

**CITY OF CALISTOGA
PLANNING COMMISSION
RESOLUTION PC 2010-07**

A RESOLUTION APPROVING DESIGN REVIEW (DR 2010-01) TO ALLOW THE RESTORATION AND ADDITION TO A STRUCTURE LISTED ON THE NATIONAL REGISTER AT 1300 CEDAR STREET WITHIN A “DC-DD”, DOWNTOWN COMMERCIAL - DESIGN DISTRICT (APN 011-223-002)

1
2 **WHEREAS**, Robert Fiddaman and Susan Hoffman are proposing restoration/renovations
3 to an existing structure currently listed on the National Register; including, but not limited to,
4 new perimeter foundation, re-roof, porch repairs and a 72 square foot addition, all on the
5 property located at 1300 Cedar Street within the “DC-DD”, Downtown Commercial - Design
6 District (APN 011-223-002);
7

8 **WHEREAS**, since the project is located in the “DD” Design District; Chapter 17.06.020
9 of the Zoning Ordinance requires design review because the project involves alterations to a
10 federally listed structure;
11

12 **WHEREAS**, the Planning Commission considered the request at its regular meeting on
13 April 28, 2010. Prior to taking action on the application, the Planning Commission received
14 written and oral reports by the staff, and received public testimony;
15

16 **WHEREAS**, the action taken by the Planning Commission was to approve the proposed
17 Design Review to allow the administrative review of a Building Permit application for the
18 project, subject to the Conditions of Approval, attached herein; and
19

20 **WHEREAS**, the Planning Commission adopted the following findings as part of its
21 deliberations on the project:
22

23 A. The extent to which the proposal is compatible with the existing development pattern
24 with regard to massing, scale, setbacks, color, textures, materials, etc.;

25
26 Finding: This rehabilitation of an existing historically significant building will preserve
27 its existing characteristics and restore a few that have been lost over the years. This
28 design review request is prompted by a very small addition, a small deck, and
29 replacement of three windows near the rear of the building. The front façade will be
30 virtually unchanged, except for the restoration of shutters that were removed years ago.
31

32 B. Site layout, orientation, location of structures, relationship to one another, open spaces
33 and topography;
34

35 Finding: There will be no change in the site layout and location of the structure, except
36 the rear parking lot (which was added for commercial use as a B & B) will be removed
37 and be replaced by a traditional garden overtime.
38

39 C. Harmonious relationship of character and scale with existing and proposed adjoining
40 development, achieving complementary style while avoiding both excessive variety and
41 monotonous repetition;
42

43 Finding: There will be no change. Palmer House is an excellent segue from the
44 commercial use (Ca'Toga Gallery) next door (toward Lincoln Ave) and Pioneer Park on
45 the other side of the property.
46

47 D. Building design, materials, colors and textures that are compatible and appropriate to
48 Calistoga. Whether the architectural design of structures and their materials and colors
49 are appropriate to the function of the project;
50

51 Finding: There will be no change in the building design. The small addition at the rear
52 will be compatible with the existing structure. Colors are based on the best information
53 available and believed to be historically correct.
54

55 E. Harmony of materials, colors, and composition of those sides of a structure, which are
56 visible simultaneously;
57

58 Finding: There will be no change of consequence. Palmer House is a classic Victorian
59 design (French Second Empire) that is considered very successful.
60

61 F. Consistency of composition and treatment;
62

63 Finding: The original house, additions made around the turn of the 18-19th century, and
64 later additions, including the small addition proposed, have all been consistent with
65 classic Second Empire Design.
66

67 G. Location and type of planting with regard to valley conditions. Preservation of specimen
68 and landmark trees upon a site, with proper irrigation to insure water conservation and
69 maintenance of all plant materials;
70

