



City of Calistoga Planning Commission Agenda Item Summary

DATE February 27, 2008

APPLICATION NO. Conditional Use Permit (U 2008-01) and Design Review (DR 2008-02)

OWNER/APPLICANT City of Calistoga

REQUESTED ACTION

Consideration of Conditional Use Permit and Design Review applications to allow seismic retrofitting, renovation and expansion of Calistoga Fire Station No. 1 located at 1113 Washington Street (APN 011-231-003) within the "DC-DD", Downtown Commercial-Design District zoning district. The property owner is the City of Calistoga. The proposed project is exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) under Section 15301 (Class 1 - Existing Facilities) of the CEQA Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- A. Staff recommends the filing of a Notice of Exemption for the Project pursuant to Section 15301 of the CEQA Guidelines.
- B. Staff recommends adoption of a Resolution approving Conditional Use Permit (U 2008-01) and Design Review (DR 2008-02) to allow seismic retrofitting, renovation and expansion of Calistoga Fire Station No. 1 located at 1113 Washington Street (APN 011-231-003) within the "DC-DD", Downtown Commercial-Design District zoning district, subject to conditions of approval.

SUGGESTED MOTIONS

Categorical Exemption

I move that the Planning Commission direct Staff to file a Notice of Exemption for the Project pursuant to Section 15301 of the CEQA.

Conditional Use Permit and Design Review

I move that the Planning Commission adopt Resolution PC 2008-05 approving Conditional Use Permit (U 2008-01) and Design Review (DR 2008-02) to allow seismic retrofitting, renovation and expansion of Calistoga Fire Station No. 1 located at 1113 Washington Street (APN 011-231-003) within the "DC-DD", Downtown Commercial-Design District zoning district, based upon the Findings presented in the staff report and subject to conditions of approval.

CITY OF CALISTOGA

STAFF REPORT

TO: CHAIRMAN MANFREDI AND MEMBERS OF THE
PLANNING COMMISSION

FROM: KEN MACNAB, SENIOR PLANNER

MEETING DATE: FEBRUARY 27, 2008

SUBJECT: CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT (U 2008-01) AND DESIGN
REVIEW (DR 2008-02) FOR SEISMIC RETROFIT,
RENOVATION AND EXPANSION OF CALISTOGA FIRE
STATION No. 1 LOCATED AT 1113 WASHINGTON
STREET (APN 011-232-003)

1 **REQUEST**

2
3 Consideration of Conditional Use Permit and Design Review applications to allow
4 seismic retrofitting, renovation and expansion of Calistoga Fire Station No. 1
5 located at 1113 Washington Street (APN 011-231-003) within the "DC-DD",
6 Downtown Commercial-Design District zoning district. The property owner is the
7 City of Calistoga. The proposed project is exempt from the California
8 Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) under Section 15301 (Class 1 - Existing
9 Facilities) of the CEQA Guidelines.

10
11 **BACKGROUND**

12
13 Calistoga Fire Station No. 1 is a 6,100 square foot, single-story structure built in
14 1969. It houses five major pieces of equipment used to provide fire prevention,
15 protection and emergency response services for all residents and businesses
16 within the City's 52 square mile service area. The station also houses Kortum
17 Hall, which was built as an addition to the original station house in 1970 by the
18 Firefighters Association. Kortum Hall is currently being used as a dayroom and
19 classroom for firefighters and as a meeting room.

20
21 In February, 1998 a study of the Fire Station's earthquake resistance was
22 prepared by Summit Engineering. The study indicated that in the event of an
23 earthquake the fire station would sustain significant damage and may not be
24 functional after such a natural disaster. The City began the process of defining
25 the renovation approach and developing a funding plan. Since the study there
26 has been building code changes that require additional improvements beyond
27 what was contemplated in the Summit Engineering report. Other improvements

28 identified as being needed include: ADA accessibility improvements, a biohazard
29 decontamination area, a laundry area for firefighters turn-out gear, shower and
30 locker facilities, a bunkroom, administrative office space and equipment storage
31 areas.

32

33 In November, 2002 the City contracted with C3 Design Alliance for architectural
34 services related to renovation of Calistoga Fire Station No. 1. C3 Design Alliance
35 reviewed existing facilities and operations and analyzed space and configuration
36 requirements. A final "Project Program" report and schematic design was
37 provided by C3 Design Alliance in July, 2003.

38

39 In February, 2005 the City applied for a Pre-Disaster Mitigation (PDM) Grant from
40 the Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) to fund the seismic
41 retrofitting and renovation of Fire Station No. 1. In August, 2007 the City
42 received a letter stating that the grant application had been awarded.

43

44 In November, 2007, the City contracted with C3 Design Alliance to prepare final
45 design and improvement plans for retrofitting, renovation and expansion of Fire
46 Station No. 1.

