed by SB 330.</p>	<p>Modify to focus on available services</p>
<p>Action A1.3-3</p>	<p>Assess impact fees on development projects to support adequate sewer, water and transportation services, and parks and cultural facilities.</p>	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing Development impact fees are routinely assessed on projects, as applicable.</p>	<p>Retain</p>
<p>Action A1.3-4</p>	<p>Periodically review and update development-related impact fees to ensure that fees are commensurate with the cost to the city for providing required infrastructure.</p>	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing Development impact fees were comprehensively updated in 2014. In 2017 the City adopted reduced water and wastewater development impact fees for multi-housing projects by 30-60 percent per unit, and for accessory dwelling units by \$10,000 per unit.</p>	<p>Modify to include considerations for fee reductions for 100% affordable housing projects</p>

Action 1.3-5	Consider using the Affordable Housing Fund to subsidize all or part of the water and wastewater connection fees for affordable housing projects.	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing</p> <p>In 2020, the City approved a \$2 million loan and fee deferral package for the 78-unit Lincoln Avenue Apartments project. No other project opportunities were available prior to that time. This action has been a key component in meeting the City’s affordable housing goals.</p>	Retain
<b>Goal H-2: Promote housing that meets the needs of extremely low-, low- and moderate-income households, particularly those who work in Calistoga.</b>			
Objective H-2.1	Encourage the development of affordable housing.		Retain
Policy P2.1-1	Provide incentives for the development of affordable housing.		Retain
Action A2.1-1	Adopt an ordinance providing for the approval of density bonuses and other incentives for projects that reserve units for extremely low-, low- and moderate-income households, consistent with State law.	<p>Timeframe: Within one year of Housing Element certification.</p> <p>Completed in 2015.</p>	Modify to reference state law compliance
Action A2.1-2	When awarding Growth Management System allocations, give preference to the construction of dedicated housing that is affordable to extremely low-, low- and moderate-income households.	Housing Units Caps (non-voter initiated) no longer allowed by SB330	Remove
Action A2.1-3	Maintain the City’s Affordable Housing Fund as a source of funding for affordable housing to extremely low-, low- and moderate-income households.	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing</p> <p>In 2015 \$650,000 from the Affordable Housing Fund was used to purchase the 611 Washington site for</p>	Retain

		<p>construction of low-income apartments. In 2017, the City purchased a potential affordable housing site using \$472,000 from the Affordable Housing fund. In 2018, the City purchased a potential affordable housing site using \$500,000 from the Affordable Housing fund. The City regularly assesses the affordable housing development impact fee on applicable new commercial development projects.</p>	
Action A2.1-4	<p>Allocate, as economic resources permit, a portion of any tax revenue resulting from new development, including transient occupancy tax (TOT), to support housing opportunities for extremely low-, low- and moderate-income households, including for use in land banking, development of affordable housing, or other uses that will lead to more affordable housing.</p>	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing. Within two years of Housing Element certification, pursue the purchase of property for the construction of affordable and/or special-needs housing.</p> <p>In 2015 a loan from the General Fund to the Affordable Housing Fund was used for the purchase of 611 Washington for the construction of low-income apartments. No other opportunities have become available during the planning period.</p>	Retain
Action A2.1-5	<p>Use loan repayments from the 1980s CDBG residential rehabilitation program to fund programs and projects</p>	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing. Funds from this account are used annually to support</p>	Retain

	that benefit extremely low-, low- and moderate-income households.	contract services with the City of Napa Housing Authority (grant applications and program administration), Napa Valley Community Action (homeless services), Napa Valley Fair Housing and Rebuilding Calistoga.  In 2015, funds were used to support programs for fair housing resources, residential rehabilitation and farmworker housing.	
Objective H-2.2	Pursue state and federal funding assistance appropriate to Calistoga’s needs for affordable housing.		Retain
Policy P2.2-1	Use state and federal funding assistance, to the extent these subsidies are available and appropriate to Calistoga, to assist people in need of affordable housing and developers interested in constructing affordable housing.		Retain
Action A2.2-1	Use local funding to leverage funding available from federal, state, county and private funding sources for affordable housing and housing for special needs groups.	Timeframe: Ongoing. Meet with the Housing Authority of the City of Napa at least annually to review upcoming funding application notices, identify feasible programs and determine how the Affordable Housing Fund and Community Development Fund can be leveraged to maximize the likelihood of success in obtaining	Retain