71 Finding: The front yard landscaping will be renewed, but will remain substantially the
72 existing design, with lawn and shade-tolerant plantings. The elm trees (for which the
73 property was known as "The Elms" when it was operated as a B & B) have been
74 neglected for almost ten years. They have already been treated to control disease and
75 insect infestations, and will be pruned and cabled as necessary to improve their health
76 and safety. All landscaping will be drip irrigated (lawn will be sprayed). An existing
77 well will be restored to use for irrigation purposes.
78

79 H. Whether exterior lighting, design signs and graphics are compatible with the overall
80 design approach and appropriate for the setting;
81

82 Finding: Exterior lighting at the front will be reduced from that utilized during the B & B
83 operation. New lighting at the front and rear will be minimal, primarily safety-oriented,
84 and residential in character. No signage of consequence is planned, although the existing
85 brass plaque (15" x 10") identifying the building as on the National Historic Register will
86 be retained, and a matching plaque identifying the house as a private residence has been
87 installed at the front entrance.
88

89
90 I. The need for improvement of existing site conditions including but not limited to signage,
91 landscaping, lighting, etc., to achieve closer compliance with current standards;
92

93 Finding: Other than the improvements proposed and the carriage house correction that
94 will occur soon, no additional improvements are warranted.
95

96 J. Whether the design promotes a high design standard and utilizes quality materials
97 compatible with the surrounding development consistent with and appropriate for the
98 nature of the proposed use;
99

100 Finding: This rehabilitation project will preserve and enhance the existing 139-year-old
101 classic design of the Palmer House. It maintains a very high design standard.
102

103 K. Responsible use of natural and reclaimed resources.
104

105 Finding: All removed fixtures and building materials will be recycled. High standards
106 for equipment efficiency, insulation installation (where practical) and other energy
107 efficient practices will be utilized. Solar panels may be installed on the flat roof if
108 feasible (the location may be too shady, or the panels may be too visible). We will use
109 native plantings wherever practical. We are willing to use reclaimed water for irrigation
110 if it is already used in the park and the city is willing to make it available at reasonable
111 cost.
112

113 **NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** by the City of Calistoga Planning
114 Commission that based on the above Findings and Conditions contained herein the Planning
115 Commission approves the proposed project subject to the above Findings and the following
116 Conditions of Approval.
117

118 1. This permit authorizes the restoration/renovations to an existing structure located at 1300
119 Cedar Street (The Palmer House) currently listed on the National Register; including, but
120 not limited to, new perimeter foundation, re-roof, porch repairs and a 72 square foot
121 addition. This project shall substantially conform to the project and site plans received
122 December 14, 2009. Minor modifications that do not result in increased environmental
123 impacts may be approved in writing by the Planning and Building Department Director.
124

125 2. Prior to any work, a building permit shall be obtained subject to the review and approval
126 of the Planning and Building Department. Upon building permit issuance all appropriate
127 fees shall be paid.
128

129 3. Prior to foundation permit final, an Elevation Certificate shall be prepared and submitted
130 to the Planning and Building Department indicating a lowest floor elevation at or above
131 the base flood elevation.
132

133 4. All fencing shall meet the requirements of Chapter 17.52 Fences, Hedges or Walls of the
134 Calistoga Municipal Code.

- 135
136 5. The permit holder shall permit the City of Calistoga or representative(s) or designee(s) to
137 make periodic inspections at any reasonable time deemed necessary in order to assure
138 that the activity being performed under authority of this permit is in accordance with the
139 terms and conditions prescribed herein.
140
141 6. This permit shall be null and void if not used by April 28, 2011.
142
143 7. This permit shall be valid until it expires or is revoked pursuant to the terms of this
144 permit and/or Chapter 17 of the Calistoga Municipal Code.
145

146 **PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED** on April 28, 2010, by the following vote of
147 the Calistoga Planning Commission:
148

149 AYES:
150 ABSENT:
151 ABSTAIN:

152
153 _____
154 Jeff Manfredi, Chairman
155

156 ATTEST: _____
157 Kathleen Guill
158 Secretary to the Planning Commission