47

48 PROPOSAL

49

50 The City of Calistoga proposes to renovate and expand the existing 6,100 square
51 foot Fire Station to address functional and health and safety needs. The
52 proposed project involves reconfiguration and remodeling of interior spaces,
53 expansion of the Kortum Hall area, addition of a new front lobby area,
54 architectural enhancements, and improvements addressing seismic conditions,
55 building accessibility and energy efficiency.

56

57 Interior modifications comprise the majority of work and are being proposed
58 throughout the building. In the northern (front) section of the building the
59 apparatus bays will be reconfigured to allow for the creation of administrative
60 offices and a work area. In conjunction with this space, a new 415 square foot
61 lobby area and public entrance will be constructed near the corner of Washington
62 Street and Gerard Street. The new lobby area will feature a windowed display
63 area for "Old Betsy", the City's historic firefighting engine from 1924. The central
64 portion of the building will be reconfigured to accommodate a new shop and
65 laundry area, a medical cleaning and storage area, and an exercise and fitness
66 area. The southern portion of the building (Kortum Hall area) will be expanded
67 by approximately 750 square feet. The expansion will accommodate a
68 reconfiguration of the multi-purpose room, kitchen and locker/bunk areas. The
69 locker and bunk areas ("living quarters") are designed to be closed-off from the
70 multi-purpose room to allow for public use/events in the multi-purpose room. A
71 "firefighter only" entrance will be provided at the existing entrance on the west

72 side of the building. The current entrance into Kortum Hall would be relocated to
 73 the rear of the building where it will be more visible and accessible from the
 74 adjacent public parking lot. The Kortum Hall expansion also includes new public
 75 restrooms that will be accessible from the exterior of the building, an enclosed
 76 area for the emergency generator, and an outdoor storage area.

77
 78
 79

SUMMARY OF LAND USE REGULATIONS

<i>Applicable Regulations – 1113 Washington Street</i>			
Development Criteria	Requirements	Proposed	Required Actions
General Plan Designation	Downtown Commercial; Uses allowed generally include stores, retail facilities, offices, restaurants, bars and visitor accommodations. Medium to High density housing, including live-work are also permitted.	Use of Same Designation	None
Policy P1, Goal SER-1, Public Services Element	The City shall maintain and improve the Fire Station at its current location.	Improvement of Fire Station at its current location.	None
Zoning	Downtown Commercial Design District Zoning Overlay	Use of Same Designation Use of Same Designation	None
Uses Permitted w/ Use Permit	Resident-serving retail and service uses	Expansion of Fire Station and emergency services facility serving city residents and businesses	PC Findings for Use Permit and Design Review Approval
Minimum Lot Area	5,000 square feet	38,000 square feet	None
Maximum Lot Coverage	Maximum 80%	20%	None
Height	Maximum 30'	One Story Structure	None
Minimum Setbacks – Main Building	Front: 0' Side Yard, Interior: 0' Side Yard, Street: 0' Rear: 0'	Proposed additions meet yard setback requirements.	None
- Stream / Creek	35' from top-of-bank	Existing parking lot encroaches into required stream setback area. No changes proposed.	None

Parking	General Office – 1 space per 250 square feet	1,650 square feet Required: 7 Proposed: 7	None. Parking for public use of the Kortum Hall multi-purpose room will be accommodated in the City-owned public parking lot at rear of Station.
	Places of Assembly (open seating) – 1 space per 35 square feet of largest assembly area (multi-purpose room)	896 square feet Required: 26 Proposed: 26	
Open Space	Minimum 40%	34% - Non-Conforming	None
Floor Area Ratio	Maximum of 200%	20%	None

80

81

82 **STAFF ANALYSIS**

83

84 **A. Land Use**

85

86 The subject property has a General Plan land use designation of Downtown
 87 Commercial and is located within the Downtown Commercial-Design District
 88 Overlay (DC-DD) zoning district. The DC-DD zoning district implements the
 89 Downtown Commercial General Plan land use designation. Policy P1 under
 90 Goal 1 of the Public Services Element of the General Plan requires that the City
 91 maintain and improve the Fire Station at its current location. The proposed
 92 project is consistent with this policy.

93

94 Sections 17.06.020(A)(10), 17.22.040(B)(11) and 17.28.020(B)(1) of the Zoning
 95 Code require Design Review and Use Permit approval by the Planning
 96 Commission for additions to existing structures that result in an increase in floor
 97 area of 10% or more. The proposed project will add approximately 1,500 square
 98 feet to the existing 6,100 square foot building, an increase of approximately 25%.
 99 The Planning Commission must make specific findings regarding project
 100 compliance when approving applications for Use Permit and Design Review
 101 approval. Compliance with the required findings is discussed later in this staff
 102 report.

103

104 **B. Stream / Creek Setback Requirement**

105

106 The Napa River is located adjacent to the southern property line of the subject
 107 site. Section 19.08.070(B)(1) of the City's Conservation Regulations requires
 108 that new development be setback a minimum of 35 feet from the top-of-bank of
 109 the Napa River. The proposed expansion of the existing Fire Station will not
 110 encroach into the required 35-foot setback area.