		<p>funding awards. Assist the HACN in applying for suitable funding.</p> <p>The 2015 purchase of 611 Washington for affordable housing will help leverage funding for its construction. In 2020 the City provided a \$2 million loan and fee deferral package for the 78 unit Lincoln Avenue apartments project. No other project opportunities were available during the planning period.</p>	
Action 2.2-2	<p>Assist developers in seeking funding for affordable housing from at least three sources: (1) local banks seeking to meet their obligations under the Community Reinvestment Act, (2) investors seeking Low-Income Housing Tax Credits, and (3) federal and state funds, including those available under the HOME program.</p>	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing.</p> <p>In 2015 the City assisted the developer of the affordable housing project at 611 Washington Street with their application for AHSC funding. In 2020, the City assisted the developer of the 78 unit Lincoln Avenue Apartments project with a \$2 million loan and fee deferral package. No other project opportunities were available during the planning period.</p>	Retain
Objective H-2.3	<p>Address the impacts of nonresidential development and market-rate residential development on the demand for, and the development of, affordable housing.</p>		Retain
Policy P2.3-1	<p>Offset the impact of new nonresidential development and market-rate residential development on the need</p>		Retain

	for, and the provision of, housing affordable to extremely low-, low- and moderate-income households.		
Action 2.3-1	Revise the Zoning Code’s inclusionary housing requirements to reflect recent court decisions regarding their applicability to rental housing and the feasibility of providing affordable housing within market-rate residential projects.	Timeframe: Within one year of Housing Element certification The City adopted an ordinance in 2015.	Remove
Action 2.3-2	Assess affordable housing linkage fees on nonresidential development that are deposited in the Affordable Housing Fund to be used, in part, to increase the supply of affordable housing. Periodically review and revise the fees as necessary.	Timeframe: Ongoing; provided by CMC Section 17.08.020(B) The City updated linkage fees during the comprehensive development impact fee update in 2014. Since that time linkage fees have been assessed on non-residential development projects.	Retain
<b>Goal H-3: Maintain the City’s housing stock and protect the affordability of affordable units.</b>			
Objective H-3.1	Minimize the loss of existing housing.		Retain
Policy P3.1-1	Discourage the loss of housing by new development, expansion of development and conversion to non-residential uses.		Retain
Policy P3.1-2	Regulate the conversion of mobile home parks to other uses.		Retain
Policy P3.1-3	Prohibit vacation rentals to maximize housing available to long-term occupants.		Retain



<p>Action A3.1-1</p>	<p>Where the loss of affordable housing occurs through demolition or conversion, these units shall be replaced on-site or elsewhere. The City Council may allow the payment of an in-lieu fee to the Affordable Housing Fund for lost units in addition to any affordable housing linkage fee in cases where the proposed uses clearly provide other benefits to the City.</p>	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing</p> <p>The City required payment of in-lieu fees for a dwelling that was converted to another non-residential use (the Craftsman Inn expansion project in 2016) and the conversion of a dwelling unit to an office at 509-B Washington (2017). Additionally, a demolished unit at 1001 Cedar was replaced with another housing unit (2017). No other affordable housing was demolished or converted to another use during the planning period.</p>	<p>Retain</p>
<p>Action A3.1-2</p>	<p>Consider adopting a mobile home park conversion ordinance to require the assessment of impacts, public hearings and relocation assistance before a mobile home park can be converted to another use.</p>	<p>Not completed.</p> <p>The state already regulates the conversion of mobile home parks into other uses.</p>	<p>Remove</p>
<p>Action A3.1-3</p>	<p>Continue to actively enforce the Zoning Code’s prohibition of vacation rentals (i.e., the renting of homes for fewer than 30 days).</p>	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing.</p> <p>Staff monitored vacation rental websites and advised property owners of prohibition where possible.</p>	<p>Retain</p>
<p>Objective H-3.2</p>	<p>Minimize the conversion of affordable units to market-rate units.</p>		<p>Retain</p>

