

City of Calistoga
Planning Commission
1232 Washington St.
Calistoga, CA 945615

Paul G. Smith
P.O. Box 689
1255 Lincoln Ave.
Calistoga, CA 94515



February 10, 2009

Subject: PA 2008-04, CDR 2008-04

Honorable Commissioners

Further to my letter of Feb 3 assuming the city acknowledges its responsibility to the environment (though conflictingly allowing approximately 40+ geothermal water users to spew boron-toxins into the environment 24/7) ultimately allowing this project with the logical condition that it dispose of all wastewater onsite, consideration must be given to the fruit to be crushed and the wines to be produced and sold. Specifically, I urge the Commission to require that these wineries located within the city limits of Calistoga (thus unencumbered by the strict grape sourcing requirements of all unincorporated Napa County wineries) be required to conform to the same studied, acceptable and fair grape sourcing requirements as wineries located in unincorporated areas.

Many Napa Valley and certainly Calistoga growers are counting on you to protect and preserve the quality reputation that has taken generations to build. The appellation laws are tricky and full of loopholes allowing latitude in labeling which can be deceptive. There is already one so-called "Calistoga" branded producer attempting to foist its invented and exclusive interpretation of "Calistoga" branded wines on unsuspecting customers (which in fact may be from Bakersfield-grown grapes). Calistoga does not deserve to be the hole in the dike allowing an ocean of swill to pour in with the clear potential if not actual intent of deceiving customers and ultimately destroying the reputation of Calistoga's wines as well as the wines of Napa Valley.

I urge you to condition the project such that both wineries must adhere to the same grape sourcing requirements as producers in unincorporated Napa County.

Respectfully,

Paul G. Smith