111

112 It should be noted that a portion of the existing public parking lot behind the Fire
113 Station does encroach into the required 35-foot stream setback area. However,
114 the proposed project will not modify or alter this condition in any way nor will it
115 result in any new intrusions into the required setback area.

116

117 **C. Parking and Circulation**

118

119 A total of thirty-three parking spaces are required pursuant to Section 17.36.140
120 of the Calistoga Municipal Code (see detail in table above). Seven of the thirty-
121 three spaces will be located along Gerard Street on the eastern side of the
122 station (two of these spaces will be designated for use by the disabled). A new
123 walkway will be constructed between the Fire Station and the Gerard Street
124 parking spaces. To accommodate construction of the walkway the existing
125 angled parking spaces will be shifted eastward, reducing the width of the one-
126 way vehicle travel lane on Gerard Street. The reduced travel lane will retain a
127 sufficient width for safe vehicle operation and backing maneuvers.

128

129 Parking for public use of the multi-purpose room (Kortum Hall) will be
130 accommodated via the existing spaces in the public parking lot located behind
131 the Fire Station. The proposed expansion of Station to the south will require
132 shifting the parking aisle to the south. At least three (and possibly four) existing
133 parking spaces will need to be removed in order to accommodate the relocated
134 parking aisle. Furthermore, the proposed aisle has been designed to a minimum
135 width (18 feet) to preserve a mature tree located approximately 20 feet south of
136 the Station.

137

138 **D. Open Space**

139

140 Section 17.22.080(D) of the Zoning Code requires that 40% of the area not
141 occupied by structures on a lot be landscaped. While the proposed project will
142 increase the amount of landscaped area on the site through the provision of new
143 planters, landscaping, seating areas and walks, the site will remain non-
144 conforming with respect to the landscaping standard. Constraints to achieving
145 compliance with the standard include: the need for an oversized driveway apron
146 and wash area to accommodate maneuvering and cleaning of emergency
147 apparatus, the presence and close proximity of vehicle accessways on both
148 sides of the existing building, and the presence of an existing public parking lot
149 immediately to the rear of the building.

150

151 **E. Design**

152

153 Enhancements to the façade of the existing building are being proposed as part
154 of the proposed project. Architectural additions to the fire station will complement
155 and enhance the existing look of the rough, slump block walls with the application

156 of a smooth stucco finish to new exterior walls. The proposed lobby addition on
157 the Washington Street side of the building utilizes clean, sharp lines with full
158 height windows. Trellises, wooden supports, shed roof elements and awnings
159 are proposed around the perimeter of the building to serve as unifying elements
160 between the existing and new portions of the building. Similar roof and awning
161 pitches and materials will also be used to further tie architectural elements of the
162 building together. A model and materials board will be provided at the meeting
163 for the Commission's review.

164

165 **F. Growth Management**

166

167 Section 19.02.050(H) of the Calistoga Municipal Code exempts public facilities
168 sponsored by the City of Calistoga from the City's Growth Management program.

169

170 **FINDINGS**

171

172 In addition to the above discussion, the analysis of this project includes reference
173 to the Findings for Use Permit Approval (CMC 17.40.070) and Design Review
174 Approval (CMC 17.06.040). These are discussed generally as follows:

175

176 **Findings for Use Permit Approval (CMC 17.40.070):**

177

178 1. The proposed development, together with any provisions for its design
179 and improvement, is consistent with the General Plan, any applicable
180 specific plan and other applicable provisions of the Zoning Code including
181 the finding that the use as proposed is consistent with the historic, rural,
182 small-town atmosphere of Calistoga.

183

184 Response: The proposed renovation and expansion is consistent with
185 and implements Policy P1 under Goal 1 of the Public Services Element of
186 the General Plan. The nature and extent of the proposed improvements
187 are consistent with the historic, rural, small-town atmosphere of Calistoga.
188 Architectural enhancements proposed as part of the project draw from
189 nearby architectural styles and will improve the appearance and quality of
190 the existing building.

191

192 2. The site is physically suitable for the type and density of development.

193

194 Response: The central location of the subject site is advantageous for
195 responding to emergencies within the City. The proposed renovation and
196 expansion is well within the allowable site coverage and FAR. Adequate
197 off-street parking and public services exist to serve the site.