Policy P3.2-1	Monitor affordable housing projects to ensure their continued occupancy by appropriate individuals and households.		Retain
Policy P3.2-2	Control rent increases on mobile home park spaces.		Retain
Action A3.2-1	Monitor deed-restricted affordable housing projects to ensure compliance with affordability requirements and restrictions.	Timeframe: Ongoing. Monitoring reports verifying rents and household incomes completed by Housing Authority of the City of Napa annually.  Projects were monitored by the Housing Authority of the City of Napa.	Retain
Action 3.2-2	Continue to administer the Mobile Home Rental Stabilization Ordinance and defend it against legal challenges. Monitor the effectiveness of the Ordinance and revise if necessary to maximize its effectiveness.	Timeframe: Ongoing.  No rent increases were requested beyond those allowed by the Ordinance.	Retain
<b>Goal H-4: Address the housing needs of special-needs population groups, including seniors, farmworkers, the disabled, large families, and female-headed households.</b>			
Objective H-4.1	Promote housing for special-needs population groups.		Retain
Policy P4.1-1	Provide incentives to projects providing housing for special-needs population groups.		Retain

Policy P4.1-2	Provide information on local services that assist special-needs population groups.		Modify to include housing resources
Policy P4.1-3	Collaborate with Napa County and non-profit organizations to promote housing for special-needs population groups.		Retain
Policy P4.1-4	Improve disabled accessibility to existing residences and promote universal design in new residences.		Retain
Policy P4.1-5	Encourage larger residential development projects to provide a range of unit sizes.		Retain
Policy P4.1-6	Provide information on housing resources to special-needs population groups.		Remove Combined with Policy P4.1-2
Action A4.1-1	When awarding Growth Management System allocations, give preference to the construction of housing that will assist one or more special-needs groups.	Housing Units Caps (non-voter initiated) no longer allowed by SB 330.	Remove
Action A4.1-2	Approve residential density bonuses and incentives consistent with the provisions of State law for senior housing projects.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City approved the Calistoga Senior Apartments, which provided 30 affordable senior housing units. The development completed construction in 2018.	Retain
Action A4.1-3	Collaborate with Napa County, the agricultural industry, and non-profit organizations to assess the need, plan for, fund and develop farmworker housing	Timeframe: Ongoing. The City approved 56 units of farmworker housing units in 2013, 48 of which are under construction and will be	Retain

	to meet the needs of permanent and seasonal laborers.	<p>completed in 2015. Continue to provide annual funding to the Napa County Housing Authority to support the three farmworker housing centers, including the Calistoga Center.</p> <p>In 2015 the City contributed \$10,000 to the Napa County Housing Authority for the operation of three housing centers for migrant farmworkers.</p>	
Action A4.1-4	Collaborate with Napa County and non-profit organizations to assess the needs of the homeless by participating in efforts to survey this population and providing funding or other support to ensure the provision of shelters on a regional basis.	<p>Timeframe: Ongoing. The City provides annual funding to Community Action Napa Valley to support homeless services.</p> <p>From 2015 to 2017, the City provided funding to Community Action Napa Valley for operation of homeless shelters and Hope Center, and to Calistoga Family Center to help maintain housing referral services.</p> <p>From 2018 and onwards, the City provided funding to UpValley Family Center to help maintain housing referral services.</p>	Retain
Action A4.1-5	Provide information about the 211-phone system, which provides assistance to persons in need of emergency shelter.	Timeframe: Ongoing. The City provides this information at City offices and on its website.	Retain

		The city regularly provides up-to-date flyers at City Hall and on the Housing Resources page on the City’s website.	
Action A4.1-6	Maintain an up-to-date Housing Resources page on the City’s web site that provides information on the City’s housing programs and links to the web sites of local housing organizations and housing agencies.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City maintains a Housing Resources page as part of the broader City website.	Retain
Action A4.1-7	As part of the project review process, provide incentives to market-rate rental housing projects of 10 or more units that provide three- and four- bedroom units, which may include waivers from or modifications to development standards as determined to be appropriate through the development review process.	Timeframe: Ongoing In 2017 the City approved a density bonus for the Calistoga Vista project which includes 3-bedroom units. In 2018 and 2020 the City approved a density bonus for the Lincoln Avenue Apartments project which includes 3-bedroom units. In 2020 the City also approved a density bonus for the Silverado Terrace Townhomes. No other applications for such projects were received.	Retain
Action A4.1-8	Amend the Rural Residential and Rural Residential-Hillside Zoning Districts to allow supportive and transitional housing as permitted uses.	Timeframe: Within one year of Housing Element certification In 2015 an ordinance was adopted.	Remove
Action A4.1-9	Encourage developers of affordable housing projects to designate a share of the units for the disabled, including developmentally disabled persons.	Timeframe: Ongoing In 2015 three units in the approved Calistoga Senior Apartments project were designated as fully-accessible;	Retain