198

- 199 3. The proposed development has been reviewed in compliance with the
200 California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the project will not result
201 in detrimental or adverse impacts upon the public resources, wildlife or
202 public health, safety and welfare.
203
204 Response: This project is exempt from CEQA under Section 15301
205 (Class 1 – Existing Facilities).
206
- 207 4. Approval of the use permit application will not cause adverse impacts to
208 maintaining an adequate supply of public water and an adequate capacity
209 at the wastewater treatment facility.
210
211 Response: The City's water system and wastewater treatment facility is
212 adequate to serve this project.
213
- 214 5. Approval of the use permit application shall not cause the extension of
215 service mains greater than 500 feet.
216
217 Response: Approval of this use permit application shall not cause the
218 extension of service mains greater than 500 feet.
219
- 220 6. An allocation for water and/or wastewater service pursuant to Chapter
221 13.16 CMC (Resource Management System) shall be made prior to
222 project approval. Said allocation shall be valid for one year and shall not
223 be subject to renewal.
224
225 Response: The current allocation for water and wastewater is sufficient to
226 accommodate the proposed renovation and expansion.
227
- 228 7. The proposed development presents a scale and design which are in
229 harmony with the historical and small-town character of Calistoga.
230
231 Response: The design of proposed project is in harmony with the historic
232 and small-town character of Calistoga. The scale and height of the
233 existing structure will not significantly change as a result of the proposed
234 improvements. The addition of a new lobby area will add building mass
235 along the Washington Street frontage. However, the addition is of a low
236 scale and height and its perceived mass will be minimized by the full
237 height window walls which provide a transparent element to the addition.
238 New design features will update the look of the existing building and
239 compliment area architecture (see response under No. 9 below).
240
- 241 8. The proposed development is consistent with and will enhance Calistoga's
242 history of independent, unique, and single location businesses, thus

243 contributing to the uniqueness of the town, which is necessary to maintain
244 a viable visitor industry in Calistoga and to preserve its economy.

245
246 Response: The proposed improvements retain and enhance the unique
247 characteristics of the downtown area. The lobby display of "Old Betsy" will
248 provide residents and visitors with an opportunity to appreciate the history
249 of firefighting in Calistoga.

250
251 9. The proposed development complements and enhances the architectural
252 integrity and eclectic combination of architectural styles of Calistoga.

253
254 Response: Application of a smooth stucco finish to new exterior walls will
255 update the existing look of the rough, slump block walls while keeping in
256 character with surrounding architecture. Other design features include the
257 area trellises, wooden supports, shed roof elements and awnings. Similar
258 roof and awning pitches and materials will also be used to further tie
259 architectural elements of the building in with area architecture.
260 Collectively, these design features will enhance the architectural integrity
261 of the building and compliment the eclectic mix of architectural styles
262 found in Calistoga.

263
264 **Design Review Guidelines (CMC 17.06.040):**

265
266 1. The design shall be compatible with the existing development pattern with
267 regard to massing, scale, setbacks, color, textures, materials, etc.

268
269 Response: There is a mixture of building styles along this area of the City.
270 The proposed design enhances the existing design by incorporating
271 various elements of area architecture, including stucco finishes, trellises,
272 awnings, shed roof elements and roof pitch. Incorporation of these
273 features enhances the look of the existing building and will complement
274 existing development in the City.

275
276 See previous comments on scale and mass under Use Permit Finding No.
277 7.

278
279 2. The design shall result in an appropriate site layout, orientation, and
280 location of structures, relationship to one another, open spaces and
281 topography.

282
283 Response: The proposed design retains the current site layout and will
284 not significantly change the relationship of the structure to other existing
285 structures, open spaces or topography.

286

287 The proposed design will improve the orientation of the public entrances to
288 both the Fire Station and the Kortum Hall multi-purpose room. A public
289 entry located close to Washington Street will be provided in the new lobby
290 addition. The Kortum Hall entrance will be relocated to the rear of the
291 building where it will be more visible and easily accessed from the
292 adjacent public parking lot.

293
294 3. The design shall provide a harmonious relationship of character and scale
295 with existing and proposed adjoining development, achieving
296 complementary style, while avoiding both excessive variety and
297 monotonous repetition.

298
299 Response: See previous comments under Use Permit Findings Nos., 7, 8
300 and 9.

301
302 4. The building design, materials, colors and textures shall be compatible
303 and appropriate to Calistoga, and the architectural design or structures
304 and their materials and colors shall be appropriate to the function of the
305 project.

306
307 Response: Architectural additions to the Fire Station will complement the
308 existing look of the rough, slump block walls with the application of a
309 smooth stucco finish to new exterior walls. This application draws upon
310 area architecture and will serve to update the look of the existing building.

311
312 The proposed lobby addition on the Washington Street side of the building
313 utilizes clean, sharp lines with full height windows. The full height windows
314 add transparency that will minimize mass and allow for public viewing of
315 "Old Betsy."

316
317 Trellises, wooden supports, shed roof elements and awnings are
318 proposed around the perimeter of the building to serve as unifying
319 elements between the existing and new portions of the building. Similar
320 roof and awning pitches and materials will also be used to further tie
321 architectural elements of the building together.

322
323 The proposed improvements are consistent with this guideline, which
324 requires exterior colors and materials that blend with the desired character
325 for the downtown and are indicators of the function of the structure.

326
327 5. The design shall provide for harmony of materials, colors, and composition
328 of those sides of a structure, which are visible simultaneously.

329

330 Response: The proposed design retains the base materials and colors
331 and proposes several architectural embellishments around the perimeter
332 of the building (including trellises, wooden supports, shed roof elements
333 and awnings) that will serve as unifying elements for the old and new
334 portions of the building that are simultaneously visible.

335
336 6. The design shall provide consistency of composition and treatment.

337
338 Response: The building profile is simple, which is compatible with the
339 character of the area.

340
341 7. The design shall consider the location and type of planting with regard to
342 valley conditions, including the preservation of specimen and landmark
343 trees upon a site with proper irrigation to insure water conservation and
344 maintenance of all plant materials.

345
346 Response: The area of landscaping shown on the site plan will not impact
347 surrounding properties in the valley floor and will be properly irrigated to
348 maintain the condition of existing and newly planted materials.

349
350 8. The exterior lighting, design, signs and graphics shall be compatible with
351 the overall design approach and appropriate for the setting.

352
353 Response: The proposal does not intend to substantially alter the existing
354 exterior lighting. There will be new lighting fixed to the building at various
355 spots, but no new detached site lights. Proposed signage is minimal and
356 is appropriate for the facility.

357
358 9. The design shall provide for improvement of existing site conditions,
359 including but not limited to signage, landscaping, lighting, etc., to achieve
360 closer compliance with current standards.

361
362 Response: The proposed design will improve existing site conditions by:
363 (1) improving sidewalk and walkway areas, (2) providing identifiable public
364 entrances into the building, (3) adding new landscape areas, (4) creating a
365 public display area that can be enjoyed from the public right-of-way, (5)
366 installation of ADA accessible public restrooms that can be accessed from
367 outside of the building, and (6) updating the appearance of the 1960's-era
368 building.

369
370 10. The design promotes a high design standard and utilizes quality materials
371 compatible with the surrounding development consistent with and
372 appropriate for the nature of the proposed use.

373

374 Response: As described in the above findings, the proposed design
375 features and materials are compatible with development in the
376 surrounding area, will enhance the architectural integrity of the existing
377 building, and will compliment the eclectic mix of architectural styles found
378 in Calistoga. The reconfiguration of interior spaces and proposed
379 additions are appropriate for the nature of the proposed use in that they
380 will improve the function of the building for activities related to fire fighting
381 and the provision of emergency services and will also accommodate
382 shared (public) use of meeting space.
383

384 11. The design presents a responsible use of natural and reclaimed
385 resources.
386

387 Response: The proposed renovation and expansion provides an
388 opportunity to utilize a number of sustainable design practices. Listed
389 below are some available options for implementation throughout the
390 design and construction process:
391

- 392 • Reuse of existing building to extent possible
- 393 • New lighter roof over existing station acts to avoid heat island effect
394 and will keep building cooler
- 395 • New windows/skylights provide more natural lighting in interior of
396 building
- 397 • Provision of pedestrian and bicycle amenities will
398 encourage/facilitate non-automobile travel modes
- 399 • Construction waste management procedures to encourage landfill
400 diversion
- 401 • Use of low-emitting materials for higher indoor air quality
- 402 • Use of new building materials with high recycled content

403

404 ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

405

406 Under the provisions of Section 15301, Existing Facilities, of the State Guidelines
407 for Implementation of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) as stated
408 below, this project is found to be exempt from the environmental review
409 requirements of Chapter 19.10 of the Calistoga Municipal Code, implementing
410 the California Environmental Quality Act of 1970, as amended in that; 1) the
411 project involves alteration and expansion of an existing public facility, 2) additions
412 to the existing facility will not result in an increase of more than 10,000 square
413 feet, 3) the project site is in an area where all public services and facilities are
414 available to allow for maximum development permissible in the General Plan,
415 and 4) the area in which the project is located is not environmentally sensitive.
416

417 **RECOMMENDATIONS**

418

419 A. Based on the above findings, staff recommends the filing of a Notice of
420 Exemption for the Project pursuant to Section 15301 of the CEQA
421 Guidelines.

422

423 B. Based on the above findings, staff recommends adoption of a Resolution
424 approving Conditional Use Permit (U 2008-01) and Design Review (DR
425 2008-02) to allow seismic retrofitting, renovation and expansion of
426 Calistoga Fire Station No. 1 located at 1113 Washington Street (APN 011-
427 231-003) within the "DC-DD", Downtown Commercial-Design District
428 zoning district, subject to conditions of approval.

429

430 **SUGGESTED MOTIONS**

431

432 **Categorical Exemption**

433

434 I move that the Planning Commission direct Staff to file a Notice of Exemption for
435 the Project pursuant to Section 15301 of the CEQA.

436

437 **Conditional Use Permit and Design Review**

438

439 I move that the Planning Commission adopt Resolution PC 2008-05 approving
440 Conditional Use Permit (U 2008-01) and Design Review (DR 2008-02) to allow
441 seismic retrofitting, renovation and expansion of Calistoga Fire Station No. 1
442 located at 1113 Washington Street (APN 011-231-003) within the "DC-DD",
443 Downtown Commercial-Design District zoning district, based upon the Findings
444 presented in the staff report and subject to conditions of approval.