		the remainder are designed as adaptable to the disabled.	
Objective H-4.2	Financially support housing for special-needs population groups.		Retain
Policy 4.2-1	Provide local funding to support housing for special-needs population groups.		Retain
Action A4.2-1	Maintain the City’s Affordable Housing Fund as a source of funding for housing for special-needs population groups.	Timeframe: Ongoing The fund is augmented regularly by non-residential affordable housing fees.	Retain
Action A4.2-2	Allocate, as economic resources permit, a portion of any tax revenue resulting from new development, including transient occupancy tax (TOT), to support housing opportunities for special-needs population groups.	Timeframe: Ongoing In 2015 a loan from the General Fund to the Affordable Housing Fund was used for the purchase of 611 Washington for the construction of senior apartments.	Retain
Action A4.2-3	Use loan repayments from the CDBG account to fund programs and projects that benefit special-needs population groups.	Timeframe: Ongoing. Funds from this account are used annually to support contract services with the City of Napa Housing Authority (grant applications and program administration), Napa Valley Community Action (homeless services), and Rebuilding Calistoga.	Retain

Objective H-4.3	Pursue state and federal funding assistance appropriate to Calistoga’s needs for special-needs housing.		Retain
Policy P4.3-1	Use state and federal funding assistance, to the extent these subsidies are available and appropriate to Calistoga, to assist special-needs population groups in need of affordable housing and developers interested in constructing such housing.		Retain
Action A4.3-1	Use local funding to leverage funding available from federal, state, county and private funding sources for special needs groups.	Timeframe: Ongoing No opportunities were available for leveraging such funding during the planning period.	Retain
Action A4.3-2	Maintain a Housing Resources page on the City’s web site that provides information on resources for special-needs population groups and links to the web sites of local housing organizations and housing agencies.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City maintains a Housing Resources page on the City website.	Retain
Objective H-4.4	Provide disabled access to housing.		Retain
Policy P4.4-1	Maximum accessibility by the disabled to housing units.		Modify to replace “disabled” with “people with disabilities”
Action A4.4-1	Enforce State requirements for accessibility and adaptability in remodeled and new housing projects.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City enforces accessibility and adaptability requirements.	Retain
Action A4.4-2	Enforce the City’s Universal Design Policy that requires accessible design features to be incorporated into	Timeframe: Ongoing	Retain

	newly constructed and substantially rehabilitated single-family and duplex residences to the maximum feasible extent and update as necessary.	The City enforces its Universal Design Policy.	
Action A4.4-3	Seek grants to retrofit existing housing to provide disabled accessibility.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City administers CDBG and HOME residential rehabilitation grant funds, which are available for such retrofits.	Retain
Action A4.4-4	Inform the public about the City’s reasonable accommodations provisions that allow modifications to the City’s development standards for persons with disabilities seeking equal access to housing.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City advises members of the public of reasonable accommodation provisions as appropriate.	Retain
<b>Goal H-5: Maintain and enhance the physical condition and aesthetic qualities of existing residential neighborhoods.</b>			
Objective H-5.1	Preserve and improve the quality of existing housing.		Retain
Policy P5.1-1	Enforce health and safety codes and abate unsafe living conditions, giving property owners ample opportunities to correct deficiencies within a reasonable time frame.		Retain
Policy P5.1-2	Encourage homeowners to maintain their property in a safe condition.		Retain
Policy P5.1-3	Make use of governmental programs targeted at the rehabilitation of housing for lower-income households		Retain
Action A5.1-1	Offer technical assistance to aid homeowners in maintaining, upgrading and improving their property.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City offers and provides technical assistance through flyers,	Retain



		information on the City website and through direct communication with homeowners. This has been an active and successful program.	
Action A5.1-2	Provide funding and cooperate with volunteer groups such as Rebuilding Calistoga to help lower-income households maintain and upgrade their property.	Timeframe: Ongoing. In 2015, 2016 and 2017 the City provided a sum of \$40,000 to Rebuilding Calistoga and also received HOME residential rehabilitation grants for lower-income households. The City also administers CDBG residential rehabilitation grants.	Retain
Action A5.1-3	Seek to correct health and safety issues identified during routine building permitting and inspection activities.	Timeframe: Ongoing In 2015 the City pursued correct of identified health and safety issues.	Modify to replace “Seek to” with “Continue to”
Action A5.1-4	Develop and adopt a procedure as part of the City’s Code Enforcement Program for the City to intervene when a property is becoming seriously deteriorated, especially if it is of historic significance.	Timeframe: Within three years of Housing Element certification In 2018 the City hired a full-time Code Enforcement Officer who has issued citations for unsafe living conditions. Currently the City of Calistoga uses a contractor and is seeking to hire an in-house code enforcement officer.	Retain
Action A5.1-5	Maintain an annual inspection program to enforce health and safety codes and abate unsafe living	Timeframe: Ongoing.	Retain

	conditions in the City’s multi-family housing complexes and mobile home parks.	The City inspects one mobile home park annually and all multi-family housing is inspected annually. Mobile home parks are also inspected when repairs that require turning off the water lines are needed.	
Objective H-5.2	Encourage private investment in older residential neighborhoods and the private rehabilitation of housing.		Retain
Policy P5.2-1	Support the maintenance and revitalization of Calistoga’s older residential neighborhoods.		Retain
Action A5.2-1	Maintain streets, sidewalks and other municipal systems in older residential neighborhoods in good repair.	Timeframe: Ongoing  During the planning period the following has been completed: construction of Grant Street underground drainage improvements; design work for Grant Street culvert repair and Fairgrounds storm drain repair. The City continues ADA ramp replacement projects and sharing sidewalk repair/replacement costs with property owners.	Retain
Action A5.2-2	Allow the application of the State’s Historic Building Code to qualified homes in order to provide flexibility in rehabilitation and modification efforts.	Timeframe: Ongoing  The City uses the Historic Building Code as appropriate.	Retain

Action A5.2-3	Publicize the City’s Mills Act program to encourage owners of qualified owner-occupied homes to actively participate in the rehabilitation, restoration, preservation and maintenance of their historic property in exchange for a reduction in their property taxes.	Timeframe: Ongoing. Information is provided on the City’s web site and to property owners of historic properties who apply for building permits.	Retain
Objective H-5.3	Ensure new housing development complements Calistoga’s rural small-town community identity and incorporates quality design.		Modify to include reference to objective design standards
Policy P5.3-1	Encourage good design that incorporates and/or respects neighborhood and community characteristics.		Retain
Policy P5.3-2	Encourage larger residential subdivisions to provide a range of lot sizes and designs.		Retain
Action A5.3-1	The City’s residential design standards and the General Plan’s Character Area Overlay Districts shall be considered in the review of proposed residential projects.	Timeframe: Ongoing Design and Character Area standards are considered during review of residential projects.	Modify to include reference to objective design standards
Action A5.3-2	As part of the project review process, encourage new residential subdivisions of ten or more lots or units to provide a range of lot sizes and designs to the extent feasible, and avoid “cookie cutter” approaches to subdivision design.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City did not receive any applicable projects during the planning period.	Retain
<b>Goal H-6: Remove governmental constraints to the maintenance, improvement and development of housing, where feasible.</b>			

Objective H-6.1	Streamline the City’s permit review process, simplify regulations, and minimize fees to promote the provision and maintenance of housing.		Retain
Policy P6.1-1	Maintain development and permitting procedures that are efficient and do not constrain the production of housing.		Retain
Policy P6.1-2	Reduce parking requirements for residential uses that share commercial parking, where appropriate.		Retain
Policy P6.1-3	Ensure that parking requirements for senior housing are the minimum necessary to provide adequate parking.		Retain
Policy P6.1-4	Minimize constraints on housing development related to the Growth Management System.	Housing Units Caps (non-voter initiated) no longer allowed by SB330	Remove
Action A6.1-1	Allow use of the Historic Building Code to facilitate the rehabilitation of historic residences.	Timeframe: Ongoing The Historic Building Code was used when appropriate.	Retain
Action A6.1-2	Fast-track the processing of applications and entitlements for projects that meet General Plan policies and City regulations, with particular attention paid to projects providing affordable housing.	Timeframe: Ongoing The Calistoga Senior Apartments project received environmental review and design review approvals in less than 60 days from application submittal. No other applicable projects were reviewed during the planning period.	Modify to consider by-right housing in commercial districts
Action A6.1-3	Allow the joint utilization of parking spaces where it can be demonstrated that shared use will not result in	Timeframe: Ongoing.	Retain