445

446 **NOTE:** The applicant or any interested person is reminded that the Calistoga
447 Municipal Code provides for a ten (10) calendar day appeal period. If there is a
448 disagreement with the Planning Commission, an appeal to the City Council may be
449 filed. The appropriate forms and applicable fee must be submitted prior to 5:00
450 p.m. on or before the tenth calendar day following the Commission's final
451 determination.

452

453 **ATTACHMENTS:**

454

- 455 1. Draft Conditional Use Permit and Design Review Resolution PC 2008-05
456 2. Site Plan and Building Elevations

**CITY OF CALISTOGA
PLANNING COMMISSION
RESOLUTION PC 2008-05**

A RESOLUTION RECOMMENDING THAT THE CITY COUNCIL APPROVE CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT (U 2008-01) AND DESIGN REVIEW (DR 2008-02) ALLOWING SEISMIC RETROFITTING, RENOVATION AND EXPANSION OF CALISTOGA FIRE STATION NO. 1 LOCATED AT 1113 WASHINGTON STREET (APN 011-231-003) WITHIN THE "DC-DD", DOWNTOWN COMMERCIAL-DESIGN DISTRICT ZONING DISTRICT

1 **WHEREAS**, the City has determined the need for seismic retrofitting, renovation
2 and expansion of Fire Station No. 1; and
3

4 **WHEREAS**, the City has been awarded grant funding under the 2006 Federal
5 Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) Pre-Disaster Mitigation Grant Program for the
6 seismic retrofitting of Fire Station No. 1; and
7

8 **WHEREAS**, the City has committed to provide funding support for this project;
9 and
10

11 **WHEREAS**, the City has retained the services of C3 Design Alliance to prepare
12 final design and improvement plans for retrofitting, renovation and expansion of Fire
13 Station No. 1; and
14

15 **WHEREAS**, seismic retrofitting, renovation and expansion of Fire Station No. 1 in
16 its current location is consistent with and implements Policy P1 under Goal 1 of the
17 Public Services Element of the General Plan; and
18

19 **WHEREAS**, the Planning Commission considered this Conditional Use Permit
20 and Design Review request at a regular meeting held on February 27, 2008 and at a
21 special meeting held on March 5, 2008. Prior to taking action on the application, the
22 Planning Commission received written and oral reports by the staff, the project
23 consultant, and received public testimony; and
24

25 **WHEREAS**, this action has been reviewed for compliance with the California
26 Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and is exempt from the requirements of the CEQA
27 pursuant to Section 15301 of the CEQA guidelines; and
28

29 **WHEREAS**, the Planning Commission pursuant to Chapter 17.40.070 has made
30 the following Conditional Use Permit findings for the project:
31

- 32 1. The proposed development, together with any provisions for its design and
33 improvement, is consistent with the General Plan, any applicable specific plan
34 and other applicable provisions of the Zoning Code including the finding that the
35 use as proposed is consistent with the historic, rural, small-town atmosphere of
36 Calistoga.
37

38 **Response:** The proposed renovation and expansion is consistent with and
39 implements Policy P1 under Goal 1 of the Public Services Element of the
40 General Plan. The nature and extent of the proposed improvements are
41 consistent with the historic, rural, small-town atmosphere of Calistoga.
42 Architectural enhancements proposed as part of the project draw from nearby

43 architectural styles and will improve the appearance and quality of the existing
44 building.

45
46 2. The site is physically suitable for the type and density of development.
47

48 Response: The central location of the subject site is advantageous for
49 responding to emergencies within the City. The proposed renovation and
50 expansion is well within the allowable site coverage and FAR. Adequate off-
51 street parking and public services exist to serve the site.
52

53 3. The proposed development has been reviewed in compliance with the California
54 Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and the project will not result in detrimental or
55 adverse impacts upon the public resources, wildlife or public health, safety and
56 welfare.
57

58 Response: This project is exempt from CEQA under Section 15301 (Class 1 –
59 Existing Facilities).
60

61 4. Approval of the use permit application will not cause adverse impacts to
62 maintaining an adequate supply of public water and an adequate capacity at the
63 wastewater treatment facility.
64

65 Response: The City's water system and wastewater treatment facility is
66 adequate to serve this project.
67

68 5. Approval of the use permit application shall not cause the extension of service
69 mains greater than 500 feet.
70

71 Response: Approval of this use permit application shall not cause the extension
72 of service mains greater than 500 feet.
73

74 6. An allocation for water and/or wastewater service pursuant to Chapter 13.16
75 CMC (Resource Management System) shall be made prior to project approval.
76 Said allocation shall be valid for one year and shall not be subject to renewal.
77

78 Response: The current allocation for water and wastewater is sufficient to
79 accommodate the proposed renovation and expansion.
80

81 7. The proposed development presents a scale and design which are in harmony
82 with the historical and small-town character of Calistoga.
83

84 Response: The design of proposed project is in harmony with the historic and
85 small-town character of Calistoga. The scale and height of the existing structure
86 will not significantly change as a result of the proposed improvements. The
87 addition of a new lobby area will add building mass along the Washington Street
88 frontage. However, the addition is of a low scale and height and its perceived
89 mass will be minimized by the full height window walls which provide a
90 transparent element to the addition. New design features will update the look of

91 the existing building and compliment area architecture (see response under No.
92 9 below).