	an unacceptable impact on parking in the public right-of-way or on off-street parking lots.	No application for such projects were received during the planning period.	
Action A6.1-4	Amend the Zoning Code to allow reduced parking for senior housing.	Timeframe: Within three years of Housing Element certification. Parking reductions already allowed by CMC Chapter 17.08 prior to the adoption of the 5 <sup>th</sup> Cycle Housing Element.	Remove
Action A6.1-5	Amend the Growth Management System to allow for longer time extensions under appropriate circumstances and when certain performance standards have been met.	Housing Units Caps (non-voter initiated) no longer allowed by SB330.	Remove
Action A6.1-6	Amend the Growth Management System to allow the rollover of unused allocations between five-year housing cycles.	Housing Units Caps (non-voter initiated) no longer allowed by SB330	Remove
Action A6.1-7	Amend Zoning Code Chapter 17.04, Definitions, to update the definitions for "supportive housing" and "transitional housing," consistent with state law, update the definition of "family," consistent with current case law, and to add a definition for "target population."	Timeframe: Within one year of Housing Element certification. Adopted in 2015.	Remove
<b>Goal H-7: Prevent housing discrimination on the basis of race, color, sex, religion, age, ancestry, marital status, children or disability</b>			
Objective H-7.1	Provide housing opportunities for all persons regardless of race, religion, sex, marital status, ancestry, national origin, disability or color.		Retain

Policy P7.1-1	Support fair and equal housing opportunities for all Calistogans and discourage discriminatory housing practices.		Retain
Policy P7.1-2	Support organizations that provide equal housing services to Calistoga residents.		
Action A7.1-1	Provide bilingual information about fair housing at public locations, including displaying printed materials at City Hall, providing printed materials to the UpValley Family Center, and including links to fair housing resources on the Housing Resources page of the City’s web site.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City has provided bilingual information about fair housing at prescribed locations.	Retain
Action A7.1-2	Provide financial support to, and work with local organizations, such as Fair Housing Napa Valley and the UpValley Family Center, to provide multi-lingual landlord-tenant education, conciliation and the intake of discrimination complaints, investigation and enforcement.	Timeframe: Ongoing. The City provides annual funding to both of these groups.	Retain
Action A7.1-3	Include a Fair Housing Marketing Plan as part of housing opportunities created through the City’s affordable housing programs.	Timeframe: Ongoing The City implements fair housing practices as part of the residential rehabilitation programs.	Retain
Action A7.1-4	Continue to implement fair housing practices in affordable housing programs, such as the HOME residential rehabilitation program.	Timeframe: Ongoing. Implemented fair housing practices as part of the HOME residential rehabilitation program.	Retain
<b>Goal H-8: Reduce energy use and greenhouse gas production in existing and new residential development.</b>			

Objective H-8.1	Reduce energy demand in new and existing housing through conservation and efficiency.		Retain
Policy P8.1-1	Promote the use of energy conservation features in the design of new and remodeled residential structures.		Retain
Policy P8.1-2	Encourage sustainable design and construction practices in new residential development projects.		Retain
Action A8.1-1	Publicize the availability of weatherization and energy-efficiency programs for existing residences that are offered by utility companies and other organizations.	Timeframe: Ongoing. Information about the HERO and CalFirst loan programs is posted on the city website.	Retain
Action A8.1-2	Ensure efficient water use for irrigation by adopting the State’s standards for water-efficient landscape design.	Timeframe: Within one year of Housing Element certification The city enforces state standards for water-efficient landscape design.	Retain
Action A8.1-3	Fund energy conservation improvements through local rehabilitation programs to assist lower- income households in lowering energy expenses.	Timeframe: Ongoing. The current HOME rehabilitation program includes funding for energy-efficiency improvements.	Retain