93
94
95 8. The proposed development is consistent with and will enhance Calistoga's
96 history of independent, unique, and single location businesses, thus contributing
97 to the uniqueness of the town, which is necessary to maintain a viable visitor
98 industry in Calistoga and to preserve its economy.

99
100 Response: The proposed improvements retain and enhance the unique
101 characteristics of the downtown area. The lobby display of "Old Betsy" will
102 provide residents and visitors with an opportunity to appreciate the history of
103 firefighting in Calistoga.

104
105 9. The proposed development complements and enhances the architectural
106 integrity and eclectic combination of architectural styles of Calistoga.

107
108 Response: Application of a smooth stucco finish to new exterior walls will update
109 the existing look of the rough, slump block walls while keeping in character with
110 surrounding architecture. Other design features include the area trellises,
111 wooden supports, shed roof elements and awnings. Similar roof and awning
112 pitches and materials will also be used to further tie architectural elements of the
113 building in with area architecture. Collectively, these design features will
114 enhance the architectural integrity of the building and compliment the eclectic mix
115 of architectural styles found in Calistoga.

116
117 **WHEREAS**, the Planning Commission pursuant to Chapter 17.06.040 has made the
118 following Design Review findings for the project:

119
120 1. The design shall be compatible with the existing development pattern with regard to
121 massing, scale, setbacks, color, textures, materials, etc.

122
123 Response: There is a mixture of building styles along this area of the City. The
124 proposed design enhances the existing design by incorporating various elements of
125 area architecture, including stucco finishes, trellises, awnings, shed roof elements
126 and roof pitch. Incorporation of these features enhances the look of the existing
127 building and will complement existing development in the City.

128
129 See previous comments on scale and mass under Use Permit Finding No. 7.

130
131 2. The design shall result in an appropriate site layout, orientation, and location of
132 structures, relationship to one another, open spaces and topography.

133
134 Response: The proposed design retains the current site layout and will not
135 significantly change the relationship of the structure in the larger context of other
136 existing structures, open spaces or topography.

137

138 The proposed design will improve the orientation of the public entrances to both the
139 Fire Station and the Kortum Hall multi-purpose room. A public entry located close to
140 Washington Street will be provided in the new lobby addition. The Kortum Hall
141 entrance will be relocated to the rear of the building where it will be more visible and
142 easily accessed from the adjacent public parking lot.

143
144 3. The design shall provide a harmonious relationship of character and scale with
145 existing and proposed adjoining development, achieving complementary style, while
146 avoiding both excessive variety and monotonous repetition.

147
148 Response: See previous comments under Use Permit Findings Nos., 7, 8 and 9.

149
150 4. The building design, materials, colors and textures shall be compatible and
151 appropriate to Calistoga, and the architectural design or structures and their
152 materials and colors shall be appropriate to the function of the project.

153
154 Response: Architectural additions to the Fire Station will complement the existing
155 look of the rough, slump block walls with the application of a smooth stucco finish to
156 new exterior walls. This application draws upon area architecture and will serve to
157 update the look of the existing building.

158
159 The proposed lobby addition on the Washington Street side of the building utilizes
160 clean, sharp lines with full height windows. The full height windows add transparency
161 that will minimize mass and allow for public viewing of "Old Betsy."

162
163 Trellises, wooden supports, shed roof elements and awnings are proposed around
164 the perimeter of the building to serve as unifying elements between the existing and
165 new portions of the building. Similar roof and awning pitches and materials will also
166 be used to further tie architectural elements of the building together.

167
168 The proposed improvements are consistent with this guideline, which requires
169 exterior colors and materials that blend with the desired character for the downtown
170 and are indicators of the function of the structure.

171
172 5. The design shall provide for harmony of materials, colors, and composition of those
173 sides of a structure, which are visible simultaneously.

174
175 Response: The proposed design retains the base materials and colors and proposes
176 several architectural embellishments around the perimeter of the building (including
177 trellises, wooden supports, shed roof elements and awnings) that will serve as
178 unifying elements for the old and new portions of the building that are simultaneously
179 visible.

180
181 6. The design shall provide consistency of composition and treatment.

182
183 Response: The building profile is simple, which is compatible with the character of
184 the area.

185
186 7. The design shall consider the location and type of planting with regard to valley
187 conditions, including the preservation of specimen and landmark trees upon a site

188 with proper irrigation to insure water conservation and maintenance of all plant
189 materials.

190
191 Response: The area of landscaping shown on the site plan will not impact
192 surrounding properties in the valley floor and will be properly irrigated to maintain the
193 condition of existing and newly planted materials.

194
195 8. The exterior lighting, design, signs and graphics shall be compatible with the overall
196 design approach and appropriate for the setting.

197
198 Response: The proposal does not intend to substantially alter the existing exterior
199 lighting. There will be new lighting fixed to the building at various spots, but no new
200 detached site lights. Proposed signage is minimal and is appropriate for the facility.

201
202 9. The design shall provide for improvement of existing site conditions, including but not
203 limited to signage, landscaping, lighting, etc., to achieve closer compliance with
204 current standards.

205
206 Response: The proposed design will improve existing site conditions by: (1)
207 improving sidewalk and walkway areas, (2) providing identifiable public entrances
208 into the building, (3) adding new landscape areas, (4) creating a public display area
209 that can be enjoyed from the public right-of-way, (5) installation of ADA accessible
210 public restrooms that can be accessed from outside of the building, and (6) updating
211 the appearance of the 1960's-era building.

212
213 10. The design promotes a high design standard and utilizes quality materials
214 compatible with the surrounding development consistent with and appropriate for the
215 nature of the proposed use.

216
217 Response: As described in the above findings, the proposed design features and
218 materials are compatible with development in the surrounding area, will enhance the
219 architectural integrity of the existing building, and will compliment the eclectic mix of
220 architectural styles found in Calistoga. The reconfiguration of interior spaces and
221 proposed additions are appropriate for the nature of the proposed use in that they
222 will improve the function of the building for activities related to fire fighting and the
223 provision of emergency services and will also accommodate shared (public) use of
224 meeting space.

225
226 11. The design presents a responsible use of natural and reclaimed resources.

227
228 Response: The proposed renovation and expansion provides an opportunity to
229 utilize a number of sustainable design practices. Listed below are some available
230 options for implementation throughout the design and construction process:

- 231
232
 - Reuse of existing building to extent possible
 - New lighter roof over existing station acts to avoid heat island effect and will keep building cooler
 - New windows/skylights provide more natural lighting in interior of building
 - Provision of pedestrian and bicycle amenities will encourage/facilitate non-automobile travel modes

233
234
235
236
237

- 238 • Construction waste management procedures to encourage landfill diversion
- 239 • Use of low-emitting materials for higher indoor air quality
- 240 • Use of new building materials with high recycled content
- 241
- 242

243 **NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED** by the City of Calistoga Planning
244 Commission that based on the above Findings, the Planning Commission recommends to
245 the City Council approval of the proposed project, subject to the following Conditions of
246 Approval:

- 247
- 248 1. This use permit allows for renovation and expansion of the existing 6,100 square foot
249 Fire Station to address functional and health and safety needs. Approved
250 improvements include reconfiguration and remodeling of interior spaces, addition of
251 1,500 square feet for a new front lobby area and expansion of the Kortum Hall multi-
252 purpose room, architectural enhancements, and improvements addressing seismic
253 conditions, building accessibility and energy efficiency.
- 254
- 255 2. The uses and improvements hereby permitted shall substantially conform to the site
256 plan, floor plan and elevations submitted by C3 Design Alliance dated February 11,
257 2008, except as noted in the permit conditions.
- 258
- 259 3. Minor amendments to this permit may be approved by the Planning and Building
260 Director provided that the permit is still in substantial conformance with the approved
261 uses and improvements.
- 262
- 263 4. Prior to issuance of a building permit for construction, all necessary permits or
264 approvals shall be obtained from the Napa County Department of Environmental
265 Management.
- 266
- 267 5. A building permit shall be required to authorize construction of the project.
- 268
- 269 6. A Drainage and Erosion and Sedimentation Plan shall be provided as part of the
270 submittal materials with the building permit application.
- 271
- 272 7. A Landscape Plan shall be provided as part of the submittal materials with the
273 building permit application. This plan shall identify the location of new plants by
274 species and size, and shall include the method of irrigation.
- 275
- 276 8. All construction and improvements shall be in accordance with zoning, building, and
277 all other codes, ordinances, standards, policies of the City of Calistoga.
- 278
- 279 9. Prior to occupancy, bicycle racks shall be installed near the public entrances into the
280 lobby and into the Kortum Hall multi-purpose room.
- 281

282 **BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED** by the City of Calistoga Planning Commission that in
283 the interest of achieving the highest quality design, the Planning Commission strongly
284 encourages the City Council to incorporate the following changes into the final design of the
285 project:

- 286
- 287 1. Covering the slump block walls on the east and west building facades with a smooth

- 288 stucco finish. At a minimum, lattice with green plantings should be installed to
289 screen and soften the slump block walls.
290
291 2. Installation of larger windows on the western wall of the apparatus bay.
292
293 3. Installation of additional landscaping around the building site.
294
295 4. Installation of landscaping improvements in the public parking lot, including additional
296 planter islands and improving views of the Napa River.
297

298 **PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED** on March 5, 2008, by the following vote of
299 the Calistoga Planning Commission:

300

301

302 AYES:

303

304 NOES:

305

306 ABSENT:

307

308 ABSTAIN:

309

310

Jeff Manfredi, Chairman

311

312

313 ATTEST: _____

314

Kathleen Guill

315

Secretary to the Planning